

DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

Date: April 13, 2022

Due to COVID-19 restrictions, this meeting was held jointly in person and electronically via Zoom Meeting Link and audio-recorded.

[Actual Time] / Audio Recording Time Stamp

AGENDA

[05:38 pm] 00:08:15

I CALL TO ORDER

Commissioner Hamilton called the meeting to order at 5:39 p.m.

[05:40 pm] 00:08:30

II ROLL CALL

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION		PRESENT	ABSENT
Tiffany Franklin	Chair	X (late)	
James Hamilton, Detroit	Chair Pro Tem	X	
Richard Hosey, Detroit	Commissioner	X (late)	
Alease Johnson	Commissioner	X	
Brandon Lockhart, Detroit	Commissioner	X	
Dennis Miriani, Detroit	Vice Chair Pro Tem	X	
STAFF			
Brendan Cagney	PDD	X	
Audra Dye	PDD	X	
Garrick Landsberg	PDD	X	
Daniel Rieden	PDD	X	
Jennifer Ross	PDD	X	
Rebecca Savage	HDAB	X	

[05:40 pm] 00:08:48

III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Commissioner Miriani moved to approve the Agenda with the following change:

- Removed **19388 Stratford** from the agenda

Commissioner Johnson - SUPPORT

Ayes – 4 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[05:41 pm] 00:9:33

IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

None

[05:41 pm] 00:9:33

V REPORTS

Director Landsberg reported on the following items:

- Candidates are being interviewed for the two open Commissioner positions and hope to have an announcement in the May HDC meeting.
- PDD is opening a hiring process for the position left by Ann Phillips, who has left the HDC Staff last month.

[05:42 pm] 00:10:12

Chairperson Franklin has joined the meeting.

[05:43 pm]
00:10:37

VI APPROVAL OF APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO CONSENT AGENDA

Commissioner Miriani moved to add 664-676 W. Alexandrine to the consent agenda:

Commissioner A. Johnson - SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Miriani moved to approve the consent agenda

Commissioner A. Johnson - SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[05:45 pm]
00:13:50

VII POSTPONED APPLICATION

None

[05:45 pm]
00:13:50

VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS)

None

IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

[05:45 pm]
00:13:50

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7735 GL**

ADDRESS: 1416-1444 Michigan Ave.

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Corktown HD

APPLICANT: Tim Flintoff/4545architecture

OWNER: Anthony O'Donnell (1444), 1400 Michigan Llc (1416)

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect addition, other exterior alterations

PROPOSAL: Per the submitted drawings, documents, and narrative, the applicant is proposing to erect a rooftop addition flanking the historic 3-story section, a rooftop deck, and an adjacent 1-story garage entrance block, and other exterior alterations including the following:

- 2nd story - Replace windows on west elevation
- 3rd story expansion/addition of approximately 650 SF
- Cementitious lap siding (color charcoal gray) proposed to clad new elements
- Fiberglass (Pella Impervia, double-hung, simulated divided lites) windows
- Roof terrace with planters and glass/aluminum railing
- Exterior stair to 3rd floor roof terrace

[06:01pm]
00:29:09

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

- Mike Litoris is a property owner in the area, raised concern about the noise coming from this structure.

END (AUDIO)

[6:02 pm]
00:30:48

[5:48pm]
00:16:43

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- Applicant– Josh Maddox and Tim Flintoff described handrail and roof deck options. Anthony O'Donnell, the owner also joined the meeting and described the original cornice and recreating it. However, he hasn't found any records other than some building record that this was removed in the 1940s.

- Commissioners ask if there is any documentation of the cornice. Commissioners discuss the options for the cornice and its materiality and encouraged the applicant to pursue this.
- Commissioners discuss the option for the glass railing.
- Commissioners discuss a 3-foot setback and reapply the cornice as presented in the application.

[6:00 pm]
00:27:50

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7735 for 1416 – 1444 Michigan Avenue** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness with no conditions for the proposed work.

