

11/19/2024

NOTICE OF DENIAL

Ronald N Bennett
39905 Shelly Court
Clinton Twp, MI 48038

RE: Application Number HDC2024-00458; 4815 Fullerton; Russell Woods-Sullivan Historic District
Scope: Replace wood and vinyl windows with vinyl windows

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on November 13, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on November 19, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

Replace existing windows (wood and vinyl) with vinyl windows per the submitted application documents.

The Commission's reasons for denial are:

- ***The wood windows proposed for removal are historic and materials that contribute to the character of the property.***
- ***The wood windows proposed for removal have not been shown to be deteriorated beyond repair.***
- ***The proposed new windows are not compatible as they are not “consistent with the general characteristics of a historic window of the type and period” due to the fact that vinyl replacement windows have a noticeably thinner and flatter appearance and different sheen than historic windows than and they are made of a noticeably non-historic material.***

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, specifically Standards:

(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

(6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable. Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General 2nd

Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
525 West Ottawa Street, P.O. Box 30754, Lansing, MI 48909 Phone:
517-335-0665 E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the For the Commission:



Daniel Rieden
Senior Clerk to the Historic District Commission

PSR:241113TB

DENIAL