

**REVISED STAFF REPORT: JUNE 9, 2021 MEETING**

**PREPARED BY: J. ROSS**

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 21-7301**

**ADDRESS: 1427 SEYBURN**

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: WEST VILLAGE**

**APPLICANT: ASHLEY DAVIDSON**

**OWNER: ASHLEY DAVIDSON AND CARLO LIBURDI**

**DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: 5/17/2021**

**DATE OF STAFF VISIT: 6/2/2021**

**SCOPE OF WORK: ERECTION OF NEW GARAGE/MODIFICATION OF PREVIOUSLY-APPROVED DESIGN**

### **EXISTING CONDITIONS**

The building at 1427 Seyburn is a 2-story, single-family dwelling that was erected ca. 1910. The exterior walls are clad with brick at the first story and wood shake at the second story. The roof features a central hipped portion with projecting front-gabled bay at the primary elevation. Hipped-roof dormers top the roof. The 1/1 wood-sash, aluminum-clad windows were approved by HDC staff and installed in 2018. A partial width, brick porch with a flat roof is located at the front elevation. It is noted that the original wood Ionic porch columns were removed by a previous owner. A one-story wood porch with a pergola-type, open-roof at the building's rear elevation was erected in 2018. Please note that the Commission did approve the new rear porch.







## **PROPOSAL**

The applicant presented an extensive rehabilitation proposal to the Commission for review at the July 2018 regular meeting. The 2018 application included a proposal to erect a garage within the property's rear yard. Please see the attached staff report and drawings which indicates that the new garage would be erected according to the following description:

- At the rear yard, erect a new 2-car garage as per the attached plans and elevations. The exterior walls will be clad with vinyl siding with & faux vinyl shake in the gable ends. The color of the vinyl will match the house. The gable ends at the east and west elevation each includes a 1/1 vinyl window. The east elevation also includes a single person door while the west elevation includes two overhead garage doors. The building shall display a 27'x22' footprint and a 20' height. The garage will sit 42'-5 1/2" back from the house. The garage will include a full story on the ground floor with a 1/2 -story, loft space.

Staff recommended that the Commission approve the application as proposed. The Commission approved the project, to include the erection of the garage as per the submitted drawings.

With the current application, the property owners are seeking the Commission's approval to revise the garage design. Please see the submitted drawings and narrative. The new garage will be similar to the design which was approved in 2018 in that it proposes vinyl siding, vinyl windows, and a 29'-1/2" x 23' footprint. Specific differences between former/design approved by the Commission in 2018 and the new design include the following:

- The height is lowered from 1.5 stories to one story
- The double doors on the rear/alley-facing elevation were replaced with a single 18'-0"-wide door
- A French door and two vinyl awning windows were added to the east elevation
- A wood pergola and outdoor sink is proposed at the east elevation
- Skylights are proposed at the roof

## **STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH**

- Staff did listen to the 7/2018 meeting recording and noted that one Commissioner did comment on the fact that the felt that the east elevation appeared to be a bit plain and that the design could be improved by adding more windows. The applicant stated that he might consider doing so if his finances allowed.
- It is staff's opinion that the proposed revisions do not substantially deviate from the design which the Commission approved
- Due to its placement and scale, the garage will not be visible from the public right-of-way

## **ISSUES**

- Both the current and previous garage designs call for vinyl cladding and windows. Note, that the home has wood siding and wood, aluminum-clad windows
- Staff did recommend that the Commission approve the garage design in 2018 with no conditions as the project did not involve the demolition of an existing garage, the building is new, and the garage would not be visible from the public right-of-way. However, more recently, staff has taken to recommending against cladding new buildings with vinyl as we appreciate that vinyl siding does not adequately conform to the character of the city's historic districts, especially since it

deteriorates over time. The Commission has also followed suit and has routinely denied the installation of vinyl siding **and windows** on new garages **when they are associated with/sit within the parcel which includes a main/primary historic building.**

#### **RECOMMENDATION**

##### **Section 21-2-73, Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)**

It is staff's opinion that the proposal should qualify for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA). Staff therefore recommends that the Commission issue a COA for the proposed application because it meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and the West Village Elements of Design. However staff does recommend that the Commission issue the project a COA with the following conditions:

- The garage shall not be clad with vinyl siding and vinyl shingles (in the gable ends). Rather, the siding shall be wood lapped siding and wood shake/shingles or composite lapped siding and shingles. **Also, the building shall not have vinyl windows. Rather the windows shall be wood or aluminum-clad wood units.** The applicant shall provide the revised application to HDC staff for review and approval prior to the submission of the final CDs to the building department/issuance of the permit