

DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

Date: May 10, 2023

Coleman A. Young Municipal Center, 13th Floor, Erma Henderson Auditorium

AGENDA (Actual time [audio recording time stamp])

I CALL TO ORDER (5:33 p.m. [00:03:00])

Chairperson Franklin called the meeting to order at 5:33 p.m.

II ROLL CALL (5:35 p.m. [00:04:30])

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION		PRESENT	ABSENT
Najahyia Chinchilla	Commissioner	X	
Tiffany Franklin	Chair	X	
James Hamilton	Commissioner	X	
Roderick Hardamon	Commissioner		X
Richard Hosey	Commissioner		X
Alan Machielse	Vice Chair		X
Adrea Simmons	Commissioner	X	
STAFF			
Timothy Boscarino	PDD	X	
Benjamin Buckley	PDD	X	
Audra Dye	PDD	X	
Garrick Landsberg (Director)	PDD	X	
Daniel Rieden	PDD		X
Jennifer Ross	PDD	X	

III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA (05:05 p.m. [00:05:00])

ACTION (5:05 p.m. [00:05:15])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that the agenda be approved.

Commissioner Chinchilla: SUPPORT

- Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE
- Commissioner Franklin: AYE
- Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
- Commissioner Hardamon: not present
- Commissioner Hosey: not present
- Commissioner Machielse: not present
- Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES (5:36 p.m. [00:06:00])

ACTION (5:36 p.m. [00:06:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that the April 2023 regular meeting minutes be approved.

Commissioner Simmons: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: not present
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Simmons: AYE
Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

V REPORTS (5:36 p.m. [00:06:30])

Director Landsberg noted that Taylor Leonard of the Law Department is present for the meeting but would be leaving City of Detroit employment after next week.

Director Landsberg noted that the Law Department is looking for up to 2-3 commissioners, including a licensed architect, to assist the Law Department in a discussion with a potential applicant.

VI APPROVAL OF APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO CONSENT AGENDA (5:37 p.m. [00:07:45])

None

VII POSTPONED APPLICATIONS (5:38 p.m. [00:08:00])

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8272, 23-8297, and 23-8298 (5:38 p.m. [00:08:15])

ADDRESS: 3606 Lincoln, 3618 Lincoln, and 1352 Brainard

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Woodbridge Farm

APPLICANT: Carlo Liburdi, Studio BD Architects

OWNER: Detroit Land Bank Authority

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect multi-family development

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Alex Periera, the developer, described additional information provided since last month's meeting. The developer also described a meeting with neighborhood residents in which the proposed materials were discussed. Bay windows were added to the proposed design in response to concerns expressed at the meeting.

The developer distributed material samples among the Commission. Alex Periera showed renderings of an optional material submitted as an alternative to the sandstone panels.

Staff noted an additional letter, generally not supportive of the proposal, was recently received and posted on the website.

Commissioner Franklin asked if any members of the public wished to speak.

Amy McLaughlin, resident of the neighborhood and vice president of the Woodbridge Citizens Council, stated that there was still opposition to the look, design, and site plan of the proposal. Amy McLaughlin stated that the bay window was not specifically requested; the request was for an architectural element that would break up the flat plane of the façade.

Commissioner Hosey arrived at 5:45.

Lori Champagne, who lives across the street from the proposed development, expressed that the proposed development does not fit with the historic beauty of the neighborhood.

Commissioner Chinchilla asked Amy McLaughlin to elaborate on site plan concerns. Amy McLaughlin stated that the setback was not consistent with other buildings in the area. The speaker also expressed opposition to too many impervious surfaces due to water and sewage concerns.

Alex Periera stated that the front setback was six feet, and that it was suggested by the preliminary plan review process to match an adjoining multifamily building with the same setback.

Commissioner Chinchilla expressed support of the bay window and suggested that the landscape plan should be consistent with the renderings. Commissioner Chinchilla also encouraged the developer to use permeable paving materials. The commissioner also expressed concern about the color selection, depending on which materials were chosen.

Director Landsberg and Commissioner Franklin reminded the Commission that review should be limited to historic appropriateness.

