

DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION SPECIAL MEETING

Date: 4/10/2019

**Coleman A. Young Municipal Center, 13th Floor Auditorium
Detroit, MI 48226**

Commissioner Hamilton called the meeting to order at 5:44 _____ pm.

<u>ROLL CALL</u>	ABSENT	PRESENT		ABSENT	PRESENT
Dennis Miriani, Vice Chair		X	Katie Johnson		X
James Hamilton, Chair		X	Richard Hosey		X
Alease Johnson		X			
Tiffany Franklin		X			

	ABSENT	PRESENT		ABSENT	PRESENT
<u>STAFF PRESENT</u>					
Jennifer Ross, PDD		X	Taylor Leonard, Law Dept	X	
Brendan Cagney, PDD		X	Pamela Parrish, Law Dept.	X	
Ann Phillips, PDD		X			
Garrick Landsberg, PDD		X			

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Staff requested the following changes to the agenda:
None

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved to move the following projects to the Consent Agenda:

4140 Second Avenue; 8044 Kercheval; Resolution 19-03; and 3-10-2019 Meeting Minutes Approval

Commissioner _Franklin – SUPPORT
Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

Commissioner Mirani moved to approve the agenda as revised

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT
Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT AGENDA

Commissioner _Hosey moved approve the Consent Agenda:

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT
Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

- **Address:** 100 Mack
Historic District: Brush Park
Scope Summary: Erect new building
Interested Party: David DiRita and Micheal Decoster
Public Comment: Margret England (resident) – wants signage to direct traffic while the the building is under construction

The proposed new building will be erected as follows:

The building is 138'-8" x 60'-0" and rises (12) stories with a lower two (2) story conservatory. The roof of the main building is flat, while the conservatory displays a gabled roof. At the main building, limestone clads stories 1&2, while with brick is found at stories 3-12. The texture of the brick façade is comprised of two different bond techniques. The "frame" brick uses a running bond and a bright white mortar. The "fill" brick above and to the side of the openings is set back slightly from the "frame." Further visual distinction is achieved by using an "iron" color mortar and a stacked soldier bond. The two-story podium at the rear of the conservatory is also clad with brick while the conservatory its self is composed of glass. Please note that the specs for the conservatory's wall/wood system has not been provided with the current submission. Primary access to the main building is gained via aluminum storefront entrances on the north and west elevations a flat metal canopy wraps the north and west elevations and provides shelter to the main entries. Windows are aluminum and measure 2'-8" x 6'-8" and 6'-0" x 6'-8".
 Commissioner comment:

Commissioner Comment:

Commissioner Franklin has questions re: what the specs for the wall/roof system for the conservatory. The applicant has noted that they are looking towards a curtainwall system to match what is depicted in the submitted renderings

Commsisioner Hamilton inquired if the windows will be doublepaned

Commissioner Alease Johnson inquired about parking – They will be sharing with the enarby SOMA development

Commissioner Hosey moved to **issue a Certificate of Appropriateness** for the work as proposed because it meets the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Number 9) *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

With the following conditions:

- o HDC staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the building's final signage proposal prior to the issuance of the permit for the sign

- o Staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the final construction drawings for the work prior to the issuance of the permit
- o The applicant shall provide the specs re: the wall and roof system for the proposed new conservatory **prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness**. Should staff determine that the proposal does not conform to the district’s Elements of Design and/or meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards for rehabilitation, staff shall forward the project to the commission for review at the next available meeting.
- o HDC staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve any minor revisions to the project design as long as the work meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

Commissioner Mirani – SUPPORT
 Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

- **Address:** 1 & 2 Woodward
Historic District: Detroit Financial
Scope Summary: install new street furniture
Interested Party: Maria Garzala, Tim Karl, Jhon Deruiter, Erica Hill
Public Comment: David Dirita: Doesn’t support the project

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission’s approval to install the following items within the above-defined project area as per the attached renderings:

