

July 17, 2024

**NOTICE OF DENIAL**

Merisa Lewis  
Rentify LLC  
95 E Euclid Street, Apt. 203  
Detroit MI 48202

**RE: Application Number HDC2024-00266; 1651 Edison; Boston-Edison Historic District  
Project Scope: Replace windows, alter exterior**

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on July 10, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on July 17, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

***Replace windows and alter exterior per the submitted documents, drawings, and other submitted materials.***

The Commission’s reason for the denial is that:

- ***The existing windows are distinctive character-defining features and determined that the windows are in repairable condition, as the deterioration is mostly comprised of broken/missing glass, missing ropes and other hardware, and generalized aging/peeling paint. It appears there are only a handful of openings out of the 45 openings (excluding basement window openings) within the house that are entirely missing or missing a top or bottom sash. New wood windows and upper or lower frames can be fabricated to address the missing or partially missing units and would allow the new windows to closely match the historic windows in operation, dimension, profile, material and finish, as well as placement within the window openings.***
- ***The existing wooden beadboard eaves and soffits are character-defining features and in repairable condition, with peeling paint and the occasional deteriorated/missing board. The installation of a manufactured product such as the proposed Hardie Soffit, would alter the profile and surface texture of the soffits, altering the appearance and architectural design of the house.***
- ***The front porch is a distinctive character-defining feature. The shallow-pitch roof and overhanging eaves allow the tall, profiled fascia to be a dominate detail and accentuates the wide expanse between the corner columns, creating a strong horizontal massing to the porch. The historic front porch roof structure was removed between June 2019 and July 2022. The Standards require that this component be rebuilt to match the historic feature that was removed without HDC approval. The massing and profile of the newly built roof structure is similar to the historic design, but it appears to be sagging. Installing a wood post (current condition) or erecting a masonry column (proposed condition) is not an***

*appropriate action.*

- *The applicant must submit a detailed scope of work and dimensioned drawings to staff for review that rectify the following front porch conditions: the sagging roof, to show how the fascia will be modified (or rebuilt) to match the historic condition, and that the existing wing walls will be repaired to their historic height by adding courses of brick that were lost as well as cast concrete caps.*
- *The profiles of the brick mould at the window and door openings and porch fascia are character-defining features of the house and must be retained and repaired. Wrapping and therefore covering these areas is not appropriate as the detailed profiles will be lost.*
- *True wood siding or stucco will be specified for the walls of the historic-age extension as an artificial cementitious finish nor raised grain finish are appropriate for this historic location.*
- *The submitted vinyl railing for the rear porches is not compatible with an early 20<sup>th</sup> century dwelling.*

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards or Elements:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*
- 9) *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General  
2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building  
525 West Ottawa Street  
P.O. Box 30754  
Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665

E-mail: [stuckeyj@michigan.gov](mailto:stuckeyj@michigan.gov)

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or [hdc@detroitmi.gov](mailto:hdc@detroitmi.gov).

For the Commission:



Audra Dye  
Detroit Historic District Commission

# HDC2024-00266

## APPROVAL DOCUMENT – POST AT WORK LOCATION

CITY OF DETROIT  
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 WOODWARD, SUITE 808  
DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226

Merisa Lewis  
Rentify LLC  
95 E Euclid Street, Apt. 203  
Detroit MI 48202

**RE: Application Number HDC2024-00266; 1651 Edison; Boston-Edison Historic District  
Project Scope: Replace windows, alter exterior**

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on July 10, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1) and Sections 21-2-73/21-2-78 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Certificate of Appropriateness (“COA”) for the following work, effective on July 17, 2024, as it meets the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

***Alter exterior and install rear yard fence per the submitted documents, drawings, and other submitted materials.***

***With the conditions that:***

- Exterior color palette will be submitted for staff review and shall include: paint color for wood components on house, including side door; finish color(s) for the entry and rear doors; gutters/downspouts; and paint color for rear yard fence.
- Bricks needed for masonry repair and replacement must have a similar vertical cut texture, color, finish and dimension. New mortar joints will match the existing mortar composition (no pre-mixed off the shelf mortar shall be used), dimension, and joint profile. The front porch wing walls will be rebuilt to match the historic height and cast stone caps will be used to top the rebuilt wing walls.
- A wood railing that is compatible with the overall historic character of the building and era of construction will be selected. A dimensioned drawing of a new railing design that includes specification of wood and painted finish (incl. color) material and finishes, must be submitted for staff review.
- The new door proposed at the side entrance will have a horizontal panel pattern. A cut-sheet will be submitted for staff review.
- The rear extension will have an applied stucco finish, per the recently submitted drawing. Finish pattern and color must match the stucco on the existing historic extensions on the east and west sides of the house.
- All future drawings must accurately reflect existing conditions, the applicant’s proposed scope of work and selected materials and drawn correctly at a larger scale so applied details and trim can be included and clearly delineated.

Please retain this COA for your files and post it at the subject property until work is complete. It is important to note that approval by the DHDC does not waive the applicant's responsibility to comply with any other applicable ordinances or statutes. If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or [hdc@detroitmi.gov](mailto:hdc@detroitmi.gov).

For the Commission:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Audra Dye".

Audra Dye  
Detroit Historic District Commission

COA