Commissioner Lockhart – SUPPORT

Ayes –5 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[06:02 pm]
00:31:30

- **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7707 DR**

ADDRESS: 17664 Manderson

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Palmer Park Apartment Buildings HD

APPLICANT: Kevin M. Brandon

OWNER: Robert Christoph

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect trash enclosure structure, ~~replace windows (work completed without approval)~~

PROPOSAL: The area proposed for the trash structure is at the apex of Manderson and Covington Drive. It currently contains an exposed 6-yard trash container with no screening. A concrete pad is existing and will be removed prior to start of the project. The applicant states that the proposed 13’x15’ structure is designed in the architectural style and material/color palate as the existing townhome buildings it is intended to serve. The construction of the trash enclosures is of brick veneer facing on wood frame construction. The brick veneer selected closely resembles the existing brick of the townhome building. The structure is be roofed with asphalt shingles to closely match the existing townhome building. The structure will have a secured access door for the apartment tenants. There will also be an overhead door that will completely secure the trash containers. An existing chain link fence in poor condition will be replaced with an ornamental steel fence. See attached photos and drawings.

Product Data- See attached brochures and cut sheets for additional information:

- Brick: Glen-Gery, 160M, Rugged Texture, Gray Mortar
- Shingles: GAF, Timberline UHD, Shakewood
- Gutters: K-Style, Matte Black
- Overhead Door: Clopay, Model 1500, Sectional Steel, Black
- Windows: Andersen 400 Series, Aluminum, Fixed, Black
- Man Door: TRU Door, Flush Hollow Metal, Black
- Siding: James Hardie Select Cedarmill Lap, Artic White
- Trim, Frieze, Fascia, Rakes: James Hardie Composite, Black
- Steel Fence: Guardsman, Kent 2 Rail, Black

[06:08 pm]

00:36:54

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

None

[06:08 pm]

00:36:54

END (AUDIO)

[6:07 pm]

00:34:18

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- Staff noted to the Commission that the applicant removed the windows scope of work from the application, leaving the trash structure as the remaining scope of work for this application.
- Applicant– Kevin Brandon, representing the owner, Robert Christoph, agrees with the staff recommendations and conditions presented by the staff report and willing to brick to the gables and change the color to an off-white color for the gables.
- Commissioner asked about the windows, and the staff confirmed that the windows were replaced. Staff reminded the commissioners that an applicant can withdraw any part of an application prior to the vote on the application or parts of it. The windows remain in violation and subject to enforcement until they apply for this to the Commission.
- Applicant struck the windows from the application so that they can have more time to address this issue, and wish to address this issue at the next meeting.

[6:11 pm]

00:38:55

ACTION

Commissioner A. Johnson moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7707 for 17664 Manderson** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The applicant provides drawings to HDC staff for review and approval that show the trash structure to be brick, with the exception of the front and rear gables, which can remain Hardie-board, color off-white.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes –5 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0

MOTION CARRIED

X CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

[6:13 pm]

00:42:00

None

[6:13 pm]

00:42:00

XI PUBLIC COMMENT

- Mr. Francis Grunow announced that the United Artists Building was in the press recently and wanted to give HDC notice.

XII APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

[6:16 pm]

00:45:00

- **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7737 DR**
VIOLATION NUMBER: 445

ADDRESS: 391-393 W. Grand Blvd., 3821-3823 Shady Lane

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Hubbard Farms HD

APPLICANTS: Theodore E. Dapkus/ Kestutis Miskinis

OWNER: Napoleonas Miskinis Living Trust/Mkd Properties

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace windows with vinyl and glass block*, apply mural*, install glass block windows at basement

PROPOSAL: The proposed work consists of two projects for both buildings: replacement of all windows with vinyl for the first and second floors of both buildings (work completed) and the replacement of all basement windows with glass block (work completed at 3821-3823 Shady Lane), and the installation of a mural on the alley brick wall of 3821-3823 Shady Lane.