Commissioners Hamilton and Franklin expressed that the sandstone cladding material looks too much like concrete blocks and that the alternative “opal” material was an improvement.

ACTION (6:02 p.m. [00:31:30])

Commissioner Chinchilla moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8272, 8297 & 8298 for 3606 and 3618 Lincoln and 1352 Brainard**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve any alternate exterior cladding outside of the proposed Nichiha brand fiber cement panel that is proposed in the rendering with the horizontal orientation of both the upper and lower materiality and the two wood materials presented and the opal material presented for the base portion as well as the brick. Staff will be able to approve that the new siding is consistent with the nearby historic-age buildings; the work item will be forwarded to the Commission for review at a regular meeting.
- Staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the window specifications prior to the issuance of the project’s permit and/or installation. If staff determines that the quality is inconsistent with the character of the nearby historic-age buildings, the work item will be forwarded to the Commission for review at a regular meeting. This will include the bay windows that are proposed in the rendering as well.

- Staff will be afforded an opportunity to review a landscape plan consistent with the renderings.

Commissioner Simmons: SUPPORT

Commissioner Hamilton expressed that the approval should refer to the specific material samples provided before the Commission presently, not alternative materials presented to staff at a later time,

Staff and the applicant clarified that the proposal is for Novenary Series Opal on the lower portion of the façade and the Vintage Wood Redwood on the upper portion, with common brick at the base.

Commissioner Chinchilla amended the motion to replace the first condition with the following:

- The exterior materiality will include the Nichiha Vintage Wood Redwood wood series on the upper portion of the development and the Nichiha Novenary Opal material on the lower portion of the property as shown in a horizontal orientation for both products.

Staff asked for more clarification regarding what the Commission expects in the landscaping.

Alex Periera expressed that the rendering reflects the applicant's intent. Several commissioners noted that there was no submitted landscape plan other than the rendering.

Commissioner Chinchilla amended the motion to replace the third condition with the following:

- The Commission will require a landscape plan for staff approval with the anticipation that it will be consistent with renderings provided.

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: not present

Commissioner Hosey: AYE

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS)

(6:11 p.m. [00:41:30])

None

IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (6:11 p.m. [00:41:30])

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8325 (6:12 p.m. [00:42:00])

ADDRESS: 2998 Iroquois

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Indian Village

APPLICANT: Pat and Lana Murphy, Murphy Family Trust

OWNER: Pat and Lana Murphy, Murphy Family Trust

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect house

Director Landsberg summarized the proposal and the decision before the Commission, including the application of the Elements of Design and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Robert Clarke, the architect and applicant, discussed some adjustments to the proposed design made to address staff concerns.

Chairperson Franklin noted that there are two letters commenting on this proposal posted on the website.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Maureen Kerns, a resident of the district and on the Board of Directors of HIVA, expressed the opinion that the rooflines, window size, roof slopes and dormers, the size of the house and its details, the cottage style of the windows, the loss of the elm tree, the attached garage and its orientation, the presence of basement egress windows, the placement of the walkway, and the selection of materials for the proposed building are not consistent with the neighborhood and the Elements of Design.

William Worden, a resident of the district, stated that he is an experienced historic preservation professional and believes that the massing of the center section and wings is not appropriate; however, the proposed artificial siding is acceptable. William Worden also stated that the windows should be more consistent with other windows in Indian Village and the garage is also a concern.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Commissioner Franklin asked about the condition of the tree and why it was proposed for removal. The applicant stated it was to be removed to provide access to the garage. The age of the tree is not known.

Commissioner Hamilton noted that the application also includes a sketch of a potential alternative. Commissioner Hamilton and the applicant agreed that the alternative sketch addressed some of the staff concerns and was an improvement.

Commissioner Hosey suggested that the applicant would benefit from additional time to prepare complete drawings based on the alternative sketch.

Commissioners Franklin and Hosey suggested that the elm tree is an important feature and a landscape plan would be helpful.

Commissioner Chinchilla expressed concerns about the massing and windows.

Commissioner Franklin commented on the quality of the materials.

Director Landsberg noted that the tree is an American Elm, a significant species, and that it could be saved if the orientation of the garage was changed.

