

**STAFF REPORT: AUGUST 9, 2023 MEETING**

**PREPARED BY: A. DYE**

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 23-8477**

**ADDRESS: 1200 HUBBARD**

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: HUBBARD FARMS**

**APPLICANT: CHRIS FRANKOVICH, HUSKY HOMES**

**PROPERTY OWNER: CONNOR MENDENHALL**

**DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: JULY 17, 2023**

**DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: JULY 21, 2023**

**SCOPE: ERECT REAR EXTENSION AND SECOND STORY PORCH**

### **EXISTING CONDITIONS**

The 2-1/2 story dwelling is located on the east side of Hubbard, roughly mid-block. The walls are faced with dark red brick and the wood windows and trim are painted a contrasting yellowish-beige color that almost matches the color of the stone windowsills. The grouped windows at the front wall protrude from the wall plane. The first floor's extension encompasses four narrow windows and is faced with matching dark red brick and covered by a shallow hip roof. The second-floor extension has two mulled windows and is faced with siding; the deep overhanging eave acts as a roof for this element. A hip roof dormer with three square windows is centered at the third floor and breaks through the front slope of the house's hip roof. The wide overhanging eaves at every level of the house, coupled with the deep covered porch, which is supported by unadorned square brick piers, offer Prairie-style elements to the dwelling.



*Staff photo, July 21, 2023.*

The north-side elevation features a second story bay window placed directly above a side entrance, whereas the south-side elevation has a box bay at the first floor. Both bays are covered with siding. The wood windows at the front elevation are six-over-one double-hung units, while the remaining walls feature one-over-one double-hung units. The small rectangular windows on each side elevation have leaded glass.

The house sits on a raised yard and the two front yard walkways (one leading to the front porch, the other leading to the side entrance) have two steps at the sidewalk. Due to the narrow lot, the detached garage is sited directly behind the house.

**PROPOSAL**

- Remove approximately 150 sq ft of existing wood deck and second story open porch.
- Erect 13' deep x 12'-11" wide one-story rear extension with landing and stairs, as well as an open second story open porch.

**STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH**

- The Hubbard Farms Historic District was established in 1983.
- The detached garage first appears on the 1950 Sanborn map, so staff concludes the detached garage was erected between 1921 – 1950.
- The houses on this street fill most of their lots so there is limited visibility of the rear yards.
- The extension is proposed to have a slight indentation from the rear northeast corner of the house, further reducing its visibility and allowing the siding of the extension to terminate at the rear masonry wall.



Above left: 1950 Sanborn map.  
 Above right: Google map aerial view. Star denotes location of extension.  
 Floor plan, rear photo and elevation drawing provided by applicant.

- The paint color proposed for the extension's composite siding is Sherwin Williams SW2851.



- The extension and second story porch will not remove historic materials nor alter features and spaces that characterize the property. The addition's size, placement, and minimally articulated design is compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the existing property.

## **ISSUES**

- The surface finish of the composite siding isn't listed. A smooth finish, rather than raised grain, would more closely resemble wood siding.
- Vinyl windows, with exterior grilles, are proposed for the extension. It is staff's opinion, through limits of its fabrication and materiality, vinyl windows cannot match the dimensionality and visual characteristics of historic windows and are not compatible with the architectural style and age of the house.
- Grilles are proposed for the extension's sliding door and windows. The historic windows at the front elevation have muntins, but the windows on the sides and rear of the house are one-over-one units. This is a common feature to historic houses – the prominent front elevation is given additional decorative details. Therefore, it is staff's opinion the new windows and sliding door should be clear glass in keeping with the existing relationship between the side/rear windows and the front elevation patterned windows.
- The color selected for the new windows and sliding door is white. Contemporary bright white frames would create a strong contrast against the wall materials and isn't appropriate within the darker architectural color palette of the house.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

Staff finds that the work as proposed will not alter the features and spaces that characterize the property and district and therefore recommends the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work as it meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and the Elements of Design for the district.

*Staff recommends the Certificate of Appropriateness be issued with the following condition:*

- The composite siding material will have a smooth, not raised grain, finish.
- Wood, or wood, aluminum-clad window units, with clear glass, will be selected. Cladding or paint color (if exterior wood finish is selected) will be submitted to staff for review.
- A clear glass sliding door will be selected. Frame color will be submitted to staff for review.