

STAFF REPORT: DECEMBER 14, 2022 REGULAR MEETING

PREPARED BY: T. BOSCARINO

APPLICATION NUMBER: 22-8162

ADDRESS: 15350 GRANDVILLE

HISTORIC DISTRICT: ROSEDALE PARK

APPLICANT: LINDA HRIBAR, WEATHERGARD WINDOWS

PROPERTY OWNER: CAROLE SMITH AND EBONI CHAVERS

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: NOVEMBER 10, 2022

DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: DECEMBER 3, 2022

SCOPE: REPLACE SIX (6) CASEMENT WINDOWS WITH VINYL WINDOWS

EXISTING CONDITIONS

15350 Grandville is a two-and-a-half story, brick, Tudor Revival house built in 1936. It faces west onto Grandville Avenue. Defining features include sharp gables on the front façade and projecting entrance bay, a Tudor-arched doorway with tabbed stone surround, stone veneer on the entrance bay, and steel casement windows (covered behind aluminum storm windows), the subject of this application.



View from northwest. December 2022 photo by staff.

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to replace six (6) steel casement windows on all four sides of the house (not all windows of the house are proposed for replacement). Two of these are double casements, for a total of eight (8) operable units. The proposal is to replace these with eight operable vinyl windows.

The existing windows are rolled steel, out-swinging, crank-operated casement windows with interior screens. Each window consists of a fixed section and one or two operable sections. They are currently painted a dark color. Each window is covered with aluminum storms, subdivided to accommodate operation of the window.

The proposed new windows are WeatherGard 700 Series custom windows. Casement windows are proposed for the

five larger window openings on the front and south elevations of the house. Three smaller, narrower windows on the sides (north and south) and back (east) of the house (photos labeled “left,” “right,” and “bath” in the submitted application materials) are to use sash windows.

Glass is to be “premium” low-E glass, except for the bathroom window, for which “obscure” glass is proposed. Simulated muntin “grids” in bronze-colored aluminum are proposed to match the existing muntin pattern. On the exterior, windows are proposed to be custom painted 202 Royal Brown. Exact dimensions of the rails or simulated muntins are not provided. Windows are proposed to include interior screens.



Left: Example double casement window. Note that it consists of fixed upper and side panes, with two out-swinging units in the center. The proposed replacement would fill the entire space with a pair of operable casement units. Right: Example single casement window. Again, this consists of a fixed portion and an operable portion. The proposal is to replace the entire unit with a single operable casement window. Other windows on the building vary in dimensions but are the same age and style. Photos from application, cropped by staff.



Example window proposed for replacement. Photo from application, cropped by staff.



Left: WeatherGard 700 Series vinyl casement windows, interior view. Note that the proposed product would look different from the image, as bronze-colored aluminum simulated muntins are proposed, and a brown color is specified for the exterior. Image: www.weathergard.com. Right: 202 Royal Brown. Source: www.myperfectcolor.com.

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- The Rosedale Park Historic District was established by Ordinance 03-07 in 2007. Its Final Report frequently mentions leaded glass casement windows as noteworthy features.
- Staff notes that subdivided, leaded- or zinc-came casement windows are a hallmark of 1930s Tudor Revival houses in general, and very common in Rosedale Park specifically. For instance, two neighboring houses to the subject property also have similar windows.



Tudor Revival houses at 15345 and 15362 Grandville. Note that windows have similar proportions, subdivision, and operability as the subject property. Photo by staff.

- The Elements of Design for the district state:
 - Windows are “often subdivided.”
 - Textural interest is created by “subdivided windows.”
 - “Windows are commonly either of the metal casement or wooden sash variety.”
- The Final Report asserts that the historic district is “significant for its varied housing stock that dates from the 1910s into the 1950s,” implying a Period of Significance for the district.
- The proposed window color closely matches the trim color and B:8 Grayish Brown as shown in Color System D as appropriate.
- Staff does not observe any major deterioration to the windows as shown in photos provided by the applicant.

ISSUES

- The building’s windows are both historic (original to the house or dating from the Period of Significance) and distinctive (as suggested by the Elements of Design, and as observed on comparable houses in the neighborhood) and have not deteriorated beyond repair. The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, cited below, direct that they be retained.
- Further, should a replacement window be warranted (for instance, if the existing windows had deteriorated beyond repair), an appropriate replacement window would, at a minimum, be a metal or metal-clad casement window mimicking the dimensions and muntin pattern and replicating the operation of the historic windows (including a juxtaposition of fixed panes with one or paired operable sashes within each window opening).

RECOMMENDATION

Section 21-2-78: Determination of Historic District Commission

Staff recommends that the Commission issue a Denial of the proposed window replacement as it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular:

2. *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
5. *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
6. *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*