Window Replacement (391-393 W. Grand and 3821-3823 Shady Lane)

- Remove all original windows and replace with Weather King Window Company vinyl windows.
- Remove all original basement windows and replace with “Decora deco style” glass block with vents in each window, supplied by Sabiston Builders Supply. (Work complete at 3821-3823 Shady Lane)

Mural Application on Brick Wall (3821-3823 Shady Lane)

- Application of mural by former tenant Juan Rodriquez and a graffiti artist “Lucka”, who is now deceased. (Work completed without the owner’s permission but has been allowed to remain.)
- -OR- Repaint brick

[6:20 pm]
00:47:34

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Applicant/Owner Kestutis Miskunis present. Thanked the staff for the work. Explained that his mother was medical physician at this 2-family flat for 60 years. Prior to her death in 2013, she contracted and installed the vinyl windows. Applicant apologized for this work without a permit. Building has been in the family for 50 years. Applicant said that the lead abatement requirements caused the window replacement. Applicant is willing to leave the windows for 391-393 W. Grand the basement windows. Mural was not authorized by the owner. Applicant described the history of the mural.
- Commissioners asked when the windows were replaced. Applicant stated that it was done back in 2013. June 2011 was observed by staff that the original windows were still in place.
- Commissioners asked if screening could occur in front of the glass block. Applicant is willing to do this. Staff stated that it appears that it can be screened with planting.
- Commissioners asked questions about the use of storm windows instead of glass block.
- Commissioners received confirmation of Hubbard Farms establishment in 1993.

[6:31 pm]
00:58:07

[COMMISSIONER HOSEY JOINED THE MEETING]

- Commissioner discuss replacement of the vinyl windows and encapsulation or removal of lead paint.
- Applicant asked Commissioners on what would be appropriate in place of vinyl windows. Commissioners described alternatives and asked that the Applicant to come back with a proposal that includes features such as divided light, exposed

brick molding, not vinyl. The Commissioners also stated their willingness to work with the Applicant in stages over a period of time.

[6:37 pm]
01:06:20

ACTION ONE

Commissioner Hamilton move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7737 for 391 – 393 W. Grand and 3821-3823 Shady Lane**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application to replace wood windows with vinyl windows and to replace basement wood windows with glass block WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
- 6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Lockhart – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[6:39 pm]
01:07:20

ACTION TWO

Commissioner Hamilton move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7737 for 3821-3823 Shady Lane**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the application of a mural WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

Commissioner A. Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[06:41 pm]
01:10:56

- **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-7738 DR
VIOLATION NUMBERS: 536, 580
ADDRESS: 1725 W. Boston
HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD
APPLICANT/PROPERTY OWNER: Olivier Lecanu

SCOPE OF WORK: Remove clay tile roof and install asphalt roofing at house/garage*, replace driveway and sidewalk

PROPOSAL:

The proposed work consists of two projects: the replacement of clay tile roofs of both the house and garage with asphalt shingle roofing and the replacement of the front brick sidewalk and concrete two-track driveway with concrete paving. The roof work is nearly complete and the paving work is complete.

House and Garage Roof Replacement

- Remove all clay tile roof for the house and the garage.
- Install dimensional asphalt shingles for the house and garage.
- Shingles: Atlas/Storm Master Shake, Color: Copper Canyon

Replace driveway and front walkway

- Remove sidewalk bricks and concrete two-track driveway.
- Pour concrete for 1400 SF driveway and 200 SF walkway.
- Color grey, broom finish with smooth borders.

[06:42 pm]
01:10:34

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- Applicant Olivier Lecanu is present and stated that the house was vacant for 9 years and described the poor condition of the roof. The applicant described the process of trying to fix the roof with contractors. He found a contractor that said that the valleys of the roof were not in good condition. He noticed that other houses had asphalt and stated that he did not know he needed HDC permission.
- Commissioners asked when property was acquired by owner- 2015 is the owner's purchase time.
- Commissioners discuss the violation and work and the importance of the roof's character defining features of the house and garage. Commissioners see no proof of the tile's condition.
- Commissioners ask if there is any tile left. Applicant states that there is very little tile roof left.
- Commissioners discuss (after the motions passed) ideas for the applicant on the type of features that would be acceptable: metal roofs, roofs with dimensionality and texture. The HDC has approved past products, 85 Chicago in Boston Edison, is an example.
- Commissioners and applicant discuss the current conditions of the roof and underlayment of the roof. Applicant has confirmed that the roof is being protected currently. Staff has authority to replace underlayment if needed.

