

STAFF REPORT: 8/10/2022 MEETING

PREPARED BY: J. ROSS

ADDRESS: 3030 SEMINOLE

APPLICATION NO: #22-7937

HISTORIC DISTRICT: INDIAN VILLAGE

APPLICANT/ARCHITECT: JOHN BIGGAR

OWNER: ERNIE ZACHARY AND DIANE VAN BUREN

DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: 7/2/2022

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: 7/14/2022

SCOPE

ERECT ONE-STORY REAR ADDITION TO INCLUDE INTEGRATION OF EXISTING REAR PORCH

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The property located at 3030 Seminole includes a 2 ½ -story single family home a detached garage. The home was erected ca.1915 and was designed by Herman & Simons for Dr. George Waldrek. The home features a side-gabled roof with projecting two-story wings at the front and rear elevations. An open two-story brick and half-timber porch with a slate floor is located at the home's rear elevation. Red brick is located at the first story and stucco with half-timber detailing at the second story and in the primary elevation gable end. Windows are double-hung wood units.



3030 Seminole, 7/2/2022 staff photo

PROPOSAL

The applicant attended the Commission's July 2022 regular meeting to present a proposal to demolish the existing rear elevation porch and to erect a new one-story addition. The Commission denied the application. With the current submission, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to retain the porch at the home's elevation and erect a new addition to include the following items:

- Retain the existing two-story brick and half-timber porch. Infill openings with new brick, stucco, aluminum-clad wood windows, and a door per the submitted drawings. A railing (height and material not specified) will be installed at the perimeter of the roof
- Erect a flat-roof, one-story addition at the building's rear elevation, adjacent to the porch per the submitted drawings. Exterior walls will be clad with brick and windows will be aluminum-clad wood units. A railing (height and material not specified) will be installed at the perimeter of the roof.



Rear and side elevation of new addition, design/application denied by HDC at 7/2022 regular meeting



Rear and side elevation of new addition, current design/application

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- Please see the applicant's photos of the rear. The existing historic porch is an open shell and currently includes the original stucco-clad railing/parapet at the second story and the brick columns, timber framing and columns, and slate floor at the first story. Any exterior cladding and fenestration at the porch's first story is no longer extant. Also, applicant indicated that the second story floor and ceiling below deteriorated over time, eventually collapsed, and was removed by the property owners. The specific timeframe of these events is not clear to staff



Heavy timber columns and beams



Rear porch

Heavy timber brackets



Note that the capital of this timber column does not appear to be a single piece. Rather it appears that a bracket piece was added to each side of the column to create the column's "flared" appearance. The flared brackets should be retained in order to maintain the columns' distinctive flared capitals

- The porch is of historic age and likely dates to the home’s original date of construction. It is staff’s opinion that porch is a character-defining feature of the home, despite its current condition, as the brick, timbers, and stucco detailing reflect that found at the home’s main mass. As noted above, all remaining elements of the porch contribute to the character of the property and should be retained.



Sanborn map, showing 3030 Seminole’s footprint in 1951

- The existing rear porch is not visible from the public right-of-way
- The proposed new rear addition would not be visible from the public-right-of-way
- The height, material, and style of the rooftop railing proposed for the new addition and the existing porch has not yet been selected. The applicant has noted that the submitted drawings only indicate the proposed location of the railing. The property owners will select the style, height, and material of the railing at a future date

ISSUES

- As noted above, the applicant submitted a proposal to the Commission at the 7/2022 regular meeting to demolish the historic rear elevation porch and erect a new one-story addition in its place. The Commission denied this application because they determined that the rear porch was a distinctive character-defining feature of the home which must be retained. With the current submittal, the applicant is proposing to retain the historic rear porch and integrate it into new construction/ a new addition. Staff supports the proposed concept. However, staff does have some questions around the specific manner in which the incorporation will be implemented as the current drawings are not final construction drawings and do not provide dimensioned details around the manner in which the new windows, doors, and new stucco and brick infill will be integrated within the existing structure. For example, the “flared” capitals of the columns will interfere with the successful installation of the windows. Based upon the current drawings and a conversation with the applicant, the distinctive brackets would have to be removed. Also, the windows and door will need to be inset within the walls/their openings in some manner. The submitted the elevations and floor plan do not specify how this will be accomplished.

RECOMMENDATION

Section 21-2-78. Determination of the Historic District Commission – Certificate of Appropriateness

HDC staff recommends that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project because it conforms to the district's Elements of Design and meets the Secretary of the Interior's (SOI) Standards. However, staff does recommend that the Commission issues this COA with the following conditions:

- Prior to the issuance of the COA and permit, HDC staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the final set of construction drawings for the project. The final drawings must be dimensioned and provide details re: the height, material, and style of the rooftop railing and the manner in which the new windows, doors, and stucco and brick infill will be integrated within the existing structure. Should HDC staff determine that any aspect of the final drawings does not meet the SOI's Standards, the project will be forwarded to the Commission for review at a monthly meeting.