

7/17/2024

**NOTICE OF DENIAL**

Lauren Kalman  
2285 Longfellow  
Detroit, MI

**RE: Application Number 24-00227; 2285 Longfellow; Boston Edison Historic District  
Project Scope: Install new synthetic cladding**

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on July 10, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on July 17, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

- Install new vinyl or aluminum at fascia, soffit area, or window/door trim; Install vinyl , aluminum, or fiber cement siding at dormers and rear elevation gable end per the submitted documents

The reasons for the denial are the following:

- The aluminum which current exists is not compatible with the building’s historic appearance as it does not adequately approximate historic wood siding, fascia, window/door trim, and/or soffits. Specifically, aluminum is prone to scratching and dents, has a tendency to fade, and presents a regular, machined appearance versus the appearance of traditional wood siding. Therefore, any proposed installation of new aluminum to replace the existing would not meet the Standards. Similarly, the installation of vinyl at these locations would be incompatible with the house’s historic character.
- The original wood eaves and fascia likely remain beneath the current aluminum wrapping. If the current aluminum wrapping is to be removed, any remaining historic wood soffits, fascia, brackets, and window/door trim should be retained and repaired with new wood to match the existing where deteriorated. If these original elements do not remain beneath the existing aluminum wrapping or are deteriorated beyond repair, new wood soffits, fascia, and window/door trim which are compatible to the building’s historic appearance should be installed. The addition of new vinyl or aluminum to these areas as these materials would be incompatible with the building’s historic character
- The proposed installation of vinyl or fiber cement shake siding products to the rear dormer, rear enclosed porch walls, and dormer sidewalls is inappropriate because the materials:
  - Present a regular, machined/modern appearance, versus the irregular, naturally varied appearance which cedar shake offers
  - Present an unnatural wood grain versus the smooth surface that painted wood shake displays
  - Are thinner than a typical wood shake and therefore do not provide the profile, shadow, and depth of a typical cedar shake

- Typically wall corners are finished with trim boards/are not mitered as is common for wood shake installations

Therefore, the work does conform to the district's elements of design, nor does it meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular, Standards# 2, 5, and 6, which state that:

*#2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

*#5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.*

*#6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence*

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General  
2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building  
525 West Ottawa Street  
P.O. Box 30754  
Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665  
E-mail: [stuckeyj@michigan.gov](mailto:stuckeyj@michigan.gov)

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or [hdc@detroitmi.gov](mailto:hdc@detroitmi.gov).

For the Commission:



Jennifer Ross  
Detroit Historic District Commission