

REVISED STAFF REPORT: 9/13/2023 MEETING

PREPARED BY: J. ROSS

APPLICATION NUMBER: 2023-8524

ADDRESS: 4138 LINCOLN

HISTORIC DISTRICT: WOODBRIDGE FARM

APPLICANT/OWNER: ERIC JONES & PAMELA CASTILLO

ARCHITECT: ASH STUDIO

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: 8/20/2023

DATE OF STAFF VISIT: 8/31/2023

SCOPE OF WORK: REPLCE WINDOWS (WORK PARTIALLY COMPLETE), INSTALL NEW DOORS AND DECK AT SOUTH SIDE WALL, REHABILITATE BUILDING)

EXISTING CONDITIONS

Erected ca. 1900, 4138 Lincoln is a single-family, wood-frame dwelling that is located at within the Woodbridge Farm Historic District. The building is 2 ½-stories in height and is rectangular in plan. Its primary mass is topped with a front-gabled roof, while the rear roof is hipped. A gabled-roof bay is located at the south elevation. With the exception of the three windows in the attic story's gable end and the windows at the north/side, all windows were recently removed without HDC approval. The window openings are now covered with plywood. Wood, fish-scale shingle siding is located at the building's upper stories. Lapped, wood clapboard siding is at the front elevation, first story, and at the side and rear elevations. Wood panel siding is also located at the front elevation, first story. According to historic Sanborn maps and a review of the submitted photos, a one-story gabled-roof wing and porch was removed front the building's rear elevation sometime after 1970. Brick foundation walls are visible at all four elevations and a brick chimney is located at the north elevation. The primary entry, located at the west elevation, consists of two historic-age paneled wood doors. A partial-width, hipped roof original porch with wood columns, floor, and steps shelters this entry The rear entry is a single, hinged historic paneled wood door.



4138 Lincoln, current appearance. Staff photo, taken 8/31/2023

PROPOSAL

With the current submission, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to rehabilitate the house per the attached drawings, including the following scope items:

FRONT ELEVATION

- At porch, retain all roof elements. Where necessary/deteriorated repair using in kind materials. Replace existing floor, steps, skirting, and steps with new wood elements per drawing. Install new light fixture at ceiling.
- Retain remaining wood windows at attic story gable end. Where necessary, replace deteriorated elements with new wood to match existing
- Retain remaining wood trim/brickmould at second story windows and wood trim/paneling at first-story bay. Where necessary, replace deteriorated elements with new wood to match existing
- At first and second story, install new aluminum-clad, wood windows at first and second story per submission
- Retain existing wood siding. Where necessary, replace deteriorated siding with new siding to match existing in material, dimension, and profile

REAR ELEVATION

- Remove existing door and infill opening (material not specified)
- Punch in new opening to accommodate a single door with transom
- Punch in new opening to accommodate a new aluminum clad, 1/1, wood window at second story
- Install new lapped wood siding throughout to include replacement of existing wood siding. The new siding at this location will match the existing in exposure and profile.
- Install a new wood porch deck

SIDE/SOUTH ELEVATION

- Remove two existing windows at 1st story, beneath the second story bay, and lengthen opening/ lower sill to accommodate a set of paired swinging wood doors with wood panel
- Erect a 10'x14' wood deck
- Remove existing wood brickmould at window openings and install new install new aluminum-clad, wood windows with wood trim/brickmould
- Retain existing wood siding. Where necessary, replace deteriorated siding with new siding to match existing in material, dimension, and profile

SIDE/NORTH ELEVATION

- Remove existing wood brickmould at window openings and install new install new aluminum-clad, wood windows with wood trim/brickmould
- Retain existing wood siding. Where necessary, replace deteriorated siding with new siding to match existing in material, dimension, and profile

ALL ELEVATIONS

- Paint walls as per submitted color scheme
- Replace basement windows with new glass block windows
- Replace existing wood trim board at foundation with new wood trim board to match existing

ROOF

- Install new black dimensional shingles and continuous ridge vent
- Install solar shingles (finish color, black) at southern roof surface (towards the rear of the roof, behind the projecting bay) and the rear/east roof surface
- Install new aluminum gutters and downspouts
- **Remove concrete and clay tile chimney at rear roof surface**

SITE

- Remove existing chain link fence
- Replace concrete walkway in front yard with new concrete walkway.
- Retain existing hedgerow plants at front yard, adjacent to existing fence
- Install a new HVAC condenser in rear yard

