

December 21, 2023

NOTICE OF DENIAL

Ranjit Verghese
SI Building, LLC
6000 Dixie Highway
Clarkston, MI 48346

RE: Application HDC2023-00139; 19245 Parkside; Sherwood Forest Historic District
Project Scope: Replace original windows with vinyl windows*, rehabilitate exterior
***Work completed without approval**

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on December 13, 2023, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on December 20, 2023, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

Replace original windows with vinyl windows and remove downspout collector box and bracket, per the submitted documents, and photographs, and product data.

Excepting the following items from denial:

Work items to rehabilitate exterior of dwelling per the submitted documents, photographs, and product data.

- Replacement of steel downspouts and gutters with 4-inch aluminum gutters/downspouts, color: black,
- Replacement of fire-damaged windows in opening #8
- Tuckpointing front porch and façade,
- Scrape, caulk, and paint all bond board, soffits, and fascia; color: black,
- Replace entry door,
- Sand and paint existing black trim and shutters,
- Clean up existing original copper awnings,
- Replace two front exterior lights, and
- Trim bushes and clean beds.

With the conditions that:

- The replacement windows for opening #8 will sufficiently replicate the aesthetic and physical characteristics of the original window as determined by staff.
- The applicant will submit the finish method for the door (stain or paint) and color to HDC staff for review prior to application.

The Commission’s reason for the denial is that:

- ***The collector box and downspout bracket, and steel-framed casement and transom windows, are distinctive character-defining features. These components were commonly used on traditional and mid-century buildings in the early to mid-20th century and help identify the era of the house’s construction.***
- ***The collector box/bracket and windows were removed without Historic District Commission approval. Therefore, based on the Standards, new windows and a collector box and downspout bracket should be reinstalled and should match all the details of the historic components that were removed.***
- ***The uniformity of the window openings on each floor and elevation is an important architectural component of the dwelling. The selected double-hung white vinyl windows in no way emulate the***

historic windows in operation, dimensionality, pattern, color, and material. Replacement windows and aluminum brickmold will not offer the same dimensionality and placement.

- *Through limits of fabrication and material, vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic districts.*
 - *Vinyl windows and wrapped brickmould offer a plasticity and flat/thick appearance that does not adequately match the profile/dimensionality and appearance of historic windows, such as wood.*
 - *Consumer grade vinyl windows weather poorly, deteriorate rapidly, and exhibit poor detailing and detracting color/sheen.*
 - *The framing material, glazing, and seals (which keeps the argon gas intact between the insulated glass) of vinyl windows break down more quickly in ultraviolet light than wood or steel-framed windows.*
 - *Vinyl lacks rigidity and can expand and contract more greatly than wood and steel. This can result in discoloration and warping of the vinyl frames, as well as condensation between the glass layers.*
 - *The installation of vinyl windows does not follow NPS guidelines for new replacement windows - the proposed windows are not “consistent with the general characteristics of a historic window of the type and period”, nor “compatible with the overall historic character of the building”.*

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, specifically Standards:

- Standard 2)** *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- Standard 5)** *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- Standard 6)** *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General
2nd Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
525 West Ottawa Street
P.O. Box 30754
Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665
E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Audra Dye
Detroit Historic District Commission

HDC2023-00139

APPROVAL DOCUMENT – POST AT WORK LOCATION

CITY OF DETROIT
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 WOODWARD, SUITE 808
DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226

December 21, 2023

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Ranjit Verghese
SI Building, LLC
6000 Dixie Highway
Clarkston, MI 48346

**RE: Application HDC2023-00139; 19245 Parkside; Sherwood Forest Historic District
Project Scope: Rehabilitate exterior**

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on December 13, 2023, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1) and Sections 21-2-73/21-2-78 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Certificate of Appropriateness (“COA”) for the following work, effective on December 20, 2023, as it meets the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

Rehabilitate exterior of dwelling per the submitted documents, photographs, and product data.

- ***Replacement of steel downspouts and gutters with 4-inch aluminum gutters/downspouts, color: black,***
- ***Replacement of fire-damaged windows in opening #8***
- ***Tuckpointing front porch and façade,***
- ***Scrape, caulk, and paint all bond board, soffits, and fascia; color: black,***
- ***Replace entry door,***
- ***Sand and paint existing black trim and shutters,***
- ***Clean up existing original copper awnings,***
- ***Replace two front exterior lights, and***
- ***Trim bushes and clean beds.***

With the conditions that:

- ***The replacement windows for opening #8 will sufficiently replicate the aesthetic and physical characteristics of the original window as determined by staff.***
- ***The applicant will submit the finish method for the door (stain or paint) and color to HDC staff for review prior to application.***

Please retain this COA for your files and post it at the subject property until work is complete. It is important to note that approval by the DHDC does not waive the applicant's responsibility to comply with any other applicable ordinances or statutes. If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Audra Dye
Detroit Historic District Commission