

October 19, 2023

NOTICE OF DENIAL

Brett Mahaffey
Renewal by Anderson
37720 Amrhein
Livonia MI 48150

**RE: Application Number HDC2023-00055; 9120 Dwight; Berry Subdivision Historic District
Project Scope: Install composite wood windows**

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on October 11, 2023, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on October 17, 2023, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

Replacement of ten (10) wood double-hung windows with composite windows, per the submitted documents and presentation materials.

Excepting the following items from denial:

Replacement of three non-historic fixed windows and sliding door at rear elevation per the submitted documents presentation materials.

The Commission’s reason for the denial is that:

- ***The historic wood windows appear to be intact and in solid, repairable condition. Visual and physical information substantiating the windows are beyond repair was not submitted.***
- ***The six-over-six and four-over-four true divided-light double-hung windows are distinctive character-defining feature. The multi-pane glazing in both sashes is a common design of early 20th century colonial revival houses. The dimensionality of the historic windows is highly visible from the street and offers a depth and visual weight that is equal to the abundant exterior detailing on the house.***
- ***The proposed replacement windows specify between-the-glass grilles with a patterned upper sash, like the existing replacement windows. The flat, diminished appearance of this type of grille pattern, in conjunction with a clear glass lower sash, would alter the features of the windows and appearance of the dwelling.***

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, specifically Standards or Elements:
Standard 2 The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Standard 5 Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

Standard 6 Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General
2nd Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
525 West Ottawa Street
P.O. Box 30754
Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665

E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Audra Dye
Detroit Historic District Commission

HDC2023-00055

APPROVAL DOCUMENT – POST AT WORK LOCATION

CITY OF DETROIT
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 WOODWARD, SUITE 808
DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226

October 19, 2023

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Brett Mahaffey
Renewal by Anderson
37720 Amrhein
Livonia MI 48150

**RE: Application Number HDC2023-00055; 9120 Dwight; Berry Subdivision Historic District
Project Scope: Install composite wood windows**

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on October 11, 2023, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1) and Sections 21-2-73/21-2-78 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Certificate of Appropriateness (“COA”) for the following work, effective on October 17, 2023, as it meets the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

Replacement of three non-historic fixed windows and sliding door at rear elevation, per the submitted documents presentation materials.

With the conditions that:

- ***A dimensioned drawing that clearly shows how the reverse cottage-style window will look within the newly sized opening, as well as clarification over the exterior detailing of the lower wall, will be submitted to staff for review.***
- ***Should staff determine the reverse cottage-style window is not appropriate for these windows openings, a standard double-hung window (no grid pattern in the upper or lower sash) will be selected.***

Please retain this COA for your files and post it at the subject property until work is complete. It is important to note that approval by the DHDC does not waive the applicant's responsibility to comply with any other applicable ordinances or statutes. If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Audra Dye
Detroit Historic District Commission