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- Please note that a previous owner presented a rehabilitation proposal to the Commission for review at the 3/21/2021 meeting which included a proposal to rebuild the front porch, retaining only the existing brackets. The Commission approved the proposal with the condition that the existing entire roof/canopy structure, to include the roof, wood bead board ceiling, decorative wood brackets, and cornice be retained and repaired. The Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) allowed for the replacement of the existing corner posts, wood balustrade and newel posts, deck, and steps to match the appear of the elements at the time of the district's designation. The current porch proposal meets the COA and associated conditions which the Commission issued in 2021. Staff supports the current proposed treatment of the front porch.
- The proposal includes the installation of solar shingles at the southern roof surface and the rear roof. See the following link to the product's website for images of the product in situ [Solar Roofing | Integrated Solar Roof Systems | CertainTeed](#). Note the following re: this scope item:
 - The shingle panels have a very thin profile (. 875") and the installation process involves the application of the panels directly to the roof sheathing using standard deck screws. The new shingle panels will therefore present a minimal change to the roof's geometry when compared to conventional solar panels. .
 - The color of the shingle panels will be black to match the color of the new asphalt shingle roof.
 - The current roof covering is not historic age. The proposed new shingle panel installation will not result in the removal of historic fabric
 - The solar shingle panels proposed for installation at the rear elevation will not be visible from the public right-of-way. The shingles proposed for the south roof surface will be located to the rear of the roof, behind the projecting side-gabled bay. As a result, they will be minimally visible from the public right-of way.
 - The Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitation, [Illustrated Guidelines on Sustainability for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings \(nps.gov\)](#) recommends the following for solar technology:
 - *Installing a low-profile solar device on the historic building so that it is not visible or only minimally visible from the public right of way*

It is staff's opinion that the proposed work item/ the proposed new solar shingle panels meet the Standards. Staff therefore recommends that the Commission approve this scope item.

- The application proposes to remove two existing windows at 1st story, beneath the second story bay, and lengthen opening/lower sill to accommodate a set of paired swinging wood doors with wood panel at the south side wall. The current set of drawings do not include dimensioned drawing of existing conditions. However, staff did receive a verbal confirmation from the

project's architect that once windows and the associated trim/casing are removed at this location, the rough opening width will remain the same/will not be widened, to accommodate the proposed new doors. Also, the doors will match the paired doors at the front façade. Staff therefore supports this scope item as long as the new doors and trim are wood at the exterior/not clad with metal, fiberglass, vinyl, etc. and the finish color/paint color palette of the new doors and associated trim match that proposed for the front door/primary entrance.

- The chimney proposed for removal is located at the rear of the building and is therefore not visible from the public right-of-way. The chimney is not a distinctive, character-defining feature as it does not appear to be historic age and is utilitarian in design/does not display any decorative detailing. Staff does not have concerns re: its proposed removal.

ISSUES

- The project includes the proposal for the erection of a new wood deck at the south side wall/side yard. It is staff's opinion that the deck as proposed is not compatible with the home's historic appearance for the following reason:
 - The south side wall is highly visible from the public right-of-way as a adjacent parcel is vacant.
 - Historically, wood porches typically included a roof overhand of some kind in order to protect the floor from deterioration due to exposure to weather.
 - The scale/ footprint of the deck is too large/wide as it extends into the adjacent lot at 4132 Lincoln. A porch at that location would have been designed to fit within the boundaries of the parcel which the house sits.

A deck of the sort proposed is better suited for the rear elevation as it would not be visible from the public right-of way. It is staff's opinion that a sensitively designed porch wood porch which includes a roof and fits within the 4138 Lincoln's parcel boundaries would be more appropriate for this location.

- As previously noted, an application for the rehabilitation of the property was approved by the Commission in 2021. Specifically, re: the windows, the application proposed the following:
 - At the north wall, retain and repair all existing wood windows. Replace trim with new ¼ cedar trim. The Commission approved this scope item as proposed.
 - At the south wall, replace trim with new ¼ cedar trim and replace existing windows with new aluminum clad wood windows. The Commission approved this scope item as proposed.
 - At the front elevation replace windows and trim with new. The Commission did not approve this scope item as they placed issued a condition on the COA which required that "the existing windows, brickmould/trim, and mullions at the front shall be retained and repaired."
- Note that the current property owner had all of the existing windows removed with the exception of the three windows at the attic story, front façade. The only windows that received an HDC approval for removal/replacement are those which are located at the south wall. Please see the applicant's narrative which outlines the reasons why he removed the windows throughout. See the 2021 staff report for documentation of the window conditions at that time [4138 Lincoln | City of Detroit \(detroitmi.gov\)](#). As the window conditions were not documented throughout at the time of the recent unapproved removal, it is not clear that they were deteriorated beyond repair. It is therefore staff's opinion that the unapproved removal of the windows at the front and north side wall does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's (SOI) Standards for Rehabilitation. ~~Also, the current documents do not provide the level of details necessary in order for staff to ascertain that the proposed new windows are an adequate replication for the windows that were removed without HDC approval. Also, note that the proposed Marvin windows are a different product~~

