

DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION SPECIAL MEETING

Date: June 22, 2022

Due to COVID-19 restrictions, this meeting was held jointly in person and electronically via Zoom Meeting Link and audio-recorded.

[Actual Time] / Audio Recording Time Stamp **AGENDA**

[05:38 pm] **I CALL TO ORDER**
01:22:15 Chair Franklin called the meeting to order at 5:38 p.m.

[05:38 pm] **II ROLL CALL**
01:22:15

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION		PRESENT	ABSENT
Tiffany Franklin	Chair	X	
James Hamilton, Detroit	Commissioner	X	
Richard Hosey, Detroit	Commissioner	Late (6:39pm)	
Brandon Lockhart, Detroit	Commissioner	X	
Dennis Miriani, Detroit	Vice Chair	X	
STAFF			
Audra Dye	PDD		x
Garrick Landsberg	PDD	X	
Daniel Rieden	PDD	X	
Jennifer Ross	PDD	X	

[05:38 pm] **III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**
01:23:15 Commissioner Hamilton moved to approve the Agenda.

Commissioner Miriani - SUPPORT
Ayes – 4 Nay – 0
MOTION CARRIED

[05:39 pm] **IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES**
01:24:33 Commissioner Hamilton moved to approve the May 11, 2022 Meeting Minutes:

Commissioner Miriani - SUPPORT
Ayes – 4 Nay – 0
MOTION CARRIED

[05:39 pm] **V REPORTS**
01:24:33 Director Landsberg reported on the following items:

- A new commissioner candidate is being reviewed by City Council today and a second candidate is being reviewed by the mayor this week and will hopefully be reviewed by the City Council next week. We hope to have a full body of Commissioners at our next HDC meeting.

- Regarding HDC staff, Brendan Cagney has left the HDC staff but remains in the Planning & Development Department and has taken a new position in the East Region of the department.
- Have 2 positions openings in the HDC staff and have concluded interviews and hope to have these fields filled by next month.
- Finally at the state level, on the Commission website we have an announcement about the declaration of location forms, which is related to the new state tax credit program that was launched June 15th. Owner-occupied residential homes in local historic districts are eligible for the states historic tax credit program, an important step in the process is submission of a declaration of location to our staff. Staff has set up a quick response system to support applicants.
- Our state’s historic preservation officer, Mark Rodman, passed away last week. He was a vital and instrumental in the advocacy and push for the state’s historic tax credit program. He will be dearly missed and we thank him for his long term support.
- Note to the public all HDC cases for this evening are viewable on the public website.

[05:42 pm]
01:27:33

VI APPROVAL OF APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO CONSENT AGENDA

None

[05:42 pm]
01:27:33

VII POSTPONED APPLICATION

None

[05:42 pm]
01:27:33

VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS)

None

[05:42 pm]
01:28:33

IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

- **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** #22-7842 DR

ADDRESS: 241 Madison (Detroit Athletic Club)

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Madison- Harmonie HD

APPLICANT: Greg Sweeney (Rossetti)

OWNER: James Capo (Detroit Athletic Club)

SCOPE OF WORK: Construct subgrade addition, install HVAC pad/equipment and landscape screening

PROPOSAL: The proposed work consists of two projects: the subgrade addition to the basement along the west elevation of the building’s northwest corner, and adding a mechanical “patio” to the southwest corner of the building, facing John R. The subgrade addition work has started and was permitted through the Buildings, Safety Engineering, and Environmental Department (BSEED). The work was originally intended to have no impact on the exterior but has since had some temporary work as described below.

Subgrade Basement Addition (BSEED Permit #BLD 2022-00383)

The proposed basement extension would be located fully below ground, extending the basement by 450SF of useable space aligning the existing west edge of the basement wall to the existing north basement wall. Some existing exterior elements located at grade, like the entry stairway at the North edge of this work, would be removed temporarily, as indicated on sheets DA-101/ A-102, to allow for the Basement construction to occur, and will be replaced at the end of the project. There

are no changes to the existing steps down into the basement or the existing mechanical equipment that was previously located here. The proposal is to restore this area to previous conditions when complete, including landscaping and shrubs.

