

12/17/2024

NOTICE OF DENIAL

John McCarter
John McCarter Construction
475 Washington St
South Lyon, MI 48178

RE: Application Number HDC2024-00570; 751 Chicago; Boston-Edison Historic District
Scope: Replace Front Door and Transom

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on November 13, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic Districts Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on November 19, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

- ***Replace front door and transom***

The Commission's reasons for denial are:

- ***The historic leaded glass transom window and French doors are distinctive, character-defining features of the house, and their removal and replacement would substantially alter the appearance of the dwelling.***
- ***The applicant hasn’t substantiated that the doors and window are beyond repair, therefore replacement of these components should not be considered at this time.***
- ***Additionally, if replacement components are considered, Standard Six requires the new doors and window match the old in design, materiality, texture, and other visual qualities.***

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, specifically Standards:

(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

(5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

(6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable. Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL

399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General 2nd
Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
525 West Ottawa Street, P.O. Box 30754, Lansing, MI 48909 Phone:
517-335-0665 E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the For the Commission:



Daniel Rieden, Senior Clerk to the Historic District Commission

PSR:241211AD

DENIAL