- A “hexagonal-style” shaped grand stands – made out of wood materials (unpainted), to accommodate group and performance seating. The structure will also house needed storage for equipment required for the daily programming and operations of the space. The storage will be hidden from view and the walls on the structure will serve a community bulletin boards. This element will be designed by an architect. Image in the site plan aims to convey intent.
- Small Stage – made out of wood materials (unpainted), it will be an elevated platform to host performances. Note that the stage will be located in the portion of the plaza that is not within the district boundaries. However, it is adjacent to the district.
- Playground area – to include a swingset and metal play structure/sculpture. The soft surface surrounding the play area will be a sandy orange color, picking up from adjacent colors from the Guardian Building.
- Metal umbrellas, benches, and tables (color not specified)
- Install new wood planters (unpainted). The planters will be located on the sidewalk western sidewalk and within the roadbed area. Specific dimensions for the planters have not been specified. Also, the species of plantings/landscaping has not been highlighted in the current proposal
- Install new turf mounds
- Install a new restroom area to include two portable, screened restrooms. Note, that dimensions and specs for the porta potties, and elevation drawings, materials, and specs for the screen have not been provided with the current submittal
- The project will also include the removal of the existing landscaped median and associated

concrete curbing.

Commissioner Comment:

Commissioner Hosey emphasized that they applicant work more closely with staff for the design
Commissioner Mirani emphasized the fact that the programming should be scrutinized despite the fact that it is being referred to as “temporary”

Commissioner Franklin: Are the colors for the street furniture going to reflect colors found at the exterior of the historic buildings. She also does not like the unpainted wood of the stage. The applicant has noted that it will be stained cedar

Commissioner Hamilton noted that the materiality of the proposed elements do not reflect those found in the district. Commissioner Mirani agreed. He has a problem with the “plyground-ish” nature of the installation. He feels that the choice of materials are not appropriate. He feels that the design does not respect the buildings that surround it. Mirani, states that he feels that the playground is not appropriate, in addition to the general materiality.

Commissioner Alease Johnson recommended that the median not be removed.

Applicant withdrew their application so that they might revise it and apply for a future meeting

- **Address:** 1384 (1378) Michigan Avenue

Historic District: Corktown

Scope Summary: Erect new additions; widen window openings on side elevation; replace windows with new wood windows

Interested Party: Brian Hurtienne

Public Comment: None

- The project proposed for 1384 Michigan Ave. seeks erect two new additions to the existing Nemo’s restaurant. Located on the Northeast Corner of Michigan and Eighth Street, the business fronts the pedestrian right of way with on-site parking to the rear (north) and side (east). The current proposal offers the interior renovation of the second floor into office space, the addition of dining space along 8th street on the north side of the building, and a kitchen expansion into the parking area on the east side of the building. The dining room expansion to the north is approximately 18’ x 18’ and one story in height. The kitchen addition expands approx. 17’ x 45’ and will also be one story. The exterior of the proposed addition is designed to fit in cohesively with the existing structure. The masonry of the new addition will be common brick, painted dark green to match the existing structure. The top cap of the parapet wall will be black aluminum. The new sliding doors and man door will be black aluminum with clear glass. The new awnings proposed for the building will match the existing green and white striped awnings. Also, all existing 1/1 wood windows will be replaced with new 1/1 aluminum clad wood windows. Wood brickmould will be replicated with new aluminum trim.

Commissioner Comment:

Commissioner Mirani questioned why staff does not approve of the transom. He wants to understand why the transom is necessary. Commissioner Hamilton comments that the awnings are almost “character defining”

Commissioner Mirani moved to **issue a Certificate of Appropriateness** for the work as proposed because it meets the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, standard # 9. *New additions,*

exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment with the following conditions:

- The applicant shall submit to staff more details of the proposed west facade prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Commissioner Alease Johnson– SUPPORT
Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

- **Address:** 691 Delaware Street
Historic District: New Center
Scope Summary: Replace rear porch with new porch; replace cedar shake siding with new hardi siding
Interested Party: David White
Public Comment:

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking this board’s approval for the following scope:

