

STAFF REPORT: 11/8/2023 REGULAR MEETING

PREPARED BY: D. RIEDEN

APPLICATION NUMBER: #HDC2023-00096

ADDRESS: 1465 CHICAGO

HISTORIC DISTRICT: BOSTON-EDISON

APPLICANT/PROPERTY OWNER: MICHAEL EVANS

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: 10/16/2023

DATES OF STAFF SITE VISITS: 10/19/2023

SCOPE: REPLACE ORIGINAL WINDOWS WITH ALUMINUM-CLAD WOOD WINDOWS, TUCKPOINTING, PAINT

EXISTING CONDITIONS

Erected in 1916, the 2 ½ story dwelling at 1465 Chicago features a prominent dormer over a side gable, dark brown brick clad façade. The original 6/1 and 6/6 divided light, double-hung wood windows are placed in pairs or ribbons, with stone sills. Wood casement windows are barely visible next to the front door and the west side of the house. The front porch roof features half-timbering and stucco siding, supported by brick pillars. Stone coping caps the brick wall surrounding the front porch and wingwalls that lead to the steps to the front walkway. A concrete walkway also runs across the front yard to the side concrete driveway along the west side of the property.



Site Photo 1, by Staff October 19, 2023: (North) front elevation of house, showing original wood windows behind storm windows.



Designation photo 1980: (North) front elevation of the house showing 6/1 configuration in the dormer windows. Earlier designation photos are not available.

This property has previous HDC approvals found on record. There are no violations on this property:

- HDC COA, October 1991: Paint house
- HDC COA, November 2003: Install fence.
- HDC COA, May 2004: Replace existing gutters with new gutters to match.
- HDC COA, July 2004: Replace asphalt shingle roof with matching asphalt shingles. Paint fascia.



Aerial1, by Detroit Parcel Viewer of Parcel # 06002546.



Site Photo2, by Staff, October 19, 2023: (East) side elevation of house, showing original wood windows behind storm windows.

PROPOSAL

The proposal consists of the following *(See also submitted materials)*:

REPLACE WOOD WINDOWS WITH ALUMINUM-CLAD WOOD WINDOWS

- Remove existing storm windows, no replacement.
- Replace seventeen (17) original double-hung, 6/6 true divided light wood windows with 17 double-hung aluminum-clad wood windows with 6/1 simulated divided light (SDL) on all sides of the house at first floor levels. Casement windows shall remain.
- These windows would be custom built to match the same size and operation.
- The glass would be replaced with tempered glass.
- The true divided lights (both the 6/1 and 6/6 windows) would be replaced with 6/1 7/8" SDL grille with spacer. The exterior sash color is proposed to be black.
- All windows are supplied by Pella lifestyle series.



Site Photo 3, by Staff, October 19, 2023: (East) side elevation of house, showing original wood windows behind storm windows.

REPAIR: TUCK-POINTING/PAINT

- Tuck-point brick around the house and porch.
- Paint all exterior wood trim with Product Color System E, B:19 Black.

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- The Boston-Edison Historic District was established in 1974.
- It is staff's opinion that the original double-hung wood windows with true divided light are distinctive, character-defining features of the house.
- Staff has not received a full assessment of all the windows and their conditions, nor did staff receive any photographic evidence or statement from an architect/historic window specialist stating that the windows are irreparable. The owner stated that the primary reason for replacement was the cost for repairing existing windows rather than replacement with new windows. Staff did observe that some wood wear on the lower sill area at some locations. However, after review of the images provided by the applicant and site visit with views to the external front and side elevations of the house, staff concluded that the current wood windows appear to be in place and in fair condition and are not in an irreparable condition.
- The proposal's window order shows 17 windows to be replaced, but the images supplied by the applicant show 18 windows to be replaced. Staff requested clarification on the window locations, and their count, but has not yet received this at the time of this report.
- The proposal states all wood windows with 6/1 or 6/6 divided light configuration would be replaced with 6/1 simulated divided light windows. Staff confirmed with the applicant that they would be open to amending the application to match the configuration of the original windows.
- The applicant confirmed that the wood mullions and brick mould would remain.
- The owner confirmed that the wood casement windows, located at the front and side elevations, will remain. However, the owner stated the intention to replace the second-floor original wood windows next year in a future application to match those that are in this application. (See site photo 5)
- Staff observed that the replacement cost for 17 windows, as shown in the window order, is \$46,222.67.
- While the proposed exterior sash color (B:19 Black), is appropriate, staff has the opinion the trim should follow Color Systems D or E of the HDC color guidelines for the remaining trim of the house, where black is not the most appropriate color because the guidelines stipulate a color that contrasts with the body color of the house (dark brick and light stucco). Staff provided the applicant the HDC Color Guidelines, and the applicant stated that they are willing to change the color of the trim to a more appropriate color. Staff has not received the requested paint product information at the time of this report.
- Staff observed that the proposed tuckpointing lacked specific information on mortar type and the process for execution. Staff provided the applicant information to follow NPS Preservation Brief #2, "Repointing Mortar Joints in Historic Masonry Buildings".



