

STAFF REPORT: 07/10/2024 REGULAR MEETING
APPLICATION NUMBER: HDC2024-00289
VIOLATION NUMBER: 912
ADDRESS: 677 W. CANFIELD
HISTORIC DISTRICT: WEST CANFIELD
APPLICANTS/ PROPERTY OWNER: MATTHEW ALLEN FLESZAR
DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: 06/17/2024
DATES OF STAFF SITE VISITS: 06/26/2024

PREPARED BY: D. RIEDEN

SCOPE: ERECT REAR STAIRWELL ENCLOSURE (WORK COMPLETED WITHOUT APPROVAL)

EXISTING CONDITIONS

Built in 1875, the 2 ½ story home at 677 W. Canfield features a centrally located bay window designed to give the appearance of a turret, true divided light windows with stone sills and headers, stained glass windows, ornate trim and scalloped wood shingle siding. The house is clad in light brown brick with stone detailing and stone cladding around the front façade's foundation. The front entrance is centrally located under the turret and under a roofed porch, which is currently under construction from a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness (COA). The proposed work is located at the rear where ongoing construction of the rear deck and balcony is underway. This work was also previously approved by the Commission but is in violation because the work is not in compliance with the COA. The applicant stated he will address this in a future application. This application's focus is the newly constructed basement access structure and the concrete pad and sidewalks (under construction without approval). This work is not readily visible from the public front view of the house.



Site Photo 1, by Staff June 26, 2024: (North) front elevation showing current conditions.



Site Photo 2, by Applicant June 2024: (South) rear elevation showing current conditions.

This property has the following Certificates of Appropriateness and prior violations on file for this property.

- Nov. 2003 COA: Replace asphalt shingle roof, install skylight, and repair chimney.
- Jul. 2004 COA: Install driveway from the alley, repair walkway, install new fencing.
- Sept. 2017 COA: Repair front porch, install new handrail, repaint. Rebuild rear wood porches to existing footprint, stain dark brown. Install (3) new rear entry doors. Install (2) AC units near rear foundation. Install new gutters and downspouts, painted brown. Tuckpoint masonry.
- Aug. 2020 COA: Repair, replace and restore siding and trim, paint.
- Aug. 2021 COA: Rebuild bay window/turret on front façade with in-kind materials. Install wood, double-hung window to bay.
- June 2024 Violation #912: Constructed rear basement entrance addition, installed concrete walkway and slabs without approval. Constructed rear porch/balconies outside of previously approved footprint.

PROPOSAL

The applicant is reconstructing the rear porch under a previously issued COA. However, the work does not include the expansion the footprint of this rear porch/balcony, nor did it include the construction of a rear enclosed entrance to the basement, nor its surrounding concrete paved areas. This proposal only addresses the rear enclosed basement structure and the concrete paving work at this rear elevation location. The rear porch/balcony work will be addressed in a future application. All of the work in this proposal is underway or nearly complete without approval.

REAR STAIRWELL ENCLOSURE

- Install new footing and 4'5" x 8'9" concrete block foundation to support stairwell enclosure at rear below-grade entrance per attached drawings.
- Erect 4'5" x 8'9" stairwell enclosure per attached drawings with low-sloped, rolled roofing (color brown to match existing roof), metal drip edge and metal gutter, painted black, and install a steel door and Kelly aluminum-clad wood, double-hung window, trim painted black.
- The scalloped siding is painted cedar, HDC Color Guide B:18, dark reddish brown to match siding of the house. The door will be painted B:18 Dark Reddish Brown to match front door color. The wood trim will be painted B:19 Black. The fascia and trim will be painted B:19 black.



Aerial 1 of Parcel # 04000899, by Detroit Parcel Viewer, showing the location of proposed basement entrance structure (arrow).

SITE WORK

- Install 4" gravel base. Install 4" concrete pad and walkway per attached drawings.
- From rear downspouts shown in attached drawings, install French drainage system. Cover with grass sod.



Site Photo 3, from 2020 application, date unknown: (South) rear elevation showing previous conditions of rear deck/balconies and their original footprint locations, which were approved for rebuild within these footprints. Note the scalloped siding in the gable that is reflected in the proposed stairwell enclosure.



Site Photo 4, by Applicant, June 2024: (South) rear elevation location showing locations of work: red and gold boxed areas are included in this proposal, the green box is for a future application.

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- The West Canfield Historic District was established in 1970.
- When staff initially received the application, the photos presented showed limited view of the work being constructed. Staff requested additional photos that work on the rear porch/balcony was being constructed that did not follow a previously issued COA for this work. After discussion with the applicant, the applicant stated that they will address this in a future application along with other work items.
- Staff requested confirmation on the material of the door and window of the rear stair enclosure. The door is steel construction and will be painted to match the front door, a dark brown. The window is an aluminum-clad wood, double-hung window.
- The Elements of Design for the West Canfield HD offer the following insights for this proposal:
 - *Proportion of openings within the façades...* Basement openings are frequently wider than tall, square and/or arched. A great variety of sizes, shapes, and groupings of openings exist in the district in conformity with the historic design and proportion of individual buildings.
 - *Rhythm of entrance and/or porch projections...* Rear and secondary side porches are also common...
 - *Relationship of textures...* Ornamental brickwork and fish-scale wood and slate shingles create textural interest...In general, the buildings in the district have a great variety of textural interest.
 - *Relationship of colors.* Orange-red natural brick contrasts with gray or brick-colored mortar... Wooden trim is painted white, stone gray, gray-blue, brown, green, olive, or black. On the two buildings with shingled second stories, the shingles are stained green or brown...
 - *Relationship of architectural details.* Architectural details are generally related to style...Porches, window surrounds, cornices, verge boards, dormers, and gables are areas frequently treated with wood detailing...All of the buildings that contribute to the historic district are rich in architectural detail.
- At this secondary, rear location, with a non-public view, it is staff's opinion that the proposed rear enclosed stairwell, with matching scalloped, cedar siding, the scale, design, and materiality meets the Standards and the Historic District's Elements of Design and is appropriate.
- It is staff's opinion that the rear site work that includes the concrete pad, sidewalk and french drain installed under sod grass is appropriate.



Site Photo 5, by Applicant, June 2024: (Southwest) rear elevation, showing rear stairwell enclosure, which has not yet been fully painted, and the extent of the proposed concrete paved areas.

ISSUES

- Work in this application was completed without the Commission's approval.
- Staff has no other issues with the proposal.

RECOMMENDATION

Section 21-2-78, Determination of Historic District Commission

Recommendation: Erect Rear Stairwell Enclosure, Install Concrete Pad And Walkway, Install French Drain and Cover with Grass Sod (Work Completed without Approval)

It is staff's opinion that the construction of the rear stairwell enclosure, concrete paving work, and installation of the French drains are appropriate. Staff therefore recommends the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work as proposed because it meets the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and the West Canfield Historic District's Elements of Design.