Mechanical Pad (HVAC) with Landscape Screening

The mechanical pad (also called, “mechanical patio” in the application) with landscape screening will exist atop the existing basement extensions (created in 1944, 1951) to serve the renovation of a full-service kitchen below grade. This kitchen serves the new Abbey Bowling Center renovation. The new kitchen’s exhaust and walk-in cooler condensers will be within the new pad above. The pad will contain additional HVAC equipment for the Abbey Bowling Center and a make-up air unit. This pad will be enclosed in decorative fencing at the north, west and south sides, with an operable gate on the north, side of the pad. The pad will be obscured by mature landscaping.

[05:49pm]
01:35:33

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

- Jonathon Semak, Wayne County Commissioner representing District 2, spoke in support of the proposal.

[05:51pm]
01:37:33

END (AUDIO)

[05:47pm]
01:33:33

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- Applicants Greg Sweeney of Rosetti and Jim Capo, representing the owner, were present. They commented on the city permitting process and weren’t aware of the historic approval process. They reviewed their proposal as outlined in the staff report.
- Commissioners had no comment.

[5:52 pm]
01:37:53

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7842 for 241 Madison**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

Commissioner Lockhart – SUPPORT

Ayes –4 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[05:53 pm]
01:38:33

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7843 GL**

ADDRESS: 115 Edmund Pl.

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Brush Park HD

APPLICANT: David Rzyzi/Mannik Smith Group

OWNER: John Edmund Street LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Establish parking lot

PROPOSAL: Per the submitted drawings, documents, and scope of work, the applicant is proposing to establish a parking lot at this corner location. The permit application is both for the legalization of the use (change of use) and the work required to accommodate that use. Work includes paving, curbing, fencing, and a new curb cut to John R.

[05:55 pm]
01:40:33

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

Jonathon (last name not discernable) is a resident at 3051 Woodward and lives around the corner from this property. He spoke in opposition of this project and described how this would have a deleterious effect on the surrounding and contiguous property and would have an impact on the general community.

[05:57 pm]

END (AUDIO)

01:42:33

[05:55 pm]

01:40:33

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- Applicants not present.
- The Commission raised the question of zoning impacts on the historic district with regards to parking lots and desirable uses. Staff responded that staff cannot answer zoning questions. Staff clarifies per Secretary of Interior Standards, Standard 1, if the proposed use of property is appropriate in its historic context, which is not a zoning question, but its appropriateness under this historic standard. The Commission discusses if this alteration in use of property is appropriate or not.
- Commissioners also point out that the current proposal also lacks any buffer to the parking lot.
- Commissioners describe how the parking lot is not a compatible use at this location and sets a precedent that is not appropriate to the district.

[06:04pm]

01:49:33

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7843 for 115 Edmund**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

1) A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Commissioner Lockhart – SUPPORT

Ayes –4 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0

MOTION CARRIED

X CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

[06:05pm]
01:50:33

None

XI PUBLIC COMMENT

[6:06 pm]
01:51:00

- None

XII APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

[6:07 pm]
01:52:00

- **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** #22-7844 JR

ADDRESS: 445 W. Forrest

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Warren-Prentis HD

APPLICANT: Shane Overby, Artisan Contracting

OWNER: Toad Management LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Install fence and patios at front yard

PROPOSAL: With the current submittal, the applicant is proposing to install two new patios areas within the property's front yard to support outdoor dining/seating. Each patio will be enclosed with fencing. Specifically, the project includes the following as per the submitted documentation:

West Patio

- Install pea gravel surface at grade (per the submitted plan drawing). Note that the applicant has submitted the following two alternate pavement systems for the Commission's consideration:
 - o 24"x24"porcelain tile pavers with pre-Cut Synthetic Turf "Diagonal" Kit with 4" Wide Turf Grids
 - o 24"x24" permeable concrete mats with pre-cut turf infill

- Install two steps which shall lead from sidewalk to patio

- Install 3'-0" tall aluminum fence/gate to enclose patio. The fence will be installed atop a concrete footing which will measure +/- 10" in height (according to the applicant). The footing height will decrease as it slopes towards the southern portion of the parcel/patio

- At the eastern edge of the patio, atop the current masonry cap of the stair well which leads to the basement entry, install a fence which measures 42" inches in height from grade

East Patio

- Install pea gravel surface at grade (per the submitted plan drawing) Note that the applicant has submitted the following two alternate pavement systems for the Commission's consideration:
 - o 24"x24"porcelain tile pavers with pre-Cut Synthetic Turf "Diagonal" Kit with 4" Wide Turf Grids
 - o 24"x24" permeable concrete mats with pre-cut turf infill

- Install 3'-0" tall aluminum fence/gate to enclose patio.

