

July 17, 2024

NOTICE OF DENIAL

Jonathan Taylor
2310 Edison
Detroit MI 48206

**RE: Application Number HDC2024-00229; 2310 Edison; Boston-Edison Historic District
Project Scope: Replace Windows**

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on July 10, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on July 17, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

Replace wood windows with vinyl windows per the submitted documents, photographs and other presentation materials.

The Commission’s reason for the denial is that:

- ***The Standards require that historic windows be repaired; and only when they are deteriorated beyond repair, can replacement windows be considered. The wood windows that were removed are repairable and could be reinstalled within their respective window openings.***
- ***Regarding the installed replacement windows, it is staff’s opinion, through limits of fabrication and material, vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic districts as they do not match the details of historic windows.***
 - ***Vinyl windows and wrapped brickmould offer a plasticity and flat/thick appearance that does not adequately match the profile/dimensionality and appearance of historic windows, such as wood.***
 - ***Consumer grade vinyl windows weather poorly, deteriorate rapidly, and exhibit poor detailing and detracting color/sheen.***
 - ***The framing material, glazing, and seals (which keeps the argon gas intact between the insulated glass) of vinyl windows break down more quickly in ultraviolet light than wood or steel-framed windows.***
 - ***Vinyl also lacks rigidity and can expand and contract more greatly than wood and steel. This can result in discoloration and warping of the vinyl frames, as well as condensation between the glass layers.***
 - ***The installation of the proposed vinyl windows does not follow NPS guidelines for new replacement windows, as the proposed windows are not “consistent with the general characteristics of a historic window of the type and period”, and are not “compatible with the overall historic character of the building”.***

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards or Elements:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General
2nd Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
525 West Ottawa Street
P.O. Box 30754
Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665
E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Audra Dye
Detroit Historic District Commission