

**DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION SPECIAL MEETING**

Date: February 17, 2021

Due to COVID-19 restrictions, this meeting was held electronically via Zoom Meeting Link and audio-recorded.

Actual Time **AGENDA**

[05:38 pm] **I CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Commissioner Johnson called the meeting to order at 5:38 p.m.

[05:38 pm] **II ROLL CALL**

<b>HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION</b>		<b>PRESENT</b>	<b>ABSENT</b>
Katie Johnson, Detroit, Michigan	Chair	X	
Tiffany Franklin, Detroit, Michigan, <i>arrived at 6:00 p.m.</i>	Commissioner	X	
Jim Hamilton, Detroit, Michigan	Commissioner	X	
Richard Hosey, Detroit, Michigan	Commissioner		X
Alease Johnson, Detroit, Michigan	Commissioner	X	
Dennis Miriani, Detroit, Michigan	Commissioner	X	
.....			
<b>STAFF</b>			
Brendan Cagney	PDD	X	
Audra Dye	PDD	X	
Garrick Landsberg	PDD	X	
Ann Phillips	PDD	X	
Daniel Rieden	PDD	X	
Jennifer Ross	PDD	X	
Taylor Leonard	Law Dept.		X
Pamela Parrish	Law Dept.		X
Logan Patmon	Law Dept.	X	
Jennifer Reinhardt	HDAB		X
Rebecca Savage	HDAB	X	
Beatriz Tucker, Interpreter	CRIO	X	

[5:40 pm] **III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**

Mr. Landsberg said 894 Marlborough was removed from the agenda; the project will be reviewed at the March meeting.

Commissioner J. Hamilton asked that the following projects be moved to the Consent Agenda:

- #21-7051 1531 8th, Hubbard Farms HD**  
Rehabilitate building; replace missing cornice
- #21-7052 1686 Chicago, Boston-Edison HD**  
Erect new 7'-0" high driveway gate and fence
- #21-7098 4221 Cass, Units #300 & 400, Willis-Selden HD**  
Replace headers in both units; window system in #400
- #21-7093 19605 Stratford, Sherwood Forest HD**  
Replace vinyl windows with fiberglass windows
- #21-7101 1515 Chicago, Boston-Edison HD**  
Install new sliding doors within non-historic addition

Commissioner D. Miriani - SUPPORT

Ayes – 4      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

[5:42 pm] Commissioner J. Hamilton made a motion to approve the Agenda as modified.

Mr. Landsberg noted the applicant for 19605 Stratford may not have consented to the staff conditions.

Commissioner J. Hamilton withdrew his motion.

Commissioner A. Johnson - SUPPORT

[5:44 pm] Commissioner J. Hamilton moved to have the following four applications placed on the Consent Agenda.

**#21-7051 1531 8th, Hubbard Farms HD**

Rehabilitate building; replace missing cornice

**#21-7052 1686 Chicago, Boston-Edison HD**

Erect new 7'-0" high driveway gate and fence

**#21-7098 4221 Cass, Units #300 & 400, Willis-Selden HD**

Replace headers in both units; window system in #400

**#21-7101 1515 Chicago, Boston-Edison HD**

Install new sliding doors within non-historic addition

Commissioner A. Johnson - SUPPORT

Ayes – 4      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

[5:45 pm] Commissioner J. Hamilton moved to approve the Agenda as modified.

Commissioner D. Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 4      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES**

None

[5:46 pm] **V REPORTS**

Mr. Landsberg reported:

The Law Department is not available to support the HDC through the entire meeting, but is available upon request.

The Mayor's Office is considering candidates for the open Commissioner position.

[5:47 pm] **VI APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA**

Commissioner J. Hamilton made a motion to APPROVE the Consent Agenda consisting of the following projects, with staff recommendations and conditions (if present):

**#21-7051 1531 8th, Hubbard Farms HD**

Rehabilitate building; replace missing cornice

Brian Hurtienne, Applicant, accepted staff recommendation with conditions.