Site Photo 4, by Applicant, October 2023: (North) front elevation, first floor, showing original wood 6/1 windows behind storm windows for replacement.



Site Photo 5, by Applicant, October 2023: (North) front elevation, first floor next to front door, showing original wood casement behind storm window to remain.

ISSUES

- It is staff's opinion that the original double-hung wood windows with true divided light are distinctive, character-defining features of the house. However, no documentation establishing that the condition of the original wood windows is beyond repair was submitted which does not meet Secretary of Interior Standards 2 or 6.
- The number of windows in the window order does not match the portrayed number of windows in the photo documentation for the proposed replacement of windows.
- According to the owner, the proposal for replacement of the first-floor windows in this application is meant to be replicated for further replacement of original wood windows on the second floor in a future application. The future replacement of the remaining windows on the second floor would, in staff's opinion, further alter the historic character-defining features of the house.
- Staff has not seen a comparison cost estimate for repair versus replacement of the windows. The owner states that cost was one of the major considerations, but the cost of replacement has not been shown to exceed the cost for the repair for these windows.
- Even though the proposed windows share the same operation, the replacement of wood windows with aluminum-clad wood windows is inappropriate because the original window's condition has not been shown to be irreparable. The replacement of true-divided light with simulated divided light and the change from wood to aluminum-clad wood introduces a material and design that alters the historic character of the property, detracting from historic distinctive character-defining features.
- While staff has no issue with the proposed sash color, B:9 Black, the same color for the remaining house trim should follow the HDC guidelines, particularly Color System D or E, and a more appropriate color should be chosen to contrast the body color.
- The current proposal does not contain enough information to execute tuckpointing to preserve the historic craftsmanship that characterizes the distinctive character-defining features of the brick detailing of this property.

RECOMMENDATION

Section 21-2-78, Determination of Historic District Commission

Recommendation: Replace Original Windows With Aluminum-Clad Wood Windows

Staff finds that the replacement of original double-hung, true divided-light, wood windows with double-hung, aluminum-clad wood windows with simulated divided-light windows does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the following reasons:

- No documentation establishing that the original condition of the wood windows was beyond repair was submitted.
- The application does not clarify the number of windows, 16 or 17, proposed for replacement.
- The replacement of the original windows, that feature true divided light, with aluminum-clad wood windows, that have simulated divided light, is not compatible with historic architecture in the house in that they:
 - destroy the distinctive, character-defining features of the original windows, particularly the true-divided lights' detailing,
 - introduce a new material,
 - disturbs the remaining wood detailing, such as the mullions/wood trim around the windows.

Staff therefore recommends that the Commission issue a Denial for the above work items, as it do not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically Standards:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Recommendation 2: Tuck-pointing and painting

It is staff's opinion that the proposed tuckpointing and the painting of trim is appropriate. Staff therefore recommends the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work as proposed because it meets the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and the Indian Village Historic District Elements of Design.

Staff recommends the COA be issued with following conditions:

- The applicant provides HDC staff with product and description for the tuck-pointing work that follows the NPS guidelines, NPS Preservation Brief #2, "Repointing Mortar Joints in Historic Masonry Buildings".
- The applicant provides HDC staff with a paint color for the trim based on Color System D or E from the HDC color guidelines.