

ADDRESS: 1815 CHURCH

APPLICATION NO: 2023-8514

HISTORIC DISTRICT: CORKTOWN

APPLICANT/OWNER: BENJAMIN NEWMAN

ARCHITECT: ROGER VAN TOL

DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: 8/31/2023 & 9/6/2023

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: 8/20/2023

SCOPE: ERECT CARRIAGE HOUSE, REPLACE SIDING ON DWELLING

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The building located at 1815 Church is a single-family dwelling that was erected ca. 1900. The 2-story, cross-gabled home is clad with vinyl siding. Windows are 1/1, aluminum-clad wood units. The primary entrance is sheltered by a shed-roof porch which includes a square wood column and a wood floor, steps, and handrails. A deteriorated concrete slab is located in the property's rear yard.



1815 Church, current appearance. Staff photo taken 8/31/2023

PROPOSAL

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to rehabilitate the existing home and to erect a new 2-story carriage house/accessory dwelling unit within the parcel, to the rear of the home. Specific work items which have been submitted to the Commission for their consideration includes the following items:

Existing Home

- Replace the existing wood porch at the front façade with porch. The new porch will include a wood deck, turned column, steps, and handrailing. The new porch skirting will be made of cement fiber
- Remove the existing non-historic, synthetic siding
 - If the historic/original wood siding remains underneath, retain and restore. Replace any deteriorated siding with new wood siding to match existing.
 - If historic/original wood siding does not remain underneath the existing synthetic siding or if the original wood siding is deteriorated beyond repair, install new cement fiber siding. The new siding will be lapped with the exception of half round shingles proposed for installation at the projecting wing's front and side walls, second story and at the porch. Also, Cement fiber sunburst detailing is proposed for installation at the front façade's gable end and in the porch's gable end. Finally, cement fiber trim is proposed for all window surrounds
- Replace the existing asphalt shingle roof with a new dimensional asphalt shingle roof (color brown). Existing non-historic aluminum gutters and downspouts will be replaced with new aluminum gutters and downspouts. The existing fascia and frieze board (material unknown) will be replaced new fiber cement fascia and frieze board
- Install new light fixtures at rear wall

New Carriage House

Per the submitted drawings and the applicant's narrative, the new carriage home will be erected according to the following description:

- *The existing deteriorated concrete parking pad will be removed and a new accessory dwelling unit will be constructed at the rear of the property 1'-0" from the alley. The intent of the design is to complement the existing home while being distinguishable as non-historic. Proportions and roof slopes are inspired by those of the existing home. The new building will have an upright and wing form that wraps around an existing tree. The upright portion will be two-stories and the ell (wing) will be one-and-a-half-stories. The first floor will function as a garage and the second floor will function as a guest house. The building will be wood framed, slab on grade construction. Two 8'-0" x 8'-0" sectional, insulated, overhead doors will open to the alley from the south facade. On the first floor of the north facade, a recessed entry will provide protection from weather to the garage entry door.*

A wood framed exterior stair, painted to match the new trim color of the existing house, will lead to a landing at the second floor where the glazed entry door to the guest house is located. The windows will primarily have a vertical expression and are centrally located within the gables similar to the existing house. One window on the west facade will have a horizontal expression. The roof will be cross-gabled similar to that of the existing home. The soffits and fascia of the eaves will be painted to match the new trim color of the existing house. See the attached drawings for finish locations. The cladding on the first floor will be Allura smooth texture, fiber cement, lap siding painted a deep charcoal. The walls of the second floor will be clad in red cedar with a clear penetrating sealer. The windows will be Pella Reserve Contemporary aluminum clad wood with black exterior finish. All windows will be casement except the window on the west facade will be an awning window. Certainteed Landmark Pro Max Def dimensional asphalt shingles in weathered wood color will be installed on the roof to match the new shingles of the existing home. There will be a single Schoolhouse Allegheny Sconce in a black finish located above each of the garage doors. Another Schoolhouse Allegheny Sconce in the same finish will be installed next to the entry door on the first floor. There will be four RBW Crisp Sconces in a black finish with frosted glass on the west facade of the building to light the stairs and landing. Two RBW Crisp sconces in the same finish will be installed on the east facade.

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- The current front porch floor, steps, railing and column are not historic age. A review of the property's designation slide and Google Streetview images indicate that these porch elements were added sometime between 2017 and 2018. A review of HDC and building department files indicated that the current porch was erected without HDC approval and/or permit. The porch which was present at the time of the building's designation was in poor condition and did not display any distinctive character-defining elements. It is staff's opinion that the proposed new porch is compatible with the building's historic appearance and its erection will not result in the removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize the property.
- The current vinyl siding was installed sometime before 2007. A review of HDC records indicate that the property had non-original asbestos shingle siding at the time of its designation. It is unclear to both staff and the applicant if the original wood siding still remains underneath the current vinyl siding. As noted above, the applicant has committed to remove the current synthetic siding to determine if the original siding is still extant. If so, he proposes to retain the siding and repair in kind where needed. This would be the correct approach per the Secretary of the Interior's for Rehabilitation (SOI) Standards and National Park Service guidelines.



1815 Church, designation slide. Note siding and porch



Google Streetview image from 2016. Note porch present at the time of designation had been replaced

- It is staff's opinion that the new carriage house is compatible in design to the existing historic home while proposed modern materials for the cladding, railing, and windows will mark it as a new building. Although the scale of the building is quite large, it will not be readily visible from the public right of way. Also, a fair amount of the rear yard will remain as open space. Staff recommends the approval of this scope item.

ISSUES

- As noted above, if the original siding is present beneath the current synthetic siding and is in good/repairable condition, the applicant is proposing to retain it. If not, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to install fiber cement siding. Per the submitted materials, the applicant is proposing to use Allura brand siding. Specifically, the lapped siding will display a 7" exposure and will be 5/16" thick. The proposed fish scale siding will be 1/4" thick. It is staff's opinion that the proposed siding is too thin to adequately replicate a true lapped or fish scale wood siding, which typically display a 3/4" to 1" profile. The cumulative effect of the siding's installation would be a uniform flatness which is similar to the current vinyl siding. Staff recommends that if new siding and/or trim is required, that it be wood with profile that is 3/4" or thicker.
- SOI Standard #3 states the following:
Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

It is staff's opinion that the new sunburst detailing proposed for the gable ends would be conjectural and therefore would not conform this requirement. Staff recommends that lapped or fish scale wood siding be installed in those locations.

RECOMMENDATION

Section 21-2-78. Determination of the Historic District Commission – COA

Staff recommends that the Commission issue a COA for the project as it generally conforms to the district's elements of design and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. However, staff does recommend that this COA is issued with the following conditions:

- Should new siding, trim, fascia, and/or frieze need to be installed, the elements should be true wood with a profile/thickness of 3/4" or more. Also, the sunburst detailing proposed for the front gable end and porch shall not be installed. Rather, lapped or fish scale wood siding shall be installed at these locations. The applicant shall provide a new proposal for the siding to staff for review and approval prior to undertaking the work.