- Remove an existing ornamental tree

The project also includes the installation of mulch at the small open lawn area between the proposed new east and west patios. An aluminum fence which measures 42" front grade will also be installed at the current eastern masonry cap of the stair well which leads to the basement entry.

- Install a new aluminum door with a single-lite vision panel at the basement entrance, front elevation

- Install aluminum-clad wood windows at basement

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

[6:07 pm]
01:52:00

- Applicants Shane Overby, Artisan Contracting, and Reimer Preister, owner, are present. They asked that the conditions of the approval be reviewed. The commissioners reviewed each condition with the applicant.
- Commissioner asked staff regarding work that was not shown in the staff report and appears to be done without approval: aluminum clad wood basement windows installed and the basement doorway that was added without approval. Staff confirmed that these work items were added to the application and added to the staff report. Commissioner asked if staff recommends approval, staff confirmed that they have no issues with these items.

[6:15 pm]
02:00:20

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7844 for 445 W. Forest**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- All installed fencing/barriers/gates shall maintain a consistent height in elevation and shall measure no higher than 4'-0" in total (to include footings). The revised fencing proposal shall be submitted to HDC staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of the project's permit. If staff determines that these elements do not meet the SOI standards/the Commission's conditions, the work items shall be submitted to the Commission for review at a regular meeting.
- Grass turf/plantings shall be installed at the area between the two proposed new patios. Also, the proposed 24"x24" porcelain tile pavers with a live, low maintenance ground cover shall be installed at the two patio area. The applicant may also propose an alternative surface material which better approximates grass/turf be installed at the two new proposed patio areas. The proposed alternative materials shall be submitted to HDC staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of the project's permit. If staff determines that these elements do not meet the SOI standards and or Elements of Design for the neighborhood, the work items shall be submitted to the Commission for review at a regular meeting.

Commissioner Lockhart – SUPPORT

Ayes – 3 Nay – 1 (Hamilton)

MOTION CARRIED

[06:18 pm]
02:01:56

- **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-7846 DR
ADDRESS: 2929 E. Grand Blvd.
VIOLATION NUMBER: 22-569
HISTORIC DISTRICT: Jam Handy/E. Grand Blvd. HD
APPLICANT: Sandy Levine
PROPERTY OWNER: Hewitt & Levine Holdings, LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Paint front elevation and mural (work completed without approval), paint side elevation

PROPOSAL:

The proposed work consists of painting the exterior buff brick masonry, gray on the front and side elevations and the painting of the mural on the side elevation. The painting of the front elevation brick has been completed without approval. The mural has been completed without approval. The work that remains incomplete is the proposed painting of the remaining buff brick on the side elevation gray to match the front elevation.

Product Data

- Gray Paint Locations
- Gray Color: Benjamin Moore Aura Exterior Paint, “Eagle Rock” color (gray)
- Mural Paint: Behr Acrylic Outdoor Paint, multiple colors

Mural Information

- Artist: Immanuel Ahiable
- Title: “Kid’s Got Heart”
- Installed: BLKOUT WALLS Festival of 2021
- Inspiration per the Artist: The message is a reference both to the artist as well as Sir Galahad, one of King Arthur's knights, whose heart was so pure that he never lost a fight. Immanuel's father was a boxer, and Immanuel himself had to spend time in the hospital at age 12 with a serious heart condition. His father taught him about having "heart" in terms of personal fortitude, integrity, and passion and its relationship with improving his health at the time. In the artist's words, the mural is a piece about the character people see stemming from his own personal life experiences and the people who've found themselves on a similar journey with the same result in character.

