September 18, 2024

## **NOTICE OF DENIAL**

Leslie Yvette Wilson 15302 Piedmont Detroit MI 48223

RE: Application Number HDC2024-00424; 15302 Piedmont; Rosedale Park Historic

**District** 

**Project Scope: Replace windows** 

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on September 11, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission ("DHDC") reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on September 18, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the district's Elements of Design:

## Replace wood windows per the submitted documents, drawings, and product data.

The Commission's reason for the denial is that:

- The front 8-over-12 cottage windows, diamond paned leaded glass window, and south side 6-over-6 double-hung window are character-defining features and the applicant has not provided information to support the windows are beyond repair. Therefore, a replacement product should not be considered at this time without proper documentation.
- The Standards require that historic windows be repaired, and only when they are deteriorated beyond repair, should replacement windows be considered. Furthermore, replacement units must match the design, dimension and operation of the historic windows.
  - o The change of the 8-over-12 cottage-style windows to 12-over-1 double-hung window would alter features that characterize the property.
  - o Grilles between the glass do not match the dimensionality of the existing true divided light windows.
- The wood brickmould offers a dimensionality, profile and finish that can not be replicated with coil stock.
- The stone white color is not appropriate for the house's minimally traditional English Revival design.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards or Elements:

2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
- 6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building 525 West Ottawa Street P.O. Box 30754 Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665

E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:

Audra Dye

**Detroit Historic District Commission**