- Demolition of existing rear entry porch and stairs to allow for new rear porch and stairs to match architectural details of front porch (**see attached drawings**). The landing platform and stairs of the porch will be 2x6 Trex with hidden fasteners. The side walls of the porch will be clad in lapped siding and painted to match the front porch. The roof of the new porch will include a low slope to match the front porch and be covered with brown dimensional asphalt shingles to match the roof surfaces of the existing garage and house.
- Demolition of existing concrete slab (dimensions unknown) patio to allow for a new raised terrace (1’ above grade) and brick knee wall surround (2’6” from grade). The terrace is proposed to be approximately 16’ x 21’ in size. The floor surface of the terrace will be blue stone and the brick knee walls are to be painted to match the painted brick of the house and will be topped with limestone caps. The terrace will be accessed from the south and east by two stairs.
- Replace all existing cedar shake siding at the second floor with new JamesHardie siding to match existing appearance. The siding is proposed to be painted a dark green (**see attached drawings**).
- Repaint entire house, porches, and terrace knee walls in Rookwood Sash Green (Grayish Green-- B:12), Sashes in Rookwood Red (Dark Reddish Brown--B:18), and trim in Napery (Yellowish White--C:4/C:5).

Commissioner Comment:

The applicant has indicated that he is willing to retain the existing cedar shake and repair any specific deteriorated shake with new wood shake to match existing.

Commissioner Miriani moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the painting, demolition of the existing rear porch and concrete patio and new construction of a rear porch and raised patio as proposed in application because the work as proposed meets the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation Number 9) *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and*

architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Miriani moved that the Commission deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of all existing painted cedar shake siding as proposed in application number 19-6120 because the work as proposed does not meet the following Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation:

2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be retained and preserved.* 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Katie Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

- **Address:** 2087 Vermont
Historic District: Corktown
Scope Summary: Rehabilitate building
Interested Party: James Korf

The proposer's project includes the following:

Front/East Elevation

- Retain and repair existing decorative lattice work in gable end
- At Palladian gable end/attic window, retain and repair central wood arched window; replace flanking wood windows the new wood 1/1 windows; and replace wood trim with new wood trim to match existing
- Replace front porch. Existing porch floor to be removed, floor joists replaced as required, and new 4” tongue and groove wood porch floor to be installed to match existing. Existing porch columns are to be replaced as required with identical columns. All wood fascias at porch roof perimeter to be repaired and painted, unless extent of degradation requires replacement. If replacement is required, new fascias are to match existing.
- Replace existing wood lapped siding with new lapped wood siding (4” reveal to match existing). All existing 1x 4 corner trim is to be replaced with new 1 x 4 corner trim.
- Replace existing 3”-slat wood foundation skirting with new 3”-slat wood foundation

skirting to match existing

Side Elevations

- Replace existing wood lapped siding with new lapped wood siding (4" reveal to match existing). All existing 1x4 corner trim is to be replaced with new 1x4 corner trim.
- Replace existing 3"-slat wood foundation skirting with new 3"-slat wood foundation skirting to match existing
- Replace wood windows with new 1/1 wood sash units; replace wood trim/brickmould at windows with new wood trim to match existing

Rear/West Elevation

- Erect a new partial-width, hipped-roof wood entry porch to match existing front porch in appearance. New porch columns, flooring, rails, fascias, and hipped roof is to match the repaired roof on the east elevation identically. The new rear entrance porch is a smaller version of the front porch, which is 5'-0" x 13'-6"
- Extend existing roofline at main/historic mass west to raise height on lower rear addition
- At new rear wall, include two new wood, 1/1 windows (first story); wood Palladian window and wood lattice at second-story gable end to match existing at front elevation/gable; and install wood trim/brickmould at windows with new wood trim to match existing. All fascia, corner trim, and detailing found on the original roof structure is to be installed on the new gable end and overhangs.
- Install 3"-slat wood foundation skirting with new 3"-slat wood foundation skirting to match existing at front and side elevations
- Install new lapped wood siding (4" reveal to match existing at front and side elevations)
- A new rear entrance with a new 4'-0" x 9'-0" back porch, and steps is to be installed.