~~than that which was proposed in 2021. It is not clear if they provide an appropriate replication for the windows which were approved for replacement at the south elevation. The applicant's architect has committed to providing more information re: the proposed new windows and trim/casing which better detail their dimensions versus the original elements. However, staff has yet to receive this information as of the date of this report's completion. Staff will revise this report to incorporate the new information at the time of our receipt of the documentation.~~

- Please see the document entitled “4138 Lincoln Additional Information 091123.pdf” which the applicant submitted to HDC staff on 9/11/2023. As the original windows are no longer extant, staff notes the following re: the proposed new windows:
 - The submitted document provides dimensioned section drawings for the proposed new Marvin Ultimate G2, aluminum-clad, wood window units as well as typical dimensioned drawings for the home's original 1/1, double-hung wood windows. It is staff's opinion that the proposed new window product provides an adequate replication of the original 1/1 double-hung wood units (at the north and south sides and at the front façade bay windows) given the fact that that the Marvin Ultimate G2 is not a custom product and the Commission has allowed for the installation of this product in the past *when an original window has proven to be deteriorated beyond repair*. Staff does acknowledge that an exact replication of original windows can only be achieved via a custom build. Also, note that the Commission did approve the removal of the original, 1/1 wood windows from the *south side wall* in 2021 as they determined that those windows were deteriorated beyond repair at that time.
 - The current document does not provide dimensioned detail drawings of the distinctive windows at the front façade first-story bay and the second story which included transoms (see the below photo). It is therefore not clear to staff that the proposed new window product will serve as an adequate replication for these distinctive, character-defining windows. The project architect has noted via email correspondence that he has “reached out to the window manufacturer to try and obtain shop drawings of the proposed fixed/transom windows at the front facade, in order to be able to compare the qualities of the horizontal mullions with those of the original windows. We only recorded measurements of the double-hung windows from the past submission in 2021, as those were the ones approved for replacement. So any comparisons with the front transom units would be limited to a visual comparison between the photos we have saved.” He further noted that he will share any additional information he receives from the manufacturer before the 9/13/2023 regular HDC meeting with staff for presentation to the Commission,



Google Streetview, prior to unapproved window removal. Note that windows outline in red include a fixed unit topped with a transom or a 1/1, double hung unit topped with a transom. It is not clear to staff that the current window product adequately replicates the windows/trim details of these units.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation # 1). Section 21-2-73, DENIAL

It is staff's opinion that the proposed new south side deck is not appropriate to the building's historic character for the following reasons:

- The south side wall is highly visible from the public right-of-way as an adjacent parcel is vacant.
- Historically, wood porches typically included a roof overhang of some kind in order to protect the floor from deterioration due to exposure to weather.
- The scale/ footprint of the deck is too large/wide as it extends into the adjacent lot at 4132 Lincoln. A porch at that location would have been designed to fit within the boundaries of the parcel which the house sits.

Also, the **proposed** new window treatment **proposed for the north/side wall and front/west façade** is inappropriate for the following reasons:

- As the window conditions were not documented throughout at the time of the unapproved removal, it is not clear that they were deteriorated beyond repair. Also, the current documents do

not provide the level of detail necessary in order for staff to ascertain that the proposed new windows are an adequate replication for the ~~windows at the front façade first-story bay and the second story which included transoms~~ that were removed without HDC approval. ~~Finally, the proposed Marvin windows are a different product than that which was proposed in 2021. It is not clear if they provide an appropriate replication for all of the windows which were approved for replacement at the south elevation.~~

Staff therefore recommends that the Commission issue a denial of these work items because they do not meet the Woodbridge Farm Historic District's Elements of Design or the SOI Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically, Standards #:

2. *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
5. *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.*
6. *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*
9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

Recommendation # 2). Section 21-2-73, CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (COA)

It is staff's opinion that the remaining items are appropriate to the property's historic character. Staff therefore recommends that the Commission issue a COA for the remaining work items outside of the windows and south side deck because the work is in keeping with the district's elements of design and meet the SOI Standards for Rehabilitation. However, staff does recommend that this COA be issued with the following condition:

- The new doors proposed for the south side wall shall only be installed if an HDC approved porch is installed at that location. Also, the new doors and trim shall be wood at the exterior/not clad with metal, fiberglass, vinyl, etc., and the finish color/paint color palette of the new doors and associated trim match that proposed for the front door/primary entrance. The applicant shall proposed a revised proposal for this door reflecting this condition to HDC staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of the project permit.