[06:51 pm]
01:20:56

ACTION ONE

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7738 for 1725 W. Boston**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of the clay tile roof with asphalt roofing WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Hosey– SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[06:52 pm]
01:21:56

ACTION TWO

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7738 for 1725 W. Boston**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of the sidewalk and driveway with concrete WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hosey– SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[7:02PM]
01:29:00

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7744 GL**

ADDRESS: 603 E. Milwaukee

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Jam Handy/ E. Grand Blvd. HD

APPLICANT: DS Architects

OWNER: Ed Fish, Peerless Realty, LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace windows

PROPOSAL:

Per the submitted drawings and documents, the applicant proposes to replace the original steel sash factory windows, non-historic steel windows, and original wood office windows with new windows of the same type throughout. This is scope that was denied approval at the November 2021 Meeting of this body. Per the Rules of Procedure, the applicant has returned with additional information, including cost quotes for rehabilitation work, which makes the scope eligible for additional review by the Commission.

[7:02 PM]
01:29:34

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Applicant and their consultant presented conditions of the wood and steel windows.
- Commissioners discuss distinction between the metal and wood windows conditions. They saw that wood windows did not seem to get the same attention as the metal windows.

- Staff and the consultant discuss conditions of the windows. Staff made a comparison that the wood are more repairable than the steel windows.
- Commissioners discuss how the restoration of the wood windows is favored over the steel windows.

[07:28 pm]
01:57:00

ACTION ONE

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7744 for 603 E. Milwaukee**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed replacement of original wood windows at the primary St. Antoine and E. Milwaukee WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 1) A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
- 6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- 9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[07:29 pm]
01:58:00

ACTION TWO

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7744 for 603 E. Milwaukee**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed replacement of steel windows at the primary elevations (St. Antoine/East Milwaukee) WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards

of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[07:30 pm]
01:59:00

Chairperson Franklin stepped out of the meeting. Vice Chair Miriani assumes the Chair.

[07:30 pm]
02:00:00

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7745 DR**

VIOLATION NUMBER: 541

ADDRESS: 2525 W. Boston

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD

APPLICANT/PROPERTY OWNER: Sterling Howard

SCOPE OF WORK: Remove porte cochère*, install front porch and steps*, paint house trim*, rehabilitate windows and doors(work completed without approval)

PROPOSAL:

The proposed work consists of four scopes of work: the removal of the porte cochère, install front porch and new steps, paint house trim and rehabilitate windows on the first floor. All work is complete except the windows.

Remove porte cochère

- This work was completed by a previous owner.

Install front porch and new steps

- Install elevated 9’x6’ (54SF) front porch with brick foundation and 4” concrete deck
- Install 8’ wide concrete steps
- Install metal railing to match existing metal railing of the balcony
- Tuck point and repair brick

Paint house trim

- Using Sherwin Williams paint, SW 6141, paint house trim to existing color off-white color, which was painted this color by a previous owner.

Rehabilitate windows and doors

- Remove windows and doors of the first-floor front and east elevations.
- Sand frames to remove old paint
- Replace broken or missing glass
- Strip paint from hinges and hardware
- Reinstall all hardware, hinges, windows and doors
- Weatherstrip and paint with existing colors to match

[07:33 pm]
02:01:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Applicant not present.
- Commissioners discuss the porte-cochere condition, design, size and supports to hold it up that caused interference with the neighbor’s driveway. Discussion around the design to allow passage of cars. Commissioners discuss the integrity of the feature, and the question if it remains a character-defining feature or ever was a character-defining feature of this house.
- Commissioners do not have any basis other than denial and stated that they needed the applicant to be present.

