

**STAFF REPORT:** 8/10/2022 REGULAR MEETING

**PREPARED BY:** T. BOSCARINO

**APPLICATION NUMBER:** 22-7945

**ADDRESS:** 14939 WARWICK

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** ROSEDALE PARK

**APPLICANT:** JIMMIE AND JONIQUE PHARR

**PROPERTY OWNER:** JIMMIE AND JONIQUE PHARR

**DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION:** JUNE 1, 2022

**DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT:** JULY 22, 2022

**SCOPE:** REPLACE TWO WOOD CASEMENT WINDOWS WITH VINYL WINDOWS, PAINT EXTERIOR SHUTTERS

### **EXISTING CONDITIONS**

14949 Warwick St. is a two-story, hip-roof building in the Rosedale Park Historic District, built in 1924. It faces east onto the street. Façade elements, most notably the simplified porch columns and a broken pediment with acorn finial, place this building within the Georgian Colonial Revival style. Windows are largely six-over-one wood sash windows; upstairs bedroom windows are eight-light wood casement windows. The windows are covered by sliding, tracked storm windows. The shutters are wood, fixed, and painted a yellowish ivory color. The brick building itself has been painted a bright white color.



*View from northwest. July 2022 photo by staff.*

## PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes two separate work items.

First, the applicant proposes to replace two (2) wood, eight-light casement windows on the second floor, south side of the house. The windows are currently painted white. Staff does not observe any deterioration to the windows as shown in photos provided by the applicant. During a site visit, staff observed the windows only at a distance, from the sidewalk. The applicant states that they wish to replace the windows to facilitate the installation of window air conditioning units.



*Windows proposed for replacement. Illustration by staff.*

The proposed new windows are Wallside double hung, one-over-one, vinyl windows with white interior and exterior finish. Dimensions or other detailed specifications are not provided in the application or on the product website. However, a photo is shown below.



*Left: Window proposed for replacement (typical). Right: Proposed replacement window (photo from Wallside website).*

Second, the applicant proposes to paint the shutters (currently yellowish ivory) Sherwin Williams 6959, Blue Chip, to match the color of the front door.

**SW 6959  
Blue Chip**

## **STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH**

- The Rosedale Park Historic District was established by Ordinance 03-07 in 2007. Its Elements of Design (Sec. 21-2-199) provide guidance on windows as a distinctive feature, as well as guidance on painted wood trim.

The Elements of Design state:

- Windows are “often subdivided”
  - “[I]n buildings derived from classical precedents, double-hung sash windows are further subdivided by muntins.”
  - Textural interest is created by “subdivided windows”
  - English Revival style buildings generally have painted wood trim and window frames of dark brown, gray, buff, or shades of cream, depending on the main body color.
- The Historic Designation Advisory Board Final Report for Rosedale Park (2006) mentions shutters as significant features of Colonial Revival buildings at 15094 Ashton Boulevard and 15067 Auburn Boulevard, with the former being somewhat comparable in character to 14949 Warwick. It provides no guidance regarding colors for shutters or other trim. The Final Report asserts that the historic district is “significant for its varied housing stock that dates from the 1910s into the 1950s,” implying a Period of Significance for the district.
- It is not known if the brick was painted during or after the Period of Significance.

## **ISSUES**

- The building’s windows are both historic (original to the house or likely dating from the Period of Significance) and distinctive (as suggested by the Elements of Design) and have not deteriorated beyond repair. The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, cited below, direct that they be retained. Further, were a replacement window to be warranted (for instance, if the existing windows had deteriorated beyond repair), staff notes that an appropriate replacement window would be a wood, divided light window, conforming to the Elements of Design mentioned above.
- Regarding the proposed paint color, the house’s Georgian Colonial Revival style most closely matches the Neo-Georgian classification, corresponding with Color System C on the Historic District Commission Color Chart. This document provides five options for shutter colors: blackish green, grayish olive green, grayish green, moderate olive brown, and light olive, suggesting that a dark color is appropriate; it also suggests that an off-white paint color may appropriate in situations where it matches the trim color. However, staff suggests that the latter option may have been intended for darker-colored brick buildings more typical of Neo-Georgian architecture in Detroit, and does not recommend it for this building as long as the brick remains painted its current, white color.

- The Elements of Design, mentioned above, also suggest dark or light colors, “depending on the main body color.” Staff further notes that Sec. 21-2-71(2) directs the Historic District Commission to consider, in addition to the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, “the relationship of any exterior architectural features of the resource to the remainder of the resource” and notes that the applicant selected the proposed blue color specifically to match the existing door color. This would also provide contrast with the body color of the house, adding a level of interest to the façade. Therefore, staff suggests that the proposed color is appropriate.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

### Section 21-2-78: Determination of Historic District Commission

#### Recommendation 1 of 2: Replace two wood casement windows with vinyl windows

Staff recommends that the Commission issue a Denial of the proposed window replacement as it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular:

2. *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
5. *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

#### Recommendation 2 of 2: Paint exterior shutters

Staff recommends that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed paint color as it meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.