

DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

Date: August 10, 2022

Due to COVID-19 restrictions, this meeting was held jointly in person and electronically via Zoom Meeting Link and audio-recorded.

AGENDA (Actual time [audio recording time stamp])

I CALL TO ORDER (6:30 p.m. [00:07:12])

Chair Franklin Johnson called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

II ROLL CALL (6:31 p.m. [00:08:22])

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION		PRESENT	ABSENT
Tiffany Franklin	Chair	X	
Jim Hamilton	Commissioner	X	
Roderick Hardamon	Commissioner		X
Richard Hosey	Commissioner		X
Brandon Lockhart	Commissioner	X	
Alan Machielse	Commissioner	X	
Dennis Miriani	Commissioner	X	
STAFF			
Timothy Boscarino	PDD	X	
Benjamin Buckley	PDD	X	
Audra Dye	PDD	X	
Garrick Landsberg	PDD	X	
Daniel Rieden	PDD	X	
Jennifer Ross	PDD	X	
Antoine Bryant	PDD		X
Katy Trudeau	PDD		X
Rebecca Savage	HDAB		X

III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA (06:32 p.m. [00:09:04])

Director Landsberg mentioned one case that has been withdrawn and that case has been struck from the agenda:

- 1427 Edison

Commissioner Hamilton moved to have following cases added to the Consent Agenda:

- 445 Ledyard
- 478 W. Alexandrine
- 1402 Vinewood
- 1221 Labrosse
- 3960 Third

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Hamilton moved to approve the agenda.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0
MOTION CARRIED

IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES (6:34 p.m. [00:11:50])

Staff stated that there are no meeting minutes to report at this time.

V REPORTS (6:34 p.m. [00:12:00])

Director Landsberg stated that there are no staff reports.

VI APPROVAL OF APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO CONSENT AGENDA (6:35 p.m. [00:12:05])

Commissioner Hamilton moved to approve the Consent Agenda.
Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0
MOTION CARRIED

VII POSTPONED APPLICATION (6:37 p.m. [00:14:40])

None

VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS) (6:37 p.m. [00:14:46])

None

IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (6:37 p.m. [00:15:03])

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7936 & 22-7938
ADDRESS: 3746-3752 Second
HISTORIC DISTRICT: Willis-Selden Local
APPLICANT: Najim Saymuah
OWNER: Grand Detroit Holdings LLC and Clifford Brown (Woodborn Partners)
SCOPE OF WORK: Erect Multi-unit townhouse building and rehabilitate existing building.

Staff provided a verbal summary of the proposal and staff report.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (6:45 p.m. [00:22:00])

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (6:46 p.m. [00:22:45])

Najim Saymuah, the project architect, introduced the owner and several associates and stated that they have no issue with the recommendations of the staff report.

ACTION ONE (6:47 p.m. [00:25:00])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application 22-7936 and 22-7938 for 3746-3752 Second** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work. The certificate is issued with the conditions identified in the staff report.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION TWO (6:49 p.m. [00:26:45])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

The Commission find that the proposed project at **3746-3752 Second** will have a demonstrable effect on the Willis-Selden historic district and the effect is likely to be beneficial. The determination will be reported to the Mayor and the City Council for their consideration.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7937 (6:50 p.m. [00:27:37])

ADDRESS: 3030 Seminole

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Indian Village

APPLICANT: John Biggar

OWNER: Ernie Zachary and Diane Van Buren

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect one-story addition to include integration of rear porch

Staff provided a verbal summary of the proposal.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (6:54 p.m. [00:31:10])

None

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS: (6:54 p.m. [00:31:30])

John Biggar, the architect, introduced Diane Van Buren, the property owner, and discussed the applicant's desire to remove decorative brackets in order to make the window openings as large as possible.

Commissioners Miriani and Machielse discussed the appearance of the window openings.

John Biggar stated that the proposed design of the window openings could be adjusted to reflect the concerns expressed by staff and the Commission.