ACTION (6:50 p.m. [01:20:30])

Commissioner Hosey moved to table the application.

Commissioner Chinchilla: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: not present
Commissioner Hosey: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Simmons: AYE
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8326 (6:51 p.m. [01:21:30])

ADDRESS: 7840 Van Dyke Place

HISTORIC DISTRICT: West Village

APPLICANT: Amy Haimerl and Karl Royden Kaebnick

OWNER: Amy Haimerl and Karl Royden Kaebnick

SCOPE OF WORK: Demolish garage, replace dormer siding

Staff summarized the proposal and the property's history of prior work. Staff expressed the opinion that the garage had lost its historic integrity.

Amy Haimerl and Karl Kaebnick, the applicants, described the proposed work for the house and garage, including work previously done without approval. The applicants stated that they intend to rebuild the garage with the same footprint and appearance.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

ACTION (6:59 p.m. [01:29:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8326 for 7840 Van Dyke Place** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hosey: SUPPORT

Commissioners and staff discussed the appropriateness of unpainted cedar shakes with respect to the architectural style of the house.

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: not present
Commissioner Hosey: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Simmons: AYE
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8328 (7:05 p.m. [01:35:00])

ADDRESS: 7938 E. Lafayette

HISTORIC DISTRICT: West Village

APPLICANT: Christine Pagac

OWNER: Christine Pagac

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect garage

Staff summarized the proposal.

Christine Pagac, the applicant, described the proposed work and stated that cementitious siding would increase the cost of the project by twenty-five percent. The applicant stated that the garage would not be readily visible from nearby streets and noted that an adjacent house has vinyl siding.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Commissioner Franklin asked if a garage existed at the location previously. Staff responded that a garage once existed and it is not known when it was demolished.

Commissioners and staff discussed the appropriateness of vinyl siding.

ACTION (7:20 p.m. [1:50:30])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8328 for 7938 E. Lafayette** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Wood or cementitious siding will be selected for the exterior walls. Paint color will be submitted for staff review.
- Catalog cuts confirming the design, material, and finish color for the overhead and pedestrian doors will be submitted for staff review.
- Drawings will be amended as needed prior to submitting the permit application to BSEED.

Commissioner Simmons: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: not present

Commissioner Hosey: AYE

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

X CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING 7:22 p.m. [01:52:30])

None

XI PUBLIC COMMENT (7:22 p.m. [01:52:30])

None

XII APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (7:25 p.m. [1:55:30])

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8330 (7:25 p.m. [01:55:00])

ADDRESS: 85 Chicago

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison

APPLICANT: Bibiana Narcissa

OWNER: Bibiana Narcissa

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect front yard hedge, install asphalt shingle roofing, replace French doors with windows

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Bibiana Narcissa, the applicant, described a cost savings associated with the proposed roof material.

Commissioner Franklin expressed the opinion that the original roof was a character-defining feature of the house.

The applicant stated that repairing the clay tile roof would have been cost-prohibitive based on the assessment of several contractors, that asphalt shingle roofs were common in the district, and that installing the metal material previously approved would be similarly expensive.

Commissioner Hamilton noted that the previous roof was removed without approval and without evidence regarding its degree of deterioration, making it difficult to compare this proposal with similar situations in the past. Commissioners continued to discuss the deterioration of the previous roof, the previously approved proposal, and the current proposal.

ACTION (ONE) (7:50 p.m. [02:20:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8330 for 85 Chicago** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the installation of CertainTeed Belmont asphalt shingles in color Shenandoah **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

MOTION FAILED FOR LACK OF SUPPORT

ACTION (TWO) (7:54 p.m. [02:24:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8330 for 85 Chicago** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the installation of asphalt shingles WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, but issues a NOTICE TO PROCEED for the proposed installation of CertainTeed Belmont asphalt shingles in color Shenandoah because the Commission finds that the work is necessary to substantially improve or correct these conditions

- The resource constitutes a hazard to the safety of the occupants.

Commissioner Hosey: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: NAY

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: not present

Commissioner Hosey: AYE

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 1

MOTION CARRIED

Several commissioners discussed the importance of the proposed windows filling the entire opening and the importance of having a compatible mullion.

