Prepared by: D. Hall

STAFF REPORT FOR 2-9-00 MEETING APPLICATION NUMBER 00-9 1901 CHICAGO Wallside Windows/St. Paul A.M.E. Zion Church Boston Edison Historic District

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to install 30 vinyl replacement windows. All the proposed replacement windows are casement, either single or paired to match the size of the opening. The replacement windows are also proposed to have muntins to match the existing design of the wood casement windows, ranging between two by three and two by five. The window, trim and muntin color is proposed to be white.

In a letter from Rev. Derrick Anderson states the reasons for windows replacement. According to Rev. Anderson, the wood casement windows are drafty and many no longer shut tightly. He reports the roll down screens are worn, torn or no longer operate. Reports from contractors to Rev. Anderson state the screens or window cranks can not be repaired. The owner did consult many contractors for different types of windows. Vinyl replacement estimates range from \$14, 700 to \$24, 500. One bid for wood replacement windows was \$49, 500. Wood clad windows estimate was \$28, 800.

TREATMENT LEVEL AND ELEMENTS OF DESIGN

Boston Edison Historic District is designated at the rehabilitation treatment level.

The applicable portions of the elements of design include:

- (3) <u>Proportion of openings within the facade</u>. Windows openings are virtually always taller than wide; however, several windows are sometimes grouped into a combination that is wider than tall. Window openings are always subdivided. The most common window type is double-hung with sashes that are generally further subdivided by muntins or leaded glass.
- (7) <u>Relationship of materials</u>. Wood is almost universally used for window frames and other functional trim and is used in many examples for all trim.

RECOMMENDATION

According to the Assessor's Records, this house was built in 1951, thereby becoming 50 years old next year. The style of the building is complementary to the district, being of a Colonial Revival style, rather than a less similar style like the ranch house. The original windows are wood casement, which also fits into the Boston Edison district elements. The Commission has not been approving the replacement of wood windows with vinyl windows, particularly when the wood windows have muntins because muntins between the glass do not have the same appearance as exterior muntins.

I recommend the Commission deny the application, as the work does not meet "The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings" standard number 6, "Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence."



Front elevation





Rear elevation



Rear elevation