ACTION ONE (7:00 p.m. [00:37:10])

Commissioner Machielse moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application 22-7937** for **3030 Seminole** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work. The certificate is issued with the following conditions:

- Prior to the issuance of the CoA and permit, HDC staff should be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the final construction drawings for the project; the final drawings must be dimensioned and provide details regarding the height, material, and style of the rooftop railing and the manner in which the new windows, doors, stucco, and brick infill will be integrated with the existing structure. The existing brackets will be retained, at least in part, such that the existing fenestration on the porch be retained. Should HDC staff determine that any aspect of the final drawings does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the project will be forwarded to the Commission for review at a monthly meeting.

Commissioner Lockhart: SUPPORT

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7939, 22-7940, 22-7941, 22-7942, 22-7943, 22-7944 (7:03 p.m. [00:40:20])

ADDRESS: 346-362 W. Grand Boulevard, 3636 Porter

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Hubbard Farms

APPLICANT: Tim Flintoff, 4545 Architecture

OWNER: Detroit Land Bank Authority

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect two multi-unit townhouse buildings and detached garage

Commissioner Machielse stated that he is employed by a consulting firm on this project, and recused himself.

Staff provided a summary of the project. The site has been owned by the Detroit Land Bank for some time and was advertised for redevelopment. Staff opined that the massing of the proposed new construction does not fit with the scale and monumental nature of other buildings on West Grand Boulevard and, therefore, the recommendation is for denial.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (7:07 p.m. [00:44:05])

Deb Sumner introduced her husband, Steven Sumner, both Hubbard Farms residents, and stated that they are pleased that the Inkwell Partners have chosen to develop the land. Deb Sumner noted that, to the north of the subject property, there is a two-story building with a flat roof, and stated that they do not desire height or density.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (7:13 p.m. [00:51:30])

Tim Flintoff and Josh Maddox, both of 4545 Architecture, described the proposal, including the design of the proposed buildings and the architecture of other buildings in the vicinity. The applicants described how the massing of the proposed buildings is informed by suggestions provided in the City of Detroit RFP for the project, described the architectural details of both facades, and discussed a community engagement process that had occurred.

Commissioner Miriani asked about the choice of brick color.

The applicant compared the proposed color with that of other buildings in the vicinity.

Commissioner Miriani suggested that the proposal does not meet the criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness, but a Notice to Proceed may be warranted. Commissioner Miriani noted that there were community letters of support and that this is an important street.

Commissioner Franklin agreed that the proposal does not meet the standards for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Commissioner Miriani described the Porter façade as plain and suburban, and asked about the appearance of the windows.

The applicant responded that the Porter façade is intended to be simpler in character, and stated that they are considering changing the flat casement windows shown in the proposal to two-over-two windows.

Commissioners Miriani and Franklin suggested that changing the windows thusly would help the proposed building fit with the character of the surrounding neighborhood.

Commissioner Hamilton said that the building does not fit with the architecture of the neighborhood, and agreed that the proposed windows on the Porter façade do not fit with the neighborhood.

Commissioners Hardamon and Hamilton said that the design could be improved upon.

ACTION (ONE) (7:43 p.m. [01:20:35])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application 22-7939, 22-7940, 22-7941, 22-7942, 22-7943, 22-7944** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, but without substantial detriment to the public welfare and without substantial derogation from the intents and purposes of the city's historic ordinance, and therefore **ISSUES a NOTICE TO PROCEED** for the proposed work, contingent upon satisfaction of the conditions identified in prong 2 of Section 21-2-78 as such:

The resource is a deterrent to a major improvement program that will be of substantial benefit to the community. Substantial benefit shall be found

only if the applicant proposing the work has obtained all necessary planning and zoning approvals, financing and environmental clearances, and the improvement program is otherwise feasible.

Commissioner Lockhart: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0 (Nay by Hamilton, abstention by Machielse)

MOTION CARRIED

X CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (7:47 p.m. [1:24:40])

None

XI PUBLIC COMMENT (7:47 p.m. [1:25:00])

None

XII APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (7:48 p.m. [1:25:50])

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7945 (7:48 p.m. [1:26:00])

ADDRESS: 14939 Warwick

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Rosedale Park

APPLICANT: Jimmie and Jonique Pharr

OWNER: Jimmie and Jonique Pharr

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace two wood casement windows with vinyl windows, paint exterior

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (6:46 p.m. [01:26:20])

Jimmie Pharr, the applicant provided a correction to the report. The proposal is for windows on the southwest and northwest second floor, not both on the south second floor as described in the report.