**#21-7052 1686 Chicago, Boston-Edison HD**

Erect new 7'-0" high driveway gate and fence

**Approved**

Steven Luplow, Applicant, accepted staff recommendation with conditions.

**#21-7098 4221 Cass, Units #300 & 400, Willis-Selden HD**  
Replace headers in both units; window system in #400  
Rob Knapp, Applicant, accepted staff recommendation with conditions.

**#21-7101 1515 Chicago, Boston-Edison HD**  
Install new sliding doors within non-historic addition  
Applicant not present; applicant confirmed (via email) acceptance of staff recommendation with conditions.

Commissioner D. Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 4      Nay - 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**VII POSTPONED APPLICATION**

None

**VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS)**

None

**IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING**

None

**X CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING**

None

**XI PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

**XII APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING**

[5:51 pm]

- **APPLICATION NUMBER:** 20-6959  
**ADDRESS:** 15327 WARWICK  
**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** ROSEDALE PARK  
**APPLICANT:** ERROL PARKS / GS GROUP THROUGH HOUSING & REVITALIZATION DEPARTMENT (21-7096); ALUNDA BOYKIN (21-7104)  
**OWNERS:** ALUNDA BOYKIN  
**SCOPE OF WORK:** REPLACE 12 EXISTING WINDOWS WITH VINYL WINDOWS

**PROPOSAL:**

The applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to replace (12) twelve double-hung windows and the existing asphalt shingle roof.

Window Replacement (21-7096):

- Window 1 – First floor, Front of home- wood, double hung – grid pattern 8/12 -  
- to be replaced with Vinyl Max double-hung vinyl window, as proposed, with unspecified grid pattern.

***Approved***

- Window 2- First Floor, Front of home - wood, double hung – grid pattern 8/12 -- to be replaced with Vinyl Max double-hung vinyl window, as proposed, with unspecified grid pattern.
- Window 3- First Floor, South Side (1) - wood, double hung – grid pattern 6/9 - - to be replaced with Vinyl Max double-hung vinyl window, as proposed, with unspecified grid pattern.
- Window 4- First Floor, South Side (2) - wood, double hung – grid pattern -- 6/9 to be replaced with Vinyl Max double-hung vinyl window, as proposed, with unspecified grid pattern.
- Window 5- First Floor, South Side (3) - wood, double hung – grid pattern 8/12 -- to be replaced with Vinyl Max double-hung vinyl window, as proposed, unspecified grid pattern.
- Window 6- First Floor, South Side (4)- wood, double hung – grid pattern 8/12 -- to be replaced with Vinyl Max double-hung vinyl window, as proposed, unspecified grid pattern.

**Roof Replacement (21-7096):**

- Remove existing asphalt shingle roof down to roof boards.
- Install new 7/16” OSB and new dimensional asphalt shingles to match existing color or approved historic color
  - Roof replacement to include new necessary underlays, ice and water shield at all eaves and valleys, and aluminum t-drip at all edges.

**Window Replacement (21-7104):**

- Window 1 –Second floor, South Side (1) wood, double hung – grid pattern 6/6 -- to be replaced with Hanson’s double-hung vinyl window, as proposed, with 2x1 grid pattern.
- Window 2 –Second floor, South Side (2) wood, double hung – grid pattern 6/6 -- to be replaced with Hanson’s double-hung vinyl window, as proposed, with 2x1 grid pattern.
- Window 3 –Second floor, Rear (2) non- original (material unknown) double hung, 1/1 – Bathroom window, to be replaced with Hanson’s double-hung vinyl window, as proposed, with no grid pattern and half-obscurd glass.
- Window 4 –Second floor, North Side (1) wood, double hung – grid pattern 6/6 -- to be replaced with Hanson’s double-hung vinyl window, as proposed, with 2x1 grid pattern.
- Window 5 –Second floor, North Side (2) wood, double hung – grid pattern 6/6 -- to be replaced with Hanson’s double-hung vinyl window, as proposed, with 2x1 grid pattern.
- Window 6 –Second floor, North Side (3) wood, double hung – grid pattern 6/6 -- to be replaced with Hanson’s double-hung vinyl window, as proposed, with 2x1 grid pattern.

