

11/19/2024

NOTICE OF DENIAL

Tarik Najib
Professional Consulting Company
16970 WEST WARREN
Detroit, MI 48228

RE: Application Number HDC2024-00434; 1624 Edison; Boston-Edison Historic District
Scope: Rehabilitate Dwelling and Garage

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on November 13, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on November 19, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

Dwelling:

- ***Replace historic wood 6/1 windows and wood casing/trim with new 6/1, aluminum clad wood double-hung windows and new trim***
- ***Install EIFS and cement fiber siding (with a faux wood grain finish) at exterior walls, porch and chimney***
- ***Install EIFS at exterior of chimney***
- ***Install new concrete steps and deck at front porch***
- ***Install new steel doors at rear, front, and side walls***
- ***At rear wall entrance, install new handrails and steps (materials not specified)***
- ***At roof, replace wood fascia***

Garage:

- ***Install EIFS at exterior walls***

The Commission's reasons for denial are:

- ***The wood windows and roof soffit/fascia that were removed without HDC approval do not appear to have been deteriorated beyond repair. Therefore, their removal does not meet the Standards***
- ***The new scored EIFS/faux stucco siding presents an expression of stucco which is not appropriate to the current residential setting/historic character of the dwelling and its nearby surrounds. Also, please note that EIFS is prone to moisture infiltration and is highly susceptible to impact damage. A siding of a more***

durable nature is more appropriate for use at this historic property.

- *The new cement fiber siding displays a faux wood grain which does not provide an adequate replication of painted historic wood (which would display a smooth surface).*
- *The current synthetic window trim EIFS clad fascia/soffits are wider and flatter than the historic wood window and roof trim.*
- *The cumulative effect of the work, to include the wide/flat window and roof trim (soffit/fascia), the EIFS and cement fiber siding, the massive, boxy, EIFS clad columns at the front porch, and the EIFS clad chimney, is a modern/suburban appearance which is wholly at odds with the property's historic character.*

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

(5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

(6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable. Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399.211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General 2nd
Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
525 West Ottawa Street, P.O. Box 30754, Lansing, MI 48909 Phone:
517-335-0665 E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the For the Commission:



Daniel Rieden
Senior Clerk to the Historic District Commission

PSR:241113JR