Commissioner Hamilton suggested that a hedge should not be too tall and questioned the appropriateness of a gate.

ACTION (THREE) (8:06 p.m. [02:26:30])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8330 for 85 Chicago**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- A revised site plan confirming hedges, and the type of hedge, will be planted at the perimeter of the front yard, and that the maximum height will not exceed 2'-0" and there will be no gate at the front sidewalk.
- A catalog cut and a measured drawing of the Juliet balcony that confirms its design, material, finish, and dimensions will be submitted for staff review/approval.
- The Pella windows will be revised to offer a six-over-six pattern, and a neutral cladding color will be selected. The revised order will be submitted for staff review.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin expressed a concern that some species might have a height greater than two feet at maturity.

Commissioner Hamilton revised the first condition in the motion as follows:

- A revised site plan confirming hedges, and the type of hedge, will be planted at the perimeter of the front yard, and that the hedge will be maintained so that the maximum height will not exceed 2'-0" and there will be no gate at the front sidewalk.

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: not present
Commissioner Hosey: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8331(5:40 p.m. [08:10:00])

ADDRESS: 4071 Leslie

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Russell Woods-Sullivan

APPLICANT: Franklin Quider

OWNER: Darin Barnes

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace original windows with wood aluminum-clad windows

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Frank Quider and Darin Barnes described the condition of the windows.

Several commissioners, the applicants, and staff discussed whether the applicants had attempted to obtain repair estimates for the windows.

Commissioner Chinchilla opined that the steel windows have not been shown to be damaged beyond repair.

Commissioner Hosey left the room.

ACTION (ONE) (8:23 p.m. [02:53:30])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8331 for 4071 Leslie** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of the intact historic steel windows **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reasons for denial are that:

- The multi-operational arrangement of window sash within window openings is a common feature in Russell Woods and is a distinctive character-defining feature of this house.
- The selected replacement windows do not emulate the profile, pattern, and operation of the existing windows and would alter the features that characterize the property.

and therefore, the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*
- 9) *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

Commissioner Chinchilla: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: not present

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (8:26 p.m. [02:56:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-833 for 4071 Leslie**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The cladding color of the replacement windows shall match the sash color of the historic units. This can be achieved by 1) painting the historic sash brown or 2) selecting another cladding color that matches the existing paint color of the historic window sash.

Commissioner Simmons: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: not present

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8332 (8:28 p.m. [02:58:00])

ADDRESS: 4132 Bagley

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Hubbard Farms

APPLICANT: Michael Reyes

OWNER: Michael Reyes

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect fence, install deck and outdoor seating

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Michael Reyes, the applicant, discussed the application.

ACTION (8:33 p.m. [03:03:00])

Commissioner Simmons moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8332 for 4132 Bagley**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The proposed fence along Scotten shall have a setback comparable to that of other shallow setbacks on Scotten (including the demolished Wolf building) within the Hubbard Farms Historic District, as determined by staff.
- The proposed fence along Bagley shall have a setback comparable to that of other shallow setbacks on Bagley (including the demolished house at 4132 Bagley) within the Hubbard Farms Historic District, as determined by staff.
- The proposed deck and seating area shall be subject to approval by staff for consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioned Chinchilla suggested that staff be able to review any proposed signage or mural at the property. The applicants responded that no signage or mural is proposed at this time.

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: not present

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Hosey returned.

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8345 and 23-8346 (8:36 p.m. [03:06:00])
ADDRESS: 2027 and 2035 W. Boston
HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison
APPLICANT: Akosua Barthwell Evans
OWNER: Akosua Barthwell Evans
SCOPE OF WORK: Install security lighting

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Akosua Barthwell Evans and Walter K. Evans described the proposal.

Commissioner Hamilton noted that the Commission had received a letter complaining that the proposed lights were already installed and shining into a neighboring property. The applicants stated that they have addressed the complaint by turning the lights off and changing the angle of the lights. Commissioner Franklin noted that whether the lights are on or off is not a concern of the Commission.

