

October 18, 2023

NOTICE OF DENIAL

Michael Eisenberg
3747 Tyler
Detroit MI 48238

**RE: Application Number HDC2023-00053; 3747 Tyler; Russell Woods-Sullivan Historic District
Project Scope: Remove original windows*, install wood windows
*Work completed without approval**

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on October 11, 2023, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on October 17, 2023, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

Installation of Jeld-Wen W-2500 aluminum-clad wood windows in the window openings of each elevation to replace previously installed vinyl windows; rear elevation door openings were filled with double-hung windows and wall panels, and a two-story open wood porch proposed at the rear elevation where a two-story porch had been removed, per the submitted documents, drawings, and photographs.

The Commission’s reason for the denial is that:

- ***The existing vinyl windows do not match the original windows in materiality, dimensionality, operation, decorative features, and color. The existing and proposed windows, in addition to the rear elevation door removal/window installation, destroyed distinctive character-defining features and substantially altered the appearance of the building. Therefore, this proposal to replace the existing vinyl units with aluminum-clad wood units that will match the operation, design and color of the existing windows does not improve the historic and architectural design of this property.***
- ***All the windows were removed without Historic District Commission approval. Therefore, based on the Standards, new windows should match all the details of the historic windows that were removed.***
- ***The uniformity and relationship between the window openings on each floor and each elevation is an important architectural component of the dwelling. Picture windows and sliding windows are contemporary window designs. The wide expanse of plate glass creates a negative void on an elevation, and sliding windows require horizontally placed uneven planes of glass. These window styles disrupt the traditional uniformity of this house’s architectural design and features.***
- ***The submitted drawings for the rear porch do not offer clarity of dimensions, design, and finish for this two-story element. Additionally, the applicant proposes to retain windows within the door openings leading to the porch. This is not an appropriate solution for these openings; doors should be reintroduced to the door openings as part of the porch design.***

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards or Elements:

Standard 1 A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

Standard 2 The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Standard 5 Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

Standard 6 Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General
2nd Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
525 West Ottawa Street
P.O. Box 30754
Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665
E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Audra Dye
Detroit Historic District Commission