Commissioner Hamilton suggested that vinyl is not an appropriate material, and one-over-one is not an appropriate configuration for the windows. A six-over-six window would be appropriate.

Commissioner Machielse asked about the configuration of windows on the front facade.

The applicant stated that the center windows on the front facade second floor are bathroom windows that are one-over-one, and the windows on either side are bedroom windows that are “six-over-six” (twelve light) casement windows.

Commissioner Miriani suggested that the Commission would approve wood, double-hung, six-over-six windows.

Commissioner Franklin agreed that the proposed material and configuration were not appropriate.

Commissioner Hamilton suggested that aluminum-clad wood windows would also be appropriate.

ACTION (ONE) (8:01 p.m. [1:37:50])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7945 for 14939 Warwick**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of wood windows **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Commission issues this Certificate of Appropriateness under the condition that:

- The wood windows shall be replaced by six-over-six double-hung wood or aluminum-clad wood windows and that staff should have the opportunity to review the technical specifications of the windows for fitting into the opening before issuing the certificate of appropriateness.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioners Hamilton, Miriani, and Franklin clarified that this Certificate of Appropriateness is intended to apply to the proposed paint color as well.

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7947 (8:02 p.m. [1:37:55])

ADDRESS: 913 Chicago

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston Edison

APPLICANT: Matt Smith (Bruttell Roofing Co.)

OWNER: Lauren Thiel

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace slate roof with asphalt roofing (work completed without approval).

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (8:02 p.m. [01:38:00])

Commissioner Franklin noted that the work was completed without prior approval.

Staff noted that the applicant was having technical difficulties; Commissioner Franklin suggested that the Commissioners begin the discussion while waiting.

Commissioner Hamilton asked about the staff report, noting that Brutell Roofing has experience repairing slate roofs, and that they have stated in the application that the roof is beyond repair.

Commissioner Miriani noted that the applicant also provided an estimate to repair the roof for \$29,000, suggesting that the roof is indeed repairable. This suggests that the replacement was not necessary.

Commissioner Machielse noted that asphalt roofs require periodic maintenance at flashings and penetrations, and that failure can often be rectified by repairing these items without replacing the entire roof.

The applicant, [inaudible] Edwards of Bruttell Roofing, stated that the roof condition was such that repairing it would be dangerous, and might not successfully ameliorate the conditions noted. Water infiltration had created an emergency situation within the home, and that the homeowner, after applying for a building permit, had chosen to repair the roof prior to waiting for approval of the application.

Staff noted that the application suggested that the slate roof had not yet been removed at the time of the application; staff discovered the removal during a site visit. The garage is not part of this application and still has a slate roof.

Commissioners Franklin and Hamilton suggested that, because the application states the roof is not repairable and yet provides a cost estimate for repair, the application required additional clarity and is, therefore, not complete.

ACTION (ONE) (8:18 p.m. [1:54:50])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7947 for 913 Chicago**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- (2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- (5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- (6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

Commissioner Hamilton suggested that a new application, with additional information and clarification, might warrant approval.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7949 (8:20 p.m. [1:57:05])

ADDRESS: 2011 Longfellow

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston Edison

APPLICANT: Mario Mongini

OWNER: Mario Mongini

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace wood windows with new fiberglass units (work completed without approval) and install exterior wood muntins, alter front porch and steps, install step wingwalls and railings and remove planter box (work completed without approval).

Commissioner Machielse noted that he was retained by the applicant and recused himself.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (8:20 p.m. [01:57:35])

The applicant, Mario Mongini, stated that the windows were in poor condition and he selected windows and trim that closely matched the appearance of the historic windows. The applicant noted that a prior application for this work had been denied in November. The applicant also stated that violations pertaining to the porch predate his purchase of the house.

Staff clarified that the fiberglass windows had already been installed, without approval, at the time of the November application and denial. Presently before the Commission is a revised application with proposed modification to the windows.

