

12/17/2024

NOTICE OF DENIAL

JMM Single Family Holdings LLC
24151 Telegraph Rd., Suite 220
Southfield, MI 48033

**RE: Application Number HDC2024-00625; 1670 Edison; Boston-Edison Historic District
Scope: Replace Wood Windows with Vinyl Windows, Install Vinyl Siding**

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on November 13, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic Districts Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on November 19, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

• Replace wood windows with vinyl windows, apply aluminum trim/wrap around windows; add vinyl siding on rear/north face of building; alter roof with new shingles, vinyl soffit panels, vinyl gutters, and vinyl downspouts; per the submitted application.

The Commission's reasons for denial are:

- The windows were historic, character-defining features that have not been shown to be beyond repair. • The replacement windows do not match the three-dimensional qualities and design of the historic windows in that they are thinner and lack subdivided upper sashes.***
- The replacement windows do not match the materials of the historic windows (they are vinyl, which has a noticeably different sheen and appearance from historic wood windows).***
- The added brickmold introduces an inappropriate element to the building.***
- The proposed work removes historic materials that have not been shown to be beyond repair.***
- The proposed work eliminates the important contrast of stucco and brick that was formerly present on this building and specifically highlighted in the Elements of Design.***
- The proposed work greatly alters the texture and appearance of the character-defining sun porch.***
- The loss of rafter ends and vergeboards eliminates distinctive features that formerly contributed to the character of the property.***
- The installation of vinyl soffit panels, gutters, and downspouts adds non-historic materials and incompatible new features to the building.***

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, specifically Standards:

(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

(5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

(6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable. Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399.211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General 2nd
Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
525 West Ottawa Street, P.O. Box 30754, Lansing, MI 48909 Phone:
517-335-0665 E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Daniel Rieden, Senior Clerk to the Historic District Commission

PSR:241211TB

DENIAL