[6:14 pm]  
[1:12 audio]

**ACTION**

Commissioner J. Hamilton:

I move that:

Having duly reviewed the proposed replacement of the wood windows as proposed in Application #21-7096 and #21-7104 for 15327 Warwick, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed work WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE

**Approved**

according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

*6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner T. Franklin – SUPPORT

Aye - 5      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

[6:17 pm]

Commissioner J. Hamilton:

I move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #21-7096 for 15327 Warwick, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed roof work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner T. Franklin – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

[6:23 pm]

Commissioner J. Hamilton moved to amend the approval for the roof to include the approval of replacing the existing vinyl window with a new vinyl window as proposed.

Commissioner A. Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

[6:25 pm]

- **APPLICATION NUMBER:** 21-7103

**ADDRESS:** 14500 ROSEMONT

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** ROSEDALE PARK

**APPLICANT:** FRANK MASTROIANNI/ITALY AMERICAN (CONTRACTOR)

**OWNER:** ALAN JACOBSON

**SCOPE OF WORK:** REPLACE THREE WINDOWS REBUILD PORTION OF FRONT ELEVATION WALL

**PROPOSAL:**

With the current proposal, the applicant has submitted an application stating that the bay window at the building's south elevation is heavily deteriorated and must be rehabilitated according to the following scope of work:

- Remove the existing shrub which blocks the south elevation bay window (species unknown)

**Approved**

- Remove the three existing wood-sash, double-hung 4/4 windows at the south elevation bay window, to include the sash, trim and wood sill.
  - Replace rotten studs in the wall and rotten sill plate
  - Remove plaster and insulation\*
  - Install new wall insulation and drywall\*
  - Install three new double-hung window units, to include trim and sills. The new windows will be white Andersen Woodwright units with simulated divided lite muntins and interior spacer bars. According to the manufacturer's website, the windows are "wood with Fibrex composite exterior." The current proposal has not indicated if the new windows will match the existing windows' lite configuration.
  - Salvage the brick and stone veneer below the windows at the south elevation bay. Repair damage and reinstall to match existing/historic appearance.
- \*Interior work not subject to HDC jurisdiction but submitted by applicant, should be considered information only

[6:46 pm]  
[1:44 audio]

**ACTION**

Commissioner A. Johnson:

I move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #21-7103 for 14500 Rosemont, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines that the work as proposed **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a **DENIAL** for the proposed work item:

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

*2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

*5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

*6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner A. Johnson moved to amend the motion to state the denial is for the proposed replacement of the windows.

Commissioner J. Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes – 3    Nay – 0    Abstain – 1, K. Johnson

**MOTION DID NOT PASS**

[6:56]  
[1:54 audio]

Commissioner Miriani rejoined the meeting (he had been disconnected due to a technical issue). Commissioner A. Johnson reread the motion and a new vote was taken.

Aye – 4    Nay – 0    Abstain – 1, K. Johnson

**MOTION CARRIED**

[6:59 pm]  
[1:57 audio]

Commissioner A. Johnson:

I move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #21-7103 for 14500 Rosemont, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed scope of work (removal of existing shrub blocking bay window, replacement of rotten studs in the wall and rotten sill plate, salvage the brick and stone veneer below the windows at the south elevation bay, repair damage and reinstall to match existing/historic appearance) WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner D. Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5    Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

[7:02 pm]  
[2:00 audio]

• **APPLICATION NUMBER:** 21-7089

**ADDRESS:** 15519 PIEDMONT

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** ROSEDALE PARK

**APPLICANT:** PETER DENICOLA

**OWNER:** MASAKO GREEN

**SCOPE OF WORK:** INSTALL NEW SOLAR PANELS

**PROPOSAL**

The current owner is working through a contractor, and has provided an application, engineering analysis, 3D modeling and site photos for the following proposed work: Install roof-mounted, 3.84 kW grid-tied, solar modules (12) and battery (1) on front and rear roof elevations. See attached detailed documents provided by the applicant.