Staff and the applicant discussed the aluminum coil stock. The applicant would like to remove it, but this was not stated in the application. The applicant suggested this change would be appropriate as shown in historic photos of the house.

Commissioners Miriani and Hamilton suggested that the current windows might not be large enough to fit the openings, creating a gap. There is not enough information to determine if the proposed work is appropriate or inappropriate.

The applicant withdrew the application.

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7950 (8:36 p.m. [2:13:57])

ADDRESS: 2550 W. Boston

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison

APPLICANT: Kristyn Patterson

OWNER: Kristyn Patterson

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace wood windows with aluminum-clad wood windows, erect fence

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (8:37 p.m. [02:14:20])

Staff noted that the applicant was not present.

Commissioner Hamilton noted that the window and door openings are important character-defining features and asked about their current condition. Staff described the openings.

Commissioners Hamilton, Miriani, Machielse, and staff discussed the details of the application, and suggested that the proposed muntin configuration may not be appropriate.

Commissioner Miriani suggested that it would be helpful to have more detail in the application, and to have the applicant present for discussion.

ACTION (ONE) (8:49 p.m. [02:26:20])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7950 for 2550 W. Boston**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of wood windows with aluminum-clad wood windows WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- (2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- (5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- (6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (8:50 p.m. [02:27:40])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7950 for 2550 W. Boston**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed erection of the rear privacy fence WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Privacy fence stain or paint provided to HDC staff for review and approval before installation.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7951 (6:51p.m. [02:28:40])

ADDRESS: 1773 Parker

HISTORIC DISTRICT: West Village

APPLICANT: Jennifer Lyon

OWNER: Jennifer Lyon

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace glass block windows on enclosed rear porch with vinyl windows.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (8:53 p.m. [02:29:20])

Jennifer Lyon, the applicant, described the application.

Commissioner Hamilton noted that a prior application has already been approved for windows for this location, but suggested that the windows shown in the current application are inappropriate. The applicant stated that there is difficulty finding the windows previously approved.

Commissioner Miriani agreed that the proposed windows are inappropriate, and suggested if there is difficulty finding aluminum-clad wood windows as previously approved, finding unclad wood windows might be possible.

ACTION (9:01 p.m. [2:38:40])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7951 for 1773 Parker**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standard:

(6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7956 (9:02 p.m. [2:39:50])

ADDRESS: 1427 Atkinson

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Atkinson Avenue

APPLICANT: John McCarter

OWNER: Daniel J. Tanner and Jacinda Bowman

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace eight wood windows with aluminum-clad wood windows

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (9:04 p.m. [02:41:20])

James Halfacer, project manager for John McCarter Construction, described the condition of the windows, stating that many components are rotted or missing. The applicant stated that the proposal attempts to mimic the muntin configuration of the existing windows, except for window #3, where a comparable window was not available.

Commissioner Machielse opined that the existing windows appear to be repairable.

Commissioner Hamilton said that the existing windows are important to the character of the house.

Commissioner Machielse suggested that window repair estimates would be helpful in determining if the windows were repairable.

The applicant stated that they had contacted window rehabilitation contractors who were not interested in taking on the project.

ACTION (9:13 p.m. [2:50:50])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7956 for 1427 Atkinson**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- (2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- (5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- (6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7953 (9:15 p.m. [2:52:20])

ADDRESS: 610 Chicago

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison

APPLICANT: Becky Beveridge, Strawberry Solar

OWNER: Anitrah Hurley

SCOPE OF WORK: Install solar panels

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (9:15 p.m. [2:52:40])

Seger Weissberg of Strawberry Solar stated that his company has experience installing solar panels in historic districts in locations that are not visible from the street; however, after studying this particular property, they determined that there are few effective solar panel locations other than on the front of the house.

Commissioner Miriani opined that although the Commission has approved proposals for solar panels elsewhere, in this proposal the change to the appearance of the building would be too great due to the number of panels and their location on the front façade.

Commissioner Machielse noted that solar panels are not mentioned in the Elements of Design for Boston-Edison.