[07:47 pm]
02:15:00

ACTION ONE

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7745 for 2525 W. Boston**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the removal of the porte-cochere and replacement of the front steps and flanking wingwalls with the proposed front porch WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
- 6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Lockhart – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[07:49 pm]
02:17:00

Chairperson Franklin resumes the Chair

[07:49 pm]
02:17:00

ACTION TWO

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7745 for 2525 W. Boston**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The applicant provides HDC staff clearly labeled photos of the interior and exterior of each door and window being rehabilitated.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[7:50PM]
02:19:00

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBERS:** #22-7746, #22-7747 DR

ADDRESS: 1127-1135 Vinewood

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Hubbard Farms HD

APPLICANT/OWNER: Louisa Howard & Devon Caldwell

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace garage door, install siding on dormer, replace paving, install fencing/landscape

PROPOSAL:

The proposed work consists of four scopes of work: replacement of the garage door, install siding on a rear dormer with hardie-board, replace and add paving, and install fencing for the property line and dog run, and landscaping.

Garage Door Replacement

Remove original garage doors and replace with steel Wayne Dalton 9700 Portland Top with 12 square windows, color choice green to match the previously approved color of the house.

Install Siding on Rear Dormer

From the previously HDC approved drawings (November 2020) for construction of a new rear dormer, the architect's note states, "siding to match existing dormer", which would be slate. This proposal seeks to replace the slate material with Hardie Shingle siding, painted green to match the color previously approved or gray/slate color to match the existing dormers.

Replace and Add Paving

Remove the cracked driveway, front cracked walkway and rear cracked walkways and patio paving. Pave the front walkway with concrete to match existing walkway. Install "Pure" brick pavers for the 918 SF driveway. Expand rear driveway apron per attached drawing with "Pure" brick pavers: 846 SF front of garage, 300 SF parking area, 313 SF alley access. Install rear paver walkway and landing (172SF) with "Pure" brick pavers. Replace rear 160 SF concrete patio with "Mista" pavers.

Install Fencing: Property Fence and Dog-run Fence

Along the southeast property line, remove the existing chain link fence and replace with a 6' wood panel fence. Just behind the neighbor's house, create a single scallop dip in the fence to accommodate a gate to the neighbor's property. Install Illusions "Old English Lattice Vinyl Fence" for a dog run, 4' in height, per attached drawing.

Landscaping

Plant 2 Korean lilacs, 4 dense yews, a prairie crabapple, a Cleveland pear, and two white pines per attached drawing. Add pea gravel around the 10'x15' fire pit area. Landscape plantings along front façade of the house, fence line, and rear yard per attached drawings.

[8:03 PM]
02:20:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Applicants gave kudos to the HDC staff.
- The applicant addressed items that were not recommended for approval by the staff report: the front portion of the driveway, the replacement of the garage door, and installation of the dog fence.
- Applicant confirmed that the garage door material is wood and described the door's condition. Respectfully disagreed with the staff's report that the garage door could be repaired.
- Applicant points out that the dog fence area is not visible to the public.

- Commissioners question the proposed replication of the garage door and raised concerns on the materiality of the proposed work garage door, pavers and dog fence.
- Applicants like the design of the existing door and would like to find a design that is as close as possible.
- Commissioner Miriani has a photo of a door that was previously approved, which he recommended to the applicant as a reference.
- Staff raised issue of steel door being amendable and approvable by staff. Commissioner's agree that steel would be appropriate.

[08:08 pm]
02:31:00

ACTION ONE

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7746 and 22-7747 for 1127 – 1135 Vinewood**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of the garage door, installation of front yard concrete pavers, and installation of a dog fence (other than vinyl, preferably wood) **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Staff be allowed to approve the final garage door design.
- The dog fence be made of a material that is not vinyl, preferably wood.

Commissioner A. Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0 Abstain- 1 (Hamilton)

MOTION CARRIED

[08:03 pm]
02:33:00

ACTION TWO

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Amend previous motion to accommodate remaining scope of work for the COA which includes the rear dormer siding, front concrete walkway, rear concrete pavers, wood panel fencing and landscaping with the staff conditions as defined in the Staff Report.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The Hardie board siding be of a color that approximates the existing slate siding of the dormers.
- Staff receive a final landscape plan showing the location and species of proposed trees.
- The applicant provides HDC staff a review of the above items before installation.