[7:18 pm]  
[2:16 audio]

**ACTION**

Commissioner T. Franklin:

I move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #21-7089 for 15519 Piedmont, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines that the installation of solar panels on the front elevation WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a DENIAL for the proposed work item:

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

**Approved**

9) *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

Commissioner D. Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5    Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

Commissioner T. Franklin:

I move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #21-6997 for 15519 Piedmont, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the solar panels proposed for the rear elevation location on the roof shed dormer WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner D. Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 4                      Nay – 1, J. Hamilton

**MOTION CARRIED**

[7:24 pm]  
[2:22 audio]

• **APPLICATION NUMBER:** 21-7049

**ADDRESS:** 700 SEWARD

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** NEW CENTER

**APPLICANT:** BRIAN HURTTIENNE/ CHRISTIAN HURTIENNE  
ARCHITECTS

**PROPERTY OWNER:** KEVIN LEWAND, 700 SEWARD DETROIT, LLC

**SCOPE OF WORK:** WALL VENTS (WORK DONE WITHOUT APPROVAL)

**PROPOSAL**

This proposal contains the following scope of work (see also attached drawings provided by the applicant):

- Add HVAC unit installation openings on the exterior at the following locations:
  - o East and West elevations/ facades
  - o East and West facades of the courtyard
  - o North Elevation
- Cover each opening with extruded aluminum grills which are colored in *Brick Red 1* or *White Stone*, where they are in areas of either brick or limestone respectively.
- This proposal includes work already complete.

[7:41 pm]  
[2:39 audio]

**ACTION**

Commissioner A. Johnson:

I move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #21-7049 for 700 Seward, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic



**Approved**

Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:*

- The applicant shall provide HDC Staff with the final location drawings of each proposed HVAC unit installation openings that clearly notes locations of current work complete and work proposed of each elevation.
- All existing and new grills shall be finished in a color that blends with their adjacent wall surface.
- Staff shall receive the opportunity to review and approve this submission prior to the issuance of the permit.

Commissioner D. Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5    Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

[7:43 pm]  
[2:41 audio]

• **APPLICATION NUMBER:**

**ADDRESS:** 14935 WESTWOOD

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** ROSEDALE PARK

**APPLICANT:** EDWARD WENZ / CTI CONTRACTOR SERVICES, LLC

**OWNERS:** DEMARYST GARWOOD

**SCOPE OF WORK:** REPLACE ALL WINDOWS DUE TO LEAD CONTENT

**PROPOSAL**

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to remediate the lead hazards of the home through the following scope of work:

Window Replacement:

- Replace (17) seventeen double-hung windows, including sash, jamb, trim and sill, with new Quaker wood window units.
  - The window frames of the proposed units are generally within 3/8" of existing frame size.
- Window types include 6/6, 4/4, 8/1, 3/1 and 1/1.
  - The proposed windows feature exterior applied muntins to match the original configuration of the existing windows.
  - Proposed muntins are 1/8" larger than existing muntins.
- Applicant proposes to remove the exterior steel protection bars from the exterior of the windows.

Enclosure of existing trim on soffit and fascia:

- The applicant is proposing to cover the existing aluminum with new aluminum to enclose all existing lead paint and dust that may be created.
- A manufacture specification for the aluminum enclosure was not provided.

Front Door Repair:

- Door will remain and will be scraped & painted to maintain old existing wood unit.
  - The front door will be cut down on the edges to remove paint and re-painted to ensure no edges will hit or cause friction or impact to cause lead dust.