ACTION (8:40 p.m. [03:10:00])

Commissioner Simmons moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8345 & 8346 for 2027 and 2035 W. Boston** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Chinchilla: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: not present
Commissioner Hosey: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Simmons: AYE
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8333 (8:41 p.m. [03:11:00])
ADDRESS: 4325 Fullerton
HISTORIC DISTRICT: Russell Woods-Sullivan
APPLICANT: Lee and Erin Ehlers
OWNER: Lee and Erin Ehlers
SCOPE OF WORK: Install vinyl windows, paint trim, repair rear deck

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Tom Cedoz, representing the applicant, discussed the recent violation history of the property and the proposed window work, stating that the replacement windows were installed by a contractor who had agreed to obtain a permit before performing the work.

Lee Ehlers, the applicant, discussed the condition of the historic windows.

Commissioner Hosey noted that the house had passed a Section 8 inspection, suggesting the windows had not been in a deteriorated condition. Tom Cedoz responded that the windows were deteriorated, but the inspector looked the other way.

Several commissioners continued to discuss the proposal, the appearance of the historic windows, and the work that had been done without approval.

ACTION (ONE) (9:05 p.m. [03:35:30])

Commissioner Chinchilla moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8333 for 4325 Fullerton** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reasons for denial are that:

- The windows that were removed without approval were a distinctive historic feature that characterized the property. The windows dated to the building's original construction and included 6/1 divided lite, double-hung wood units.
- The application does not include documentation that the windows removed without approval were deteriorated beyond repair to an extent that merited their replacement.
- The introduction of no divided lite, which replaced the true divided lite of the original wood windows, and the introduction of vinyl windows, particularly for the front elevation, are not an adequate match for the original true divided lite of the original, double-hung windows.

and therefore, the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: not present

Commissioner Hosey: AYE

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: abstain

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (9:07 p.m. [03:37:00])

Commissioner Chinchilla moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8333 for 4325 Fullerton**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The shingle siding, deck and trim be repainted a color selected from Color System D of the HDC color chart guidelines.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: not present

Commissioner Hosey: AYE

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: abstain

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8334 (9:09 p.m. [03:39:00])

ADDRESS: 2021 W. Chicago

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison

APPLICANT: Michelle Shiftar, HP Foreclosure Solution LLC

OWNER: HP Foreclosure Solution LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Install vinyl windows

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Michelle Shiftar, the applicant, described the historic windows removed and the new windows which were installed without approval.

Commissioner Chinchilla noted that the profile, materials, color, and other features of the new windows were not appropriate.

ACTION (ONE) (9:21 p.m. [03:51:15])

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8334 for 2021 Chicago** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the installation of vinyl windows **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reasons for denial are that:

- The proposed vinyl windows are incompatible with the property's historic character as they do not match the original in material and light configuration.

- Also, the bright white color of the units presents an incongruous appearance within the context of the building's current color palette.

and therefore, the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

6. *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hosey: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: not present

Commissioner Hosey: AYE

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (9:23 p.m. [03:53:00])

Commissioner Chinchilla moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8334 for 2021 Chicago**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

Staff be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the design of the new screen door prior to the issuance of the project's permit.

Commissioner Simmons: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: not present

Commissioner Hosey: AYE

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8335 (9:24 p.m. [03:54:00])

ADDRESS: 14921 Greenview

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Rosedale Park
APPLICANT: Tina Dawson
OWNER: Tina Dawson
SCOPE OF WORK: Install vinyl windows

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Tina Dawson described the condition of the historic windows and discussed the proposed replacement.

Commissioner Hamilton noted that, based on the photos provided, the windows do not seem to be beyond repair; further, the proposed windows are not an appropriate replacement.

Tina Dawson's brother (name not provided) stated that he is a licensed builder and believes that the windows are beyond repair.

Commissioners Hamilton and Hosey emphasized that even if the historic windows are beyond repair, the proposed windows are not appropriate.

ACTION (9:38 p.m. [04:08:15])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8335 for 14921 Greenview**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that:

- The proposed window and storm window replacement would remove historic features of the property and replace them with features of non-historic materials and appearance.

and therefore, the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.*
- 6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hosey: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: not present

Commissioner Hosey: AYE

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8336 (9:40 p.m. [00:04:10])

ADDRESS: 1453 W. Boston

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison

APPLICANT: Evan Asher

OWNER: Evan Asher

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace slate roof with asphalt shingle roof, rehabilitate and expand driveway and patio, remove tree

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Evan Asher, the applicant, described the proposed work.

