

STAFF REPORT: FEBRUARY 7, 2024 MEETING

PREPARED BY: B. BUCKLEY

APPLICATION NUMBER: HDC2023-00142

ADDRESS: 19650 CANTERBURY

HISTORIC DISTRICT: SHERWOOD FOREST HD

APPLICANT: JOHN FLOYD

PROPERTY OWNER: JOHN FLOYD

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: NOVEMBER 17, 2023

DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: NOVEMBER 29, 2023 and JANUARY 24, 2024

SCOPE: REPLACE SLATE ROOF WITH ASPHALT SHINGLES (WORK COMPLETED WITHOUT APPROVAL),

EXISTING CONDITIONS

19650 Canterbury is a Tudor revival dwelling constructed in 1931. The brick and stone veneer building features an attached garage, half timbering, and decorative leaded glass windows. The dwelling and garage formerly had a slate roof that was removed in stages and completed in late 2022.



Figure 1: View of 19650 Canterbury, looking northeast.



Figure 2: 2002 designation photograph of 19650 Canterbury showing the original slate roof. HDAB

PROPOSAL

The applicant is seeking approval for work completed without HDC review. The scope of work includes the complete removal of slate roof tiles on the house and garage, and the installation of brown dimensional asphalt shingles.

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- The Sherwood Forest Historic District was established in 2002.
- The removal of the slate roof tiles at the rear and sides of the home was completed ca. 2019, while the slate at the front of the home and garage was removed in 2022.



Figure 2: Image of 19650 Canterbury from 2019, showing the partial replacement of the slate roof at the side elevation. Google Street View

- The applicant provided photographs of plaster and paint damage occurring at the second floor of the home caused by prior leaks from the slate roof.



Figures 3,4: Images provided by the applicant showing paint and plaster damage at the second floor of the home.

- Images of the former slate roof on Google Street View show the slate was experiencing significant deterioration, including large numbers of broken, delaminated, and dislodged tiles, as well as heavy biological growth. The damage is especially prevalent at the courses of tiles directly above the eaves.



Figure 5: Image of 19650 Canterbury from 2022 showing deterioration of the slate roof. Google Street View

ISSUES

- The work was completed without HDC review, and the applicant is unable to provide the usual documentation requested by the Commission for slate roof replacement projects, such as cost estimate comparisons, or detailed photographs illustrating the deterioration of the slate roof.
- According to the National Park Service’s Preservation Brief 29: “The Repair, Replacement and Maintenance of Historic Slate Roofs,” the replacement rather than repair of slate roofs should be considered when more than 20% of the slate is “damaged or missing.” As observed in images from Google Street View, it appears that 20% or more of the slate roof was damaged or dislodged, meriting complete replacement. Assuming that the slate roof was original to the building, it was also likely the slate was reaching the end of its lifespan as an effective roofing material.
- The former slate roof was clearly a character defining feature of the home, and the replacement asphalt shingles do not replicate the aesthetics of the slate roof. However, the complete replacement of a historic slate roof with a new slate roof that adequately matches the characteristics of the original may present questions of economic feasibility in the context of which the standards are to be applied, per 36 CFR 67.7.¹ In this specific case, staff recommends that the replacement of the slate roof with the asphalt shingle roof is an appropriate treatment in the context of the standards.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation – COA – Replace Slate Roof with Asphalt Roof

Staff finds that the proposed replacement of the slate roof with asphalt shingle roofing adheres to the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation when taking into consideration reasonable economic feasibility, and therefore recommends the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work as completed.

¹ Per 36 CFR 67.7, Standards for Rehabilitation, “(b) The following Standards are to be applied to specific rehabilitation projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.”