Roof

- Replace existing asphalt shingle roof with new asphalt shingles (color is Georgetown Grey)
- At south elevation, install three low-profile skylights (24" x 42") Velux brand
- Replace all fascia, corner trim, and detailing

Painting

- Please see [the attached](#), which outlines the proposed color scheme. Cream color is proposed for the body, green is proposed for the trim and "picture gallery red" is proposed for the new window sash. Note, that the red color does not appear in the property's assigned [color chart B](#)

Commissioner Comment:

Commissioner Hamilton did note that there are a lot of decorative elements on the home which might be lost if they are replaced. The applicant has noted that he plans on keeping these elements.

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved to **issue a Certificate of Appropriateness** for the proposed work items because it meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation standard number 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence* with the following conditions:

- The front porch roof shall be retained and repaired
- The existing lapped wood siding shall be retained and repaired where necessary with new lapped wood siding of a dimension, texture, and reveal that matches existing
- The existing fascia and decorative bracket detailing at the front gable end shall be retained and repaired where necessary
- The existing wood panels at the front elevation bay windows be retained and repaired where necessary
- Staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the final color choice for the property

Commissioner Franklin– SUPPORT
Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

- **Address:** 47 E. Adams
Historic District: Grand Circus Park and Woomen’s Exchange Building HD
Scope Summary: Install a new signage and storefront
Interested Party: Frank Fraga and Kay Stefanski

The proposed project includes the two elements: the replacement of the **existing 1-story, storefront in total** with a new storefront and the replacement of **three existing signs** with three new signs. Specifically, the proposal includes the following:

Storefront

- Remove the existing non-historic windows, doors, stone cladding/storefront at the first story
- Install a new storefront at the first story, below the existing canopy. The new storefront shall include a sillwall/kneewall that is clad with a modular brick (color “Spice White”); a cast stone sill; aluminum panel cladding at the wall; folding aluminum windows; a set of paired aluminum doors with an aluminum transom; and a single aluminum door with sidelight and transom
- Retain, extend and repair the existing canopy

Signage

- Replace the existing sign at the front elevation with a new larger 54'x172 ¾' sign which includes neon channel letters on raceway with internally-illuminated "Dancing Girl" cloud icon sign
 - o letters are painted red inside and out
 - o Contour Neon stroke in red
 - o clear acrylic faces with red trim
 - o "Dancing Girl" icon has white acrylic face, painted blue as shown with cut vinyl graphics applied
 - o raceway(s) painted Sw6046 Swing Brown
 - o "A LIVE MUSIC JOINT" has white acrylic face with black trim and return & black opaque vinyl overlay

- Replace the existing 24"x10' sign at the rear elevation with a new larger 16'-2 ½" x 19.5" sign which includes marquee channel letters on backer with LED S14 bulbs
 - o letters are painted black inside and out
 - o backer painted a Sw6348 Reynard to blend with the brick facade
 - o installation centered on wall as shown

- Replace the existing 15'x8' sign at the side/east elevation with a new larger 31'-7 1/4" x 8'-1 ¾" sign which includes marquee channel letters on backer with LED S14 bulbs and neon channel letters on raceway with internally-illuminated "Dancing Girl" cloud icon sign
 - o letters are painted black inside and out
 - o backer painted a Sw6348 Reynard to blend with the brick facade
 - o installation centered on wall as shown
 - o letters are painted red inside and out
 - o Contour Neon stroke in red
 - o clear acrylic faces with red trim
 - o "Dancing Girl" icon has white acrylic face, painted blue as shown with cut vinyl graphics applied
 - o raceway(s) painted Sw6046 Swing Brown

Commissioner Comment:

Comissioner Miriani found that the proposed signage for the front and rear do appear out of scale for the building. He is fine with the signage at the rear. Commissioner Hamilton feel that the sign at the front crowds the windows. Commissioner Katie Johnson does not approve of thre materiality and the lighting of the signage.

On the front: The signage can be halor lit or externally lit

East side: signage remains as is in material, but that the entire sign be 4 windows wide and shuken in height. The sign should also be centered

On the rear, the signage remains the same

Commissioner Miriani moved to issue oa Certificate of Appropriateness for the new signage as because it meets the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, standard # 9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials*

that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment with the following conditions:

- On the front: The signage can be halo lit or externally lit
- East side: signage remains as is in material, but that the entire sign be 4 windows wide and shrunken in height. The sign should also be centered over the central 4 windows
- On the rear, the signage remains the same as per the proposal
- That staff be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the final proposal

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6

Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Miriani moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new storefront as proposed because it meets the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, standard # 9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment, with the following conditions:*

- Staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the final project construction drawings, to include any minor revisions, prior to the issuance of the permit.