Commissioner A. Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION AMENDED TO INCLUDE ADDITIONAL SCOPE IN PREVIOUS MOTION.

[8:05PM]
02:35:00

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBERS:** #22-7748, 22-7749, 22-7750 AD

ADDRESS: 2224-2248 Burns

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Indian Village HD

APPLICANT/OWNER: Blaine Riley

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace fence, replace window with door, erect stoop

PROPOSAL:

- Remove window on north side of house and enlarge the opening for new door. Erect step and landing for new door opening.
- Repair and repaint garage doors and trim on house and garage. Color: B:18, Dark Reddish Brown.
- Remove existing wood fence at 2236 and 2248 Burns. Erect new wood fence in same location, and replace wood driveway gate with a new wood driveway gate.
 - Two fence designs to be used: a 6' solid board fence and 4' gothic picket-style fence (3" spacing between pickets). A natural stain will be applied to both fences. Locations of each fence style is shown on applicant's site plan.

[8:05PM]
02:35:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Applicants describe the project scope and agree with 3 of the 5 conditions. The two conditions that they would like to discuss with the Commission is regarding the oak door and cedar fence colors, where they would like to keep the natural color of the wood rather than paint it a color.
- Commissioners discuss whether the door and fence should be painted. They discuss if the wood should at least be sealed.

[08:13 pm]
02:42:00

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7748, 22-7749, and 22-7750 for 2224 – 2248 Burns**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The existing stone lintel of the window will remain in place to give evidence of the original opening.
- The side entry step and landing will not extend further from the wall than does the adjacent bay window, and will leave the existing driveway surface intact.
- The setback of the fence will be no closer to the sidewalk than the current fence, and could be set back further. The setback distance will be confirmed and added to the site plan for staff review.
- The wood fence sealed in a color to the occupants choosing in a light color that compliments the adjacent house. The selected color will be submitted for staff review.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[8:16PM]
02:45:00

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7752 AD**

ADDRESS: 15004 Warwick

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Rosedale Park HD

APPLICANT: Edward Palmer

OWNER: Edward Palmer

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace wood windows with vinyl windows

PROPOSAL:

Remove 12 true divided-light wood double-hung windows (six-over-six pattern).
Install 12 vinyl double-hung windows with between-the-glass grids (six-over-six pattern).

[8:16PM]
02:45:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Applicant not present.
- Commissioners agree with staff report

[08:19 pm]
02:47:00

ACTION

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7752 for 15004 Warwick**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the installation of vinyl windows as proposed WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED (Commissioner Hosey stepped out of the room)

[8:20pm]
02:48:00

XIII CITY PROJECTS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

None

XIV OLD BUSINESS

[8:20pm]
02:48:00

None

XV NEW BUSINESS

[8:21pm]
02:49:00

- **RESOLUTION 22-02: EXTENSION OF APPROVALS FOR TEMPORARY WORK IN RESPONSE TO COVID-19 PANDEMIC**

Commissioner Miriani moved to adopt Resolution 22-02 in response to the pandemic.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[08:25 pm]
02:53:50

- **COMMISSIONER ELECTIONS**

Commissioner Hamilton moved to postpone the election until the Commission is fully constituted.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes –6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[08:26 pm]
02:54:50

- **COMMISSIONER ELECTIONS**

Commissioner Hamilton moved to appoint Commissioner Miriani as Vice Chair.

Commissioner Lockhart – SUPPORT

Ayes –6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[8:26 pm]
02:55:00

XVI ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Miriani moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:30 pm.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

MEETING ADJOURNED

LIST OF ACRONYMS

- Building Safety Engineering, and Environmental Department (BSEED)
- Historic District (HD)
- Historic District Advisory Board (HDAB)
- Historic District Commission (HDC)
- HDC Staff
 - AD- Audra Dye
 - AP- Ann Phillips
 - BC- Brendan Cagney
 - DR- Dan Rieden
 - GL- Garrick Landsberg
 - JR – Jennifer Ross
- Planning & Development Department (PDD)