[06:19 pm]
02:02:34

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- Applicant Sandy Levine is present and is co-owner of the property. He offered his apology to the Commission and stated his reasons for the work that was done without approval. He did not intentionally mean to ignore the approval process. The applicant stated that the paint used was not the type that seals paint in the brick. Joel Schmidt, his architect, is also present. The architect verified this. The architect was on the team that lead to previous approval process of previous work and described this previous work.
- Commissioners clarify the application is regarding the paint and the mural. They discuss the history of these buildings and their yellow brick features, and how the building was painted without approval. They point out there is no application to paint on this brick material. Commissioners agree that painting on masonry is not allowed.
- The applicant points to other murals applied in the neighborhood. Commissioners state that this not relevant. Commissioners remind the applicant that the building is still in a historic district and that this work is still subject to approval. The Commissioners weighed more heavily on the front façade than the side façade. They would like to see an application for remediation for this work.
- The Commissioners state that paint on the unpainted surface was not appropriate and a potential remedy would be paint removal.

[06:35 pm]
02:20:56

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7846 for 2929 E. Grand Blvd.**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hamilton– SUPPORT

Ayes – 4 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[06:39pm]
02:24:00

COMMISSIONER RICHARD HOSEY JOINED THE MEETING

[06:39pm]
02:24:00

- **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** #22-7849 AD

ADDRESS: 1437 Vinewood

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Hubbard Farms HD

APPLICANT/PROPERTY OWNER: Donovan McCarty

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace windows

PROPOSAL:

The applicant is requesting to replace the remaining wood sash windows on the house with vinyl sash units. As only four of the openings are on exterior walls, the location and operation of each window opening is listed below.

Front/East elevation

One double-hung unit, one-over-one sash, is to the left of the enclosed porch

Side/North elevation

One double-hung, one-over-one, window is near the front of the house.

Side/South elevation

Two mulled double-hung units, each with one-over-one sash, are near the front of the house.

[06:39pm]
02:24:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Applicant/Owner, present, described the proposal's background and expressed their thanks to HDC support through the process.
- Commissioners discuss how this house has already gone through considerable changes with many historic features replaced.

[06:45 pm]
02:30:00

ACTION

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7849 for 1437 Vinewood**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The proposed window units shall match the size, configuration and general characteristics, one-over-one sash with similar dimensions of the existing window sash components as the wood windows being replaced.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 4 Nay – 1 (Commissioner Franklin)

MOTION CARRIED

[06:48 pm]
02:33:00

- **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7850 AD**

ADDRESS: 1814-1820 Church

VIOLATION NUMBER: 22-592

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Corktown HD

APPLICANT/ PROPERTY OWNER: Mark Crowley & Maria Solis-Crowley

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace windows (work complete without approval)

PROPOSAL:

The applicant is requesting approval for the installation of three, Ultimate G2 Marvin double-hung aluminum-clad wood windows (one-over-one), color: bronze. Two sash units have already been installed on the side/east elevation and replace original wood double-hung units, whereas the third unit on the rear/north elevation and not yet installed, will replace non-historic sash that was installed in 2001 (as part of a larger project that was reviewed by the HDC).

[06:48 pm]
02:33:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Applicant/Owners, Mark and Carmen Crowley are present and described the brick molding and that no brick molding was removed.
- Staff wanted to point out that the staff revised their recommendation to approve window replacement of a rear, rooftop addition window, which is not historic.
- Commissioners received confirmation that some original windows are in storage.
- The applicant confirmed that the bay window is not in the application.
- Commissioners discuss how they don't have an issue with the proposal.

[06:58 pm]
02:43:00

ACTION ONE

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7850 for 1814 – 1820 Church**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of

review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 4 Nay – 1 (Commissioner Hamilton)

MOTION CARRIED

[06:58 pm]

02:44:00

ACTION TWO

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7850 for 1814 – 1820 Church**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application to replace the window on the third floor at the rear of the property WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[07:02pm]

02:45:00

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7852 GL**

ADDRESS: 7300 Woodward

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Jam Handy/ E. Grand Blvd. HD

APPLICANT: Myles Hamby, The Platform, Patrick Meehan/7300 Woodward, LLC/The Platform

PROPERTY OWNER: 7300 Woodward, LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Alter Storefront, Install Murals/Signage, Other Site Modifications

PROPOSAL:

Per the submitted drawings, documents, narrative, and scope of work, the applicant is proposing a series of minor exterior alterations.