Commissioner Frankin – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6

Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

- **Address: 15414 Piedmont**
Historic District: Rosedale Park HD
Scope Summary: Install solar panels
Interested Party: None

The proposed project includes the addition of new rooftop solar panels would be installed using a “Low Profile Quickbolt” system that fastens the panels to the rafters through the roof shingles. Specifically, the work includes the following:

Addition of (2) solar panel arrays on the primary façade roof surface of the home

- o (5) Solar panels on the west face of the central gable
- o (4) Solar panels on the south face of the westward projecting gable (garage)

Addition of (2) solar panel arrays on the rear façade roof surface of the home

- o (8) Solar panels on the east face of the central gable
- o (3) Solar panels on the south face of the eastward projecting gable (rear)

Commissioner Comment:

None

Commissioner Franklin moved to deny the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed does not comply with the Elements of Design for the district nor is it keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation standard number 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

Commissioner – Hosey SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

- **Address: 36 Edison**
Historic District: Boston Edison
Scope Summary: Replace clay tile roof with new asphalt shingles
Interested Party: Gerald Dixon

Replace the existing clay tile roof with new asphalt shingles, color magenta red

Commissioer Comment:

Staff did note that Detroit Cornice and Slate assessed the roof and noted that the roof has totally failed.

Commissioner Miriani moved to issue of a Notice to Proceed for the project as proposed because it meets the following condition:

- (4) Retention of the resource would not be in the interest of the majority of the community.

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATIONS FOR WORK INITIATED/COMPLETED WITHOUT HDC APPROVAL NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

- **Address:** 709 Chicago
Historic District: Boston Edison
Scope Summary: New windows (work completd)
Interested Party: Chris Smits

The work includes the replacement of existing historic wood windows the new vinyl windows. This work was completed without permit and/or HDC approval

Commissioner Miriani moved to issue a Notice to Proceed to retain the vinyl windows which were installed without approval at the the sunporch and rear elevation because the work meets the following condition:

- (4) Retention of the resource would not be in the interest of the majority of the community.

Commissioner Miriani further moved that the current correction order be extended an additional 6 month from the date of this meeting (October 2019)

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT
Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

OLD BUSINESS

- **Address:** 655 W. Willis
Historic District: Willis Selden
Scope Summary: Revision to approved design re: the color of the siding (grey) and the type of siding (corrugated metal and standing seam metal)
Interested Party: Lars Grabener

COMMISSIONER HOSEY RECUSED HIMSELF DUE TO AS CONFLICT OF INTEREST

Commissioner Miriani noted that he felt that the proposed siding is not appropriate within the neighborhood. Commissioner Katie Johnson disagreed she is comfortable with the color and design.

Commissioner Katie Johnson motioned to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed because it meets with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, standard # 9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment,* with the following condition:

- Staff be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the final CDs before the permit is pulled for the work
- Staff be afforded the opportunity to review and approve any minor revisions to the design. If staff feels that any revisions will substantively alter the design approved by the Commission, staff shall forward the work to the Commission for review at the next available meeting.

Commissioner – Aleese Johnson SUPPORT
Ayes – 3 Nay – 2

MOTION CARRIED

NEW BUSINESS

- **Address:** 7891 & 7903 E. Jefferson
Historic District: ADJACENT TO West Village
Scope Summary: New development/erect new buildings rehab existing historic buildings
Interested Party: Bryan Cook and John Heiss

Commissioner Katie Johnson motioned to approve the letter to the Mayor and City Council that the proposed development will have a benefecital effect on the adjacent West Village Historic District

Commissioner – Franklin SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Moriani motioned to adjourn the meeting at 9:14 pm

Commissioner Hamilton– SUPPORT

Ayes - 6 Nay - 0

MOTION CARRIED

MEETING ADJOURNED