

12/17/2024

NOTICE OF DENIAL

John Biggar
Studioz One, LLC
350 Madison
Detroit, MI 48226

RE: Application Number 2024-00666; 264 Watson; Brush Park Area Historic District

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on December 11, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic Districts Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on December 17, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

- ***Demolish the existing east/side porch***
- ***Install a new full-height, paneled wood door with oval vision within current opening***
- ***Install vinyl windows***

The Commission's reasons for denial are:

- ***The east side porch proposed for removal is a distinctive, character-defining feature of the property because it appears to date from the building’s original date of construction and displays significant ornamental features which are illustrative of the building’s vintage/period of construction and Queen Anne style.***
- ***The application does not provide documentation that shows that the distinctive character-defining east side porch is deteriorated beyond repair. Also, if the porch was shown to be deteriorated beyond repair the new porch the Standards require an exact replication. While the new porch appears to borrow design cues from the historic, it does not exactly replicate the existing.***
- ***The vinyl windows which were installed without COA are not appropriate for a house of this vintage for the following reasons:***
 - ***Vinyl windows offer a plasticity and flat/thick appearance that does not adequately match the profile/dimensionality and appearance of historic windows, such as wood.***
 - ***Consumer grade vinyl windows weather poorly, deteriorate rapidly, and exhibit poor detailing and detracting color/sheen.***
 - ***The framing material, glazing, and seals (which keeps the argon gas intact between the insulated glass) of vinyl windows break down more quickly in ultraviolet light than wood or steel-framed windows.***

- *Vinyl also lacks rigidity and can expand and contract more greatly than wood and steel. This can result in discoloration and warping of the vinyl frames, as well as condensation between the glass layers.*
- *The installation of the proposed vinyl windows does not follow NPS guidelines for new replacement windows, as the proposed windows are not “consistent with the general characteristics of a historic window of the type and period” which would have been originally present at the house.*

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, specifically Standards:

(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

(5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

(6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

(9). New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable. Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General 2nd
 Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
 525 West Ottawa Street, P.O. Box 30754, Lansing, MI 48909 Phone:
 517-335-0665 E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the For the Commission:



Daniel Rieden, Senior Clerk to the Historic District Commission

PSR:241217JR

DHDC 2024-00666

APPROVAL DOCUMENT – POST AT WORK LOCATION

CITY OF DETROIT
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 WOODWARD, SUITE 808
DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226

12/17/2024

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

John Biggar
Studioz One, LLC
350 Madison
Detroit, MI 48226

RE: Application Number 2024-00666; 264 Watson; Brush Park Area Historic District

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on December 11, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1) and Sections 21-2-73/21-2-78 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Certificate of Appropriateness (“COA”) for the following work, effective on December 17, 2024, as it meets the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

Roof

- **Install new asphalt shingles. Metal 1/2 -round gutters, and metal downspouts**
- **Retain and repair and paint existing brackets, soffits, and fascia**
- **At west side, install a new gabled-roof dormer, to be clad with cement fiber siding and include two, 1/1, single-hung wood windows**
- **At roof of flat-roof rear wing, erected enclosed stairway (clad with cement fiber siding) to lead from attic to roof. Erect a gabled roof canopy which shall shelter the stairs and a new deck with composite flooring. Wood railing, installed at the top of the parapet will enclose the canopy at the east and south sides**

Front Façade

- **Replace existing non-historic porch with a new hipped-roof porch with decorative wood brackets, turned wood posts, wood deck, and brick piers with wood lattice skirting**
- **Install a new front door at primary/north facade**

Rear Wall

- **Remove existing non-historic wood porch and masonry deck**
- **Install new wood porch steps with composite decking/flooring and wood handrails/guardrails**
- **Install two new wood panel doors and associated wood trim**

Site

- **Remove one mature tree from rear yard**
- **Install a 24”x24” concrete pad in rear yard**
- **Install a concrete patio (dimensions not specified) to the direct rear of the house**
- **Plant arborvitae along west property line**

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- **The new dormer proposed for installation at the west side roof display an eave overhang this is consistent with the existing homes in the district. HDC staff shall be afforded an opportunity to review the dormer plan details prior to the issuance of the project permit.**
- **The new front porch shall only extend the width of the current front porch/shall not wrap around the east side. The final permit documents shall be revised to reflect this condition.**
- **HDC staff shall be afforded an opportunity to approve the dimensions of the new rear yard patio prior to the issuance of the project permits.**
- **Documentation of the condition of the tree proposed for removal of the rear yard shall be provided to staff for review and approval**
- **A new design of the front door to include the incorporation of a transom shall be submitted to staff for review and approval.**

Please retain this COA for your files and post it at the subject property until work is complete. It is important to note that approval by the DHDC does not waive the applicant's responsibility to comply with any other applicable ordinances or statutes. If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Daniel Rieden
Detroit Historic District Commission

PSR:241213JR