The work proposed includes, but is not limited to, the following:

- Addition of a decorative metal band on the south and west facades
- Addition of “Art Deco-inspired” murals on the north and east facades
- New entrances and signage on the south, east and west
- New streetscape along Grand Boulevard with planters, trees and wood benches

[07:02pm]

02:45:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- The Applicant, Myles Hamby of The Platform, is present and had nothing to add to the staff report.
- Commissioners discuss the banding on the first floor. Staff raised the point on whether this feature is historically appropriate or not.

[07:13pm]

02:56:00

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7852 for 7300 Woodward** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof

pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

Commissioner Lockhart – SUPPORT

Ayes – 4 Nay – 1 (Commissioner Hamilton)

MOTION CARRIED

[07:14pm]
02:57:00

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** #22-7853 JR

ADDRESS: 92 E. Forest

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Sugar Hill/ John R Music & Art HD

APPLICANT: Jeff Klatt, Architect

PROPERTY OWNER: Neil Check

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace doors, windows, slate roof

PROPOSAL:

With the current submittal, the applicant is proposing to rehabilitate the building so that it might house a number of apartment units. Specifically, per the current submission, the application proposes to undertake the following work items:

Roof

- At nave’s gabled roof, remove the existing historic slate roof system. Install new GAF Timberline Slateline asphalt shingles

Doors

- At front elevation, replace non-historic primary entry door and adjacent wood infill with set of paired wood doors with v-groove finish and strap hinges
- At secondary/west elevation entry, replace non-historic paired metal doors with wood door and sidelite, v-groove finish and strap hinges
- At west elevation basement entrance, install a new steel door (wood grain finish)

All Existing 1/1, Double-Hung, 1/1 Historic Windows and Trim (per current window scope outlined in documents entitled “92 E Forest Existing Window Trim Profiles” and “HDC Window Scope clarification”)

- Please see the documents entitled “92 E Forest Existing Window Trim Profiles” and “HDC Window Scope clarification” for current window scope
- Remove all existing original 1/1, wood double-hung windows and associated trim (casing, brickmould, and mullions)
- Install new wood trim (casing, brickmould, and mullions) to exactly replicate existing in profile, dimension, materiality, and detailing
- Install new 1/1, aluminum-clad, double-hung wood new sash (Windsor Pinnacle brand) to match existing in profile, dimension, light configuration, and operation

All Existing 1/1, Vinyl Non-Historic Windows (per current window scope outlined in documents entitled “92 E Forest Existing Window Trim Profiles” and “HDC Window Scope clarification”)

- Remove all existing 1/1 non-historic vinyl window units (original wood trim is not longer extant)
- Install new historically-appropriate wood trim (casing, brickmould, and mullions)
- Install new 1/1, aluminum-clad, double-hung wood new sash (Windsor Pinnacle brand)

All Existing Historic Arched Windows at Front and Side Elevation of Nave (per current window scope outlined in documents entitled “92 E Forest Existing Window Trim Profiles” and “HDC Window Scope clarification”)

- Remove all existing original wood trim (casing, brickmould, and mullions) **to include original decorative wood tracery/trim pieces**
- Remove all existing steel casement windows (behind decorative wood tracery/trim pieces)
- Install new replicated wood trim (casing, brickmould, and mullions) **to include original decorative wood tracery/trim pieces** to match existing/original
- Install new windows to replicate existing steel casement in in profile, dimension, and detailing. Applicant has noted that the windows may be constructed of either steel or aluminum

[07:14pm]
02:57:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Applicant/Owner describe the proposal’s background.
- Commissioners clarify with the applicant which windows are to be replaced or repaired.
- Commissioners received confirmation that the brick mold will be repaired or dealing with replication of the brick mold if it breaks.