[8:20 pm]  
[3:17 audio]

**ACTION**

Commissioner J. Hamilton:

I move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #21-6997 for 14935 Westwood, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines that the removal of the existing wood windows and the installation of Quaker wood windows is not appropriate according to the Secretary of the Interior's standards, however the Commission approves the issuance of a NOTICE TO PROCEED for the removal of the wood windows and installation of Quaker wood windows, in accordance with Item #1 "*The resource constitutes a hazard to the safety of the public or the occupants*".

*The Notice to Proceed is issued with the following condition:*

The dimensions, design/operation, and muntin pattern (with simulated divided-lights) will match the existing window units, and must be approved by staff.

Commissioner D. Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5                      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

Commissioner J. Hamilton:

I move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Applications #21-6997 for 14935 Westwood and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the remediation of the soffit and fascia materials is appropriate, provided that the existing aluminum material is removed and replaced with in-kind material, and therefore issues a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following condition:*

- The replacement material is reviewed and approved by staff prior to the issuance of the COA.

Commissioner A. Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5                      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

[8:30 pm]  
[3:26 audio]

- **APPLICATION NUMBER:** 21-7100

**ADDRESS:** 1080 IROQUOIS

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** INDIAN VILLAGE

**APPLICANT:** BRETT MAHAFFEY, RENEWAL BY ANDERSEN

**OWNERS:** MAUREEN KEARNS

**SCOPE OF WORK:** REPLACE ALUMINUM WINDOWS WITH RENEWAL BY ANDERSON FIBREX WINDOWS

**PROPOSAL**

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to replace all eleven (11) existing aluminum windows at the first floor and attic with

***Approved***

new Renewal by Andersen Fibrex windows per the attached drawings and application. Included in the proposal are the following scope items:

- Remove all eleven (11) existing aluminum windows at the first floor and attic in their entirety and replace with Renewal by Andersen Fibrex windows (exterior color: dark bronze).
  - All existing windows, other than the living room window at the front (west) elevation, are 1:1 slider windows. The existing living room window is a 1:1:1 slider.
  - All but four existing slider windows are proposed to be replaced with double casement windows. Three windows on the side (north) elevation are proposed to be replaced with 1:1 “glider” windows and the large living room window on the front (west) elevation is to be replaced either with a 1:1:1 glider window.
  - None of the replacement windows are proposed to have divisions to match existing light configuration.

[8:55 pm]  
[3:52 audio]

**ACTION**

Commissioner D. Miriani:

I move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #21-7100 for 1080 Iroquois, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of the existing windows WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work as submitted.

Commissioner A. Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5                      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

[8:56 pm]  
[3:54 audio]

• **APPLICATION NUMBER:** 21-7090

**ADDRESS:** 3790 STURTEVANT

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** RUSSELL WOODS-SULLIVAN

**APPLICANT:** BRETT MAHAFFEY (RENEWAL BY ANDERSON)/MILDRED CROSS (OWNER)

**SCOPE OF WORK:** REPLACE WOOD WINDOWS WITH RENEWAL BY ANDERSON FIBREX WINDOWS

**PROPOSAL**

With the current submission, the applicant is seeking the Commission’s approval to replace historic windows within two openings. Specific work items associated with this proposal include the following:

**Front Elevation/First Story**

- Remove the existing arched four-sash, double-hung, leaded glass windows; wood storm windows; wood; mullions; and wood brickmould, leaving only the rough opening
- Install four new arched, double-hung, Fibrex/Renewal by Andersen windows and trim (materiality, specs, profile details not provided). The top sash of each window

**Approved**

will feature muntins between the glass or true divided lites. The new windows will be “red rock” in color (color swatch not provided)

**Side Elevation/First Story**

- Remove the existing arched two-sash, double-hung, leaded glass windows; wood storm windows; wood mullions; and wood brickmould, leaving only the rough opening
- Install two new arched, double-hung, Fibrex/Renewal by Andersen windows and trim (materiality, specs, profile details not provided). The top sash of each window will feature muntins between the glass or true divided lites. The new windows will be “red rock” in color (color swatch not provided).

