

ADDRESS: 2285 ATKINSON

APPLICATION NO: #23-8230

HISTORIC DISTRICT: ATKINSON AVENUE

APPLICANT: SEAN HORVATH/LUNAR CONSTRUCTION INC.

OWNER: IAN REDMOND

DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: 2/28/2023

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: 2/13/2023

SCOPE: ERECT GARAGE

EXISTING CONDITIONS

Erected ca. 1920, the building at 2285 Atkinson is a two-story, single-family dwelling. The building features a hipped roof which is topped with shed-roof dormers. Decorative wood brackets are located at the roof's overhanging eaves. A brick chimney is located at the roof's western face. The building's exterior walls are clad with a buff-colored brick and windows are 1/1, double-hung wood units. A projecting wood bay which includes three windows and a stone sill is located at the building's primary elevation, first story. Decorative wood shutters are present at the primary/north elevation's second story. A bay at the building's side/east elevation is clad with lapped wood siding. An arched wood overhang with brackets shelters the primary entrance while wood pilasters flank the doorway.



2285 Atkinson, current appearance (staff photo taken on 2/28/2023)

PROPOSAL

Per the current submission, the applicant is seeking the Historic District Commission's approval to erect a new garage in the property's rear yard. Specifically, the project includes the following scope:

- In the property's rear yard erect a new garage which is 15' in height. The garage's footprint shall measure 20'x20'. Exterior walls will be clad with vinyl (color not specified) with an aluminum trim around fascia and garage door. A single steel overhead door (CHI Overhead Doors "Timeless" collection, color not specified) will be located at the front/north elevation. Coach-style light fixtures will flank the overhead door (cutsheet not provided). The roof will be front gabled and covered with asphalt shingles (color of shingle not specified).
- At the rear yard, add a new concrete parking apron to the front /north of the garage and a new concrete hearth to the west of the garage, at the location of the man/service door
- At the rear yard, adjacent to the rear elevation, add a new 14'x35' concrete walkway and a new 12'x12' concrete patio.

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- A Sanborn Fire Insurance map from 1971 indicates that a garage was once present in the property's rear yard. However, a review of Google Streetview images going back to 2007 indicate that the garage has not been present at the site for at least 16 years. The Commission has no record of the garage's demolition
- The proposed/new garage will have a front-gabled roof while the home has a hipped roof. Staff reviewed aerial maps of properties in the near vicinity of 2285 Atkinson and noted that homes with hipped roofs included garages with hipped, front, and side gabled roofs. Staff therefore has no issues the proposed garage's roofline. However, staff does recommend that the color of the asphalt roof shingles match that of the home's asphalt shingle roof (brown)

ISSUES

- The applicant is seeking to clad the garage in vinyl with a faux woodgrain. It is staff's opinion that the proposed vinyl product is not compatible to the home's and neighborhood's historic character because it does not adequately display an appearance, texture and profile of the traditional wood siding which it is seeking to mimic, and is a non-historic materials that detracts from the historic context. Wood grain is typically not visible on painted historic-age, lapped wood siding. Rather, such siding would display a smooth finish due to application of multiple layers of paint over time. Therefore, staff recommends that the garage be clad with a true lapped wood siding or a cementitious siding which displays a smooth finish, which would be more in keeping with the appearance of lapped wood siding.

RECOMMENDATION

Section 21-2-78. Determination of the Historic District Commission – Certificate of Appropriateness

It is staff's opinion that the project generally conforms to the Elements of Design for the Corktown Historic District and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Staff therefore recommends that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work with the following conditions:

- The garage shall be clad with a wood siding or a cement fiber siding which displays a smooth finish. The proposed vinyl siding is incompatible with the neighborhood's historic character because it does not adequately display an appearance, texture and profile of the traditional wood siding which it is seeking to mimic and is a non-historic materials that detracts from the historic context. Wood grain is typically not visible on painted historic-age, lapped wood siding. Rather, such siding would display a smooth finish due to application of multiple layers of paint over time.
- The color of the garage's asphalt shingle roofing shall match the color of the home's roof. HDC staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the shingles' final color x prior to the issuance of the project's permit.
- The applicant shall select a color for the garage doors, trim, and siding which is compatible with the home's trim color(s). The material for the side elevation door shall out be provided to HDC staff. HDC staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the final color selections prior to the issuance of the project's permit.