ACTION (ONE) (9:24 p.m. [03:01:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7953 for 610 Chicago**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the solar panels for the dwelling's south-facing roof **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- (2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

Commissioner Lockhart: SUPPORT

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (9:25 p.m. [03:02:45])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7953 for 610 Chicago**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the solar panels for the garage's south-facing roof **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7954 (9:27 p.m. [03:04:25])

ADDRESS: 5021 Tireman

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Blue Bird Inn

APPLICANT: Jonah Raduns-Silverstein, Detroit Sound Conservancy

OWNER: Detroit Sound Conservancy

SCOPE OF WORK: Install vinyl windows at front elevation

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (9:27 p.m. [03:04:45])

Staff summarized the proposal.

Alyson Turner of the Detroit Sound Conservancy described the project to restore the Blue Bird Inn to its appearance during the Period of Significance.

ACTION (9:32 p.m. [03:09:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7954 for 5021 Tireman**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The proposed windows be specified as aluminum, steel, or other finish material contemporary with a mid-century commercial building, and corresponding to the door, as confirmed by staff, and;
- The outermost two rows of glass block at the perimeter of the eastern window be preserved, and that the new window described above be set within this existing historic fabric, and;
- Replacement glass block, as needed at the eastern window, be of an exact matching design to the preserved block at the western window. Some or all of the removed block at the center of the western window may be repurposed at the east.

Commissioner Lockhart: SUPPORT

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7955 (9:34 p.m. [03:11:10])

ADDRESS: 4440 E. Canfield

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Sweetest Heart of Mary Roman Catholic Parish

APPLICANT: David Schott

OWNER: Catholic Archdiocese

SCOPE OF WORK: Install telecommunication equipment at steeple (work completed without approval).

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (9:34 p.m. [03:11:35])

Wallace Haley, on behalf of the applicant, T-Mobile, provided clarification regarding the size and appearance of the proposed antenna.

Commissioners discussed the appearance of the proposed work and the work already completed and asked questions. The applicant suggested that they could prepare a demonstration to help the staff and Commission better understand the proposed work.

The applicant withdrew the application.

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7939, 22-7940, 22-7941, 22-7942, 22-7943, 22-7944

ADDRESS: 346-362 W. Grand Boulevard, 3636 Porter

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Hubbard Farms

APPLICANT: Tim Flintoff, 4545 Architecture

OWNER: Detroit Land Bank Authority

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect two multi-unit townhouse buildings and detached garage

Commissioner Machielse recused himself.

ACTION (TWO) (9:53 p.m. [03:30:00])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

The Commission find that the proposed project at **346-362 W. Grand Boulevard and 3636 Porter** will have a demonstrable effect on the Hubbard Farms Historic District and the effect is likely to be beneficial. The determination will be reported to the Mayor and the City Council for their consideration.

Commissioner Lockart: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0 (Abstention by Machielse)

MOTION CARRIED

XIII CITY PROJECTS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (9:55 p.m. [03:32:00])

None

XIV OLD BUSINESS (9:55 p.m. [03:32:00])

None

XV NEW BUSINESS (9:55 p.m. [03:32:00])

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7976 (9:55 p.m. [03:32:00])

ADDRESS: 312 Waterman

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Frank H. Beard School

APPLICANT: n/a

OWNER: Detroit Public Schools Community District

SCOPE OF WORK: Demolish fire-damaged building.

Staff explained that BSEED issued an emergency demolition notice for this building.

Chairperson Franklin received the staff report.

XVI ADJOURNEMENT (9:57 p.m. (03:34:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved to adjourn the meeting at 9:57 p.m.

Commissioner Hosey: SUPPORT

Ayes 5 Nay 0

MOTION CARRIED

LIST OF ACRONYMS

- Building Safety Engineering, and Environmental Department (BSEED)
- Historic District (HD)
- Historic District Advisory Board (HDAB)
- Historic District Commission (HDC)
- HDC Staff
 - AD: Audra Dye
 - TB: Timothy Boscarino
 - BB: Benjamin Buckley
 - DR: Dan Rieden
 - GL: Garrick Landsberg
 - JR: Jennifer Ross
- Planning & Development Department (PDD)