

11/14/2023

NOTICE OF DENIAL

Luis Rajnar
LMHARAS LLC
16212 San Juan Dr.
Detroit MI 48221

RE: Application Number HDC2023-00073; 13320 Broadstreet; Russell Woods-Sullivan Historic District

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on November 8, 2023, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on November 14, 2023, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

- ***Replacement of original chimney with new chimney that lacks brick, limestone, and coping detailing.***
- ***Replacement of original fascia with wood fascia that lacks wing-tip detailing.***
- ***Installation of aluminum clad over the wood fascia or wood soffits.***
- ***Removal of wood “belly band” siding between the first and second floors.***
- ***Removal of brick wall extension at the front façade.***
- ***Removal of the historically dimensioned wood framing of windows on the second floor and the removal of the stone sills of the windows on the first floor.***
- ***The replacement of the 4 front bay casement wood windows with true-divided lights with 3 double-hung, 1/1 windows.***
- ***Removal of front door archway with brick and stone detailing.***
- ***Removal of front balcony railing and installation of wood railing on front porch.***
- ***Installation of a new window opening in the front gable of the garage.***

The Commission's reasons for denial are:

- Distinctive, historic character-defining features have been altered or destroyed, including but not limited to the following:
 - Brick chimney with brick, coping and limestone detailing.
 - Wood fascia/soffits with wing-tip detailing
 - Wood, “belly band” siding between the first and second floor
 - Brick wall extension at the front façade
 - Historically dimensioned wood framing of windows on the second floor
 - Stone sills where windows are surrounded by brick cladding on the first floor.
 - Front bay wood casements with true divided light and the front second floor wood double-hung window with 8/8 true divided light with wood shutters
 - Front arched doorway with brick and stone detailing, with a solid wood, round top front door

- The matching garage materials and design with the main house
 - Front balcony metal railing
- The above features were critical to the building and district's historic character, and their removal and replacement with the proposed alterations will drastically alter the appearance and features of the structure and district.
 - The introduction of new materials, garage window opening, and the omission of other distinct, character-defining elements, further erases the historic features of this home. The apparent result of the proposed work reduces the architectural character, which is substantially at odds with the intent and purpose of historic designation.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable. Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399.211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General
 2nd Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
 525 West Ottawa Street, P.O. Box 30754, Lansing, MI 48909
 Phone: 517-335-0665 E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Daniel Rieden
 Staff, Detroit Historic District Commission

HDC2023-00073

APPROVAL DOCUMENT – POST AT WORK LOCATION

CITY OF DETROIT
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 WOODWARD, SUITE 808
DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226

11/14/2023

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Luis Rajnar
LMHARAS LLC
16212 San Juan Dr.
Detroit MI 48221

RE: Application Number HDC2023-00073; 13320 Broadstreet; Russell Woods-Sullivan Historic District

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on November 8, 2023, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1) and Sections 21-2-73/21-2-78 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Certificate of Appropriateness (“COA”) for the following work, effective on November 14, 2023, as it meets the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

- *Repair roof and replace asphalt shingles*
- *Rebuild wood soffits with wood soffits, wood fascia with wood fascia, paint*
- *Install aluminum gutters and downspouts*
- *Rebuild chimney*
- *Install cedar shake siding to the house and garage*
- *Install brick cladding to the house and garage*
- *The removal of the side door, with brick wall.*
- *Removal of the non-historic, attic window in the front facing gable of the house*
- *Installation of the single double-hung aluminum clad window at the front second-floor façade with shutters.*
- *Removal of non-historic window openings per the attached drawings.*
- *Installation of the front door.*
- *Installation of Sierra Pacific’s “Westchester” series double-hung, aluminum-clad wood windows, except for the bay windows*
- *Installation of glass block basement windows*
- *Installation of rear and balcony steel doors.*
- *Removal of non-historic front deck and restoration of front porch with tuckpointing and repair of concrete surface.*
- *Install metal railing at front balcony.*
- *Install rear wood deck and balcony.*
- *Replace 6’ chain link fence with a 6’ chain link fence.*
- *Repair concrete driveway and walkway with concrete, no changes to the dimensions.*
- *Removal of bushes and debris around the immediate area of the house.*

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- *The wood fascia and soffits are not covered with aluminum cladding, but instead painted a solid color.*
- *An appropriate color selected for the gutters and downspouts.*
- *Detail drawings of the proposed chimney including the use of brick, limestone and stone coping that closely matches the historic chimney's scale, location, design and materials.*
- *The cedar shake shall be applied to accommodate a wood, "belly band" as depicted in the historic designation photo.*
- *The applicant updates the drawings to show how the brick cladding allows for stone sills on the first-floor window openings.*
- *The applicant updates the drawings to show how the brick cladding includes the reconstruction of the front façade wing wall as depicted in the designation photo.*
- *The front single, double-hung, aluminum clad window at the front second floor has 8/8 true- or simulated divided light as shown in the designation slide. The surrounding shutters are painted wood.*
- *The front door is solid wood material.*
- *The applicant provides window installation drawings that show historic wood framing dimensions of the upper floor and stone sill in the first-floor locations.*
- *The applicant updates the drawing to show the removal of railing on top of front porch wing walls and restoration of the wall surface coping.*
- *The applicant provides HDC staff with dimensions and detail design of the front balcony metal railing.*
- *The applicant provides HDC staff with a paint or solid stain colors for the above work using Color System D from the HDC Color Guide.*
- *The applicant provides HDC staff with updated drawings to review the above items before execution.*

Please retain this COA for your files and post it at the subject property until work is complete. It is important to note that approval by the DHDC does not waive the applicant's responsibility to comply with any other applicable ordinances or statutes. If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Daniel Rieden
Staff, Detroit Historic District Commission