[07:31 pm]
03:17:00

ACTION

Commissioner Hosey moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7853 for 92 E. Forest**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Details for the new window trim and brick mold which will be installed shall be submitted to HDC staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of the project’s permit. If staff determines that these elements do not meet the SOI standards, the work items shall be submitted to the Commission for review at a regular meeting.

Commissioner Lockhart – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[07:36pm] • **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7854 DR**

03:20:00

ADDRESS: 17644 Manderson
VIOLATION NUMBER: 22-566
HISTORIC DISTRICT: Palmer Park Apartment Buildings HD
APPLICANT: Kevin Brandon
PROPERTY OWNER: RCI Convinton Townhouse LLC
SCOPE OF WORK: Replace windows (work completed without approval)
PROPOSAL:

The proposed work consists of the replacement of all windows, which is work completed without approval. The replacement windows are double hung (except for 2 small windows, which are casement windows) with between the glass grids. See attached window schedule, plan with window locations and installation photos.

Product Data- See attached brochures and cut sheets for additional information:

- Windows: Manchester Series by Quaker, Color: Earthtone
- Matching Aluminum break metal surrounds

[07:36pm]
03:20:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- The Applicant present discussed the background of the project and agreed with the staff's report and stated that all work is privately funded.
- The Commissioners received confirmation that the windows were replaced in 2020. They asked the applicant if they received a building permit, and if so they should have received notice that this was in a historic district.

[07:43 pm]
03:27:00

ACTION

Commissioner Hosey moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7854 for 17664 Manderson**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[07:46 pm]
03:30:00

XIII CITY PROJECTS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

None

XIV OLD BUSINESS

[07:46 pm]
03:30:00

- **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 20-6879

ADDRESS: 287-301 Watson

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Brush Park HD

APPLICANTS: Cecily C. King and Carl Bolofer, Kipling Development

PROPERTY OWNER: City of Detroit (Pending Sale To Applicant)

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect Two New Multi-Family Buildings (16 Units) And Detached Carport

PROPOSAL:

Twelve (12) terraced townhomes and four (4) carriage houses, per the submitted drawings, are proposed for the site. The twelve townhomes are evenly divided among a single building formed into six distinct masses at the front of the parcel, variously exhibiting flat or mansard-style roofs. The blocks are cleanly articulated and vary slightly in their setbacks while keeping a consistent and readable street wall. Traditional materials, forms, stoops, and opening sizes are employed to relate to the nearby historic fabric, especially 311 Watson. Modern elements, including metal panels and contemporary windows, complement the historic cues. The carriage homes, also combined into a single articulated mass, are at the rear of the parcel and are more aggressively modern, exhibiting raking roof planes and a corrugated metal exterior. Covered parking and internal vehicular circulation is provided at the center of the site, generally hidden from view.

[07:46 pm]
03:30:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Staff and the applicant described the background of the project.
- The applicants presented a 34-page presentation on the two sites and the conceptual ideas, their background, materiality, site and proposed construction.
- The Commissioners had no objections to the presentations.

[07:53 pm]
03:37:00

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

The Commission approve the revisions to the previously approved **Application #20-6879 for 287-301 Watson** in the **Brush Park Historic District**.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

XV NEW BUSINESS

[7:54 pm]

03:39:00

- **COMMISSIONER ELECTIONS**
Postponed until Commissioner seats are filled.

[7:55 pm]

03:40:00

- **VIOLATIONS PROCESS DISCUSSION**
Dan Rieden, HDC Staff, presented the Historic District Violations Process, showing definitions, enforcement steps, and the overall goal to usher violations into the application process.
Commissioners received confirmation that this process also covers violation cases that received denials. Commissioners stated their appreciation for the work done.

[8:13 pm]

03:57:00

XVI ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Miriani moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:13 pm.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

MEETING ADJOURNED

LIST OF ACRONYMS

- Building Safety Engineering, and Environmental Department (BSEED)
- Historic District (HD)
- Historic District Advisory Board (HDAB)
- Historic District Commission (HDC)
- HDC Staff
 - AD- Audra Dye
 - DR- Dan Rieden
 - GL- Garrick Landsberg
 - JR – Jennifer Ross
- Planning & Development Department (PDD)