[9:10 pm]  
[4:07 audio]

**ACTION**

Commissioner A. Johnson:

I move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #21-7090 for 3790 Sturtevant, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines that the proposed work **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a **DENIAL** for the proposed work item:

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, specifically Standards:

*2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

*5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

*6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner J. Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5                      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

[9:11 pm]  
[4:09 audio]

- **APPLICATION NUMBER:** #21-7063 & #21-7064

**ADDRESS:** 19365 WARRINGTON

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** SHERWOOD FOREST

**APPLICANT:** BRETT MAHAFFEY

**PROPERTY OWNER:** JAMES HASKINS

**SCOPE OF WORK:** REPLACE STEEL CASEMENT WINDOWS AS PROPOSED

**PROPOSAL**

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission’s approval to replace (24) original steel casement windows in the home with Andersen Fibrex windows.

**Approved**

Window Replacement:

- Replace all steel casement windows with Andersen Fibrex casement windows with “grilles between glass,” in black finish, with 2” brick mould.
- The proposed windows are a composite material, with a 3-1/4” frame.
- The replacement windows for the double casements feature a 4-1/2” Mullion in between.
- The proposed operable casement windows swing out with from the side.

[9:35 pm]  
[4:33 audio]

**ACTION**

Commissioner T. Franklin:

I move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #21-7095 for 19365 Warrington, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed work **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a **DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, specifically Standard:

*6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner A. Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 4                      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

[9:39 pm]  
[4:37 audio]

• **APPLICATION NUMBER:** 21-7093

**ADDRESS:** 19605 STRATFORD

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** SHERWOOD FOREST

**APPLICANT:** PAUL MILLER, PELLA WINDOWS & DOORS

**OWNER:** KATHLEEN MCCORMICK

**SCOPE OF WORK:** REMOVE EXISTING VINYL WINDOWS AND DOOR;  
INSTALL REPLACEMENT FIBERGLASS WINDOWS AND DOOR

**PROPOSAL**

The scope of work within this application includes the replacement of all (26) vinyl windows on the house and one sliding patio door.

- Pella [Impervia](#) (fiberglass) product line
  - Window/door order shows muntin patterns, but they have been removed from the specifications (a change order immediately follows the window order)
  - Frame color: black

*Approved*

[10:12 pm]  
[5:10 audio]

**ACTION**

Commissioner J. Hamilton:

I move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #21-7093 for 19605 Stratford, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:*

- The sliding windows will be changed to double or triple casement windows (dependent on the existing division of the sliding window).
- Window #85 may remain a sliding window.
- The sunroom may retain sliding windows, to be replaced as proposed.
- Window #60 will be changed to a double casement (rather than triple casement).

Commissioner A. Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 4                      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**XIII CITY PROJECTS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING**

None

**XIV OLD BUSINESS**

None

[10:15 pm]  
[5:13 audio]

**XV NEW BUSINESS**

HDC Officer Elections

Chair K. Johnson opened the floor to nominations.

Commissioner J. Hamilton moved to nominate Katie Johnson as Chair.

Commissioner K. Johnson – Accept

Vote:

J. Hamilton – Yes

K. Johnson - Yes

A Johnson – Yes

T. Franklin - Yes

Commissioner A. Johnson moved to nominate Tiffany Franklin as Vice-Chair

Commissioner T. Franklin – Accept

Vote:

Hamilton – Yes

A Johnson – Yes

Franklin – Yes

K Johnson - Yes

[10:24 pm]  
[5:22 audio]

**XVI ADJOURNMENT**

Commissioner J. Hamilton motioned to adjourn the meeting at 10:24 pm

Commissioner T. Franklin – SUPPORT

Ayes – 4                      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**MEETING ADJOURNED**