ACTION (9:41 p.m. [04:11:30])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8336 for 1453 W. Boston** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The driveway width in the side yard area shall continue the line created by the existing front yard portion of the driveway (upon reaching the back yard, it may expand as shown in the application sketch to connect the garage and patio).
- The concrete curb separating the patio from the grassy portion of the back yard shall be retained. If damaged, it may be replaced in-kind.
- The above-grade portion of the window well shall be enclosed as specified in the Historic District Commission Glass Block Guidelines (the window well may be filled to grade level).

Commissioner Chinchilla: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: not present

Commissioner Hosey: AYE

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8337 (9:44 p.m. [04:14:45])

ADDRESS: 1346 Broadway

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Broadway Avenue Local

APPLICANT: Brian Rebain, Kraemer Design Group

OWNER: Cambridge Acquisition LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Rehabilitate building

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Laura Mitchell, representing the applicant, stated that the flagpole would need to be replaced.

ACTION (9:46 p.m. [04:16:00])

Commissioner Hosey moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8337 for 1346 Broadway** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following condition:

- The original flagpole at the building's roof be retained, or if beyond repair, replaced with a reproduction subject to staff review and approval.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: not present

Commissioner Hosey: AYE

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8327 (9:48 p.m. [04:18:00])

ADDRESS: 206 E. Grand River

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Broadway Avenue Local

APPLICANT: Brian Rebain, Kraemer Design Group

OWNER: Amelia Patt Zamir, Method Development

SCOPE OF WORK: Restore building exterior, replace windows

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Brian Rebain, the

ACTION (9:48 p.m. [04:18:15])

Commissioner Simmons moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8327for 206 E. Grand River** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Chinchilla: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: not present
Commissioner Hosey: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Simmons: AYE
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8338 (9:50 p.m. [04:20:00])

ADDRESS: 1920 Atkinson

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Atkinson Avenue

APPLICANT: Antonio Luck, Nepelu LLC

OWNER: Antonio Luck, Nepelu LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Revisions to previously approved design

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Antonio Luck, the applicant, explained the revisions to the previously approved design, stating that the fence was a requirement for a liquor license, and stating there was no other suitable location for the exhaust fan.

Commissioner Franklin noted that front yard fences are not found in the historic district.

Commissioner Chinchilla argued that the fence is appropriate given the new commercial use of the property.

Commissioners Hardamon, Chinchilla, and Hamilton discussed if the proposed exhaust fan could be placed elsewhere.

ACTION (10:07 p.m. [04:37:00])

Commissioner Chinchilla moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8338 for 1920 Atkinson**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed work items **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The enclosure of the make-up air intake units will be finished with an opaque stain that matches the dark brown brick on the dwelling. A sample of the color will be submitted to staff for review. The location of the metal exhaust fan will also be submitted to staff for review and approval
- The fence will be consistent with the fence of the adjacent property with low height, minimal impact, footprint, and design.

Commissioner Hosey: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: not present
Commissioner Hosey: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Simmons: AYE
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

XII CITY PROJECTS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (10:11 p.m. [04:41:00])

None

XIV OLD BUSINESS (10:11 p.m. [04:41:00])

None

XV NEW BUSINESS (10:11 p.m. [04:41:00])

SECURITY AND LIGHTING GUIDELINES

Staff provided a draft document describing security and lighting guidelines for historic districts. Commissioners discussed the appropriateness of security lighting and window bars in historic districts.

ACTION (9:37 p.m. [04:07:30])

Commissioner Hosey moved to adopt the draft Security and Lighting Guidelines.

Commissioner Chinchilla: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: NAY
Commissioner Hardamon: not present
Commissioner Hosey: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Simmons: AYE
Ayes: 4 Nays: 1

MOTION CARRIED

XVI ADJOURNEMENT (10:32 p.m. [05:02:15])